VOLUME 38 ISSUE 1 JANUARY 2023

# Journal of LAW and RELIGION



## Journal of LAW and RELIGION

The Journal of Law and Religion publishes cutting-edge interdisciplinary, interreligious, and international research on critical issues of law and religion.

#### **Co-Editors**

Silas W. Allard, Visiting Assistant Professor of Practice in Law and Senior Fellow in the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University, USA

Michael J. Broyde, Professor of Law and Harold J. Berman Projects Director in the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University, USA

Joseph E. David, Associate Professor of Law, Sapir Academic College, Israel

Donald R. Davis Jr., Professor and Chair of Asian Studies, University of Texas at Austin, USA

Rafael Domingo, Spruill Family Professor of Law and Religion, Emory University, USA, and Alvaro d'Ors Professor of Law, University of Navarra, Spain

Farid Esack, Professor in the Study of Islam, University of Johannesburg, South Africa

M. Christian Green, Senior Fellow in the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University, USA M. Cathleen Kaveny, Darald and Juliet Libby Professor of Law and Theology, Boston College, USA

Mirjam Künkler, Fellow, Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study, The Netherlands

Linda C. McClain, Robert Kent Professor of Law, Boston University, USA

Mark L. Movsesian, Frederick A. Whitney Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Center for Law and Religion, St. John's University, USA

Jaclyn L. Neo, Associate Professor of Law and Director of the Centre for Asian Legal Studies, National University of Singapore, Singapore

Mona Siddiqui, Professor of Islamic and Interreligious Studies, University of Edinburgh, UK

Brent A. Strawn, Professor of Old Testament and Professor of Law, Duke University, USA

John Witte Jr., Robert W. Woodruff Professor of Law, McDonald Distinguished Professor, and Director of the Center for the Study of Law and Religion, Emory University, USA

#### **Content Editors**

Managing Editor Silas W. Allard

Special Content Editor

M. Christian Green

Senior Editor Gary S. Hauk

**Student Editing Staff** 

Chief of Staff Aaren Lasky

**Assistant Managing Editors** 

Joshua Brennan Tyler Lavender Rebecca Rigas Mordechai Sahler Sydnie Zachary

**Staff Members** 

Gretchen Boyles Jessica Bunnell Mahiva Patel Michael Reed-Price Robert Schmidt Dylan Storey Andrew Sykes MacKinnon Westraad

Special thanks to our supportive colleagues at Cambridge University Press: Emily Redican-Bradford, Associate Publisher; Evgenia Loik, Content Manager; Ellen Wert, Copyeditor; and Jen Malat, Marketing Portfolio Lead

### International Advisory Board

Frank S. Alexander Emory University USA

Paul T. Babie University of Adelaide Australia

Deborah J. Cantrell University of Colorado USA

Ana María Celis Brunet Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile Chile

Joseph Chan University of Hong Kong Hong Kong

> Paula M. Cooey Macalester College USA

Perry Dane Rutgers University USA

Norman Doe Cardiff University UK

Thomas Duve Max Planck Institute for Legal History and Legal Theory Germany

> Anver M. Emon University of Toronto Canada

Rebecca R. French State University of New York USA

Edward McGlynn Gaffney Jr. Valparaiso University USA

Richard W. Garnett University of Notre Dame USA

Emily Albrink Hartigan St. Mary's University USA R. H. Helmholz University of Chicago USA

Olga Kazmina Moscow State University Russian Federation

Michael Kessler Georgetown University USA

> Samuel J. Levine Touro Law Center USA

Tim Lindsey University of Melbourne Australia

David Little Georgetown University USA

Adrian Loretan University of Lucerne Switzerland

Robin W. Lovin Southern Methodist University USA

John McGuckin Union Theological Seminary Columbia University USA

> Nancy Miller-Herron Herron Law USA

Ebrahim Moosa University of Notre Dame USA

David Novak University of Toronto Canada

Michiaki Okuyama Toyo Eiwa University Japan

Fernanda Pirie University of Oxford UK Thomas W. Porter Jr.
Boston University
USA

Jean Porter University of Notre Dame USA

Asifa Quraishi-Landes University of Wisconsin USA

Gideon Sapir Bar-Ilan University Israel

Suwanna Satha-Anand Chulalongkorn University Thailand

Prakash Shah Queen Mary University of London UK

Steven D. Smith University of San Diego USA

Suzanne Last Stone Yeshiva University USA

Kyriaki Topidi European Centre for Minority Issues Germany

Darryl M. Trimiew Georgia Christian College USA

Amelia J. Uelmen Georgetown University

C. Leon van de Broeke VU University The Netherlands

Michael Welker University of Heidelberg Germany

Fenggang Yang
Purdue University
USA

# Journal of LAW and RELIGION

VOLUME 38 | ISSUE 1 | 2023

#### **CONTENTS**

#### **EDITORIAL**

"Do Not Ever Refer to My Lord Jesus Christ with Pronouns": Considering Controversies over Religiously Motivated Discrimination on the Basis of Gender Identity Linda C. McClain

#### RESEARCH ARTICLE

10 Gender Identity Discrimination and Religious Freedom Patrick Parkinson

#### **ESSAYS**

38 The Limits of Defining Identity in Religion-Gender Conflicts: A Response to Patrick Parkinson

Laura Portuondo and Claudia E. Haupt

46 Gender Inequality and Biological Supremacy: A Sex Equality Analysis of Patrick Parkinson's "Neutral" Proposal Shannon Gilreath

#### RESEARCH ARTICLES

55 Bishops and Friends: History and Legal Interpretation in Recent Amicus Curiae Briefs before the Supreme Court Maria E. Doerfler

81 Citizenship, Identity, and Veiling: Interrogating the Limits of Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights in Cases Involving the Religious Dress of Muslim Women Róisín Áine Costello and Sahar Ahmed

### BOOK REVIEW SYMPOSIUM: JOHN WITTE, JR.: THE PAST, PRESENT AND FUTURE OF A LAW AND RELIGION TRAILBLAZER

- 108 A Magnum Opus Michael Welker
- Religious Liberty and Human Rights: Their Origin, Their Development in the Anglo-American Legal Tradition, and Why They Are Still Needed Ian Leigh
- 126 American Religious Liberty without (Much) Theory Nathan S. Chapman
- Religion and the Justification of Rights

  David Little
- The Spirit of Christianity and Law Rafael Domingo

#### **BOOK REVIEWS**

- 168 Review of The Profession of Ecclesiastical Lawyers: An Historical Introduction Stephen Coleman
- 170 Review of Setting the Table: An Introduction to the Jurisprudence of Rabbi Yechiel Mikhel Epstein's Arukh Hashulhan Levi Cooper
- 176 Review of The End of Law? Law, Theology, and Neuroscience Kevin P. Lee
- 180 Review of A Nation of Immigrants: Sojourners in Biblical Israel's Tradition and Law Safwat Marzouk