

Nineteenth-Century Music *Review*



Volume 9 • Issue 2 • December 2012

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER, *Louisiana State University
School of Music, USA*

BLAKE HOWE, *Louisiana State University, USA*

MANUELA SCHWARTZ (Recording Review Co-Editor)
Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

JAMES WILLIAM SOBASKIE (Book Review Editor)
Mississippi State University, USA

R. LARRY TODD (Score Review Editor)
Duke University, USA

WILLIAM WEBER, *California State University,
Long Beach, USA*

PHYLLIS WELIVER, *Saint Louis University, USA*

Advisory Board

ROSAMUND BARTLETT

King's College, London, UK

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN

University of Chicago, USA

ANDREW BOWIE

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

ANNA CELENZA

Georgetown University, USA

GEOFFREY CHEW

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

NICHOLAS COOK

University of Cambridge, UK

JOHN DEATHRIDGE

King's College, University of London, UK

JAMES DEAVILLE

Carleton University, Canada

JEREMY DIBBLE

Durham University, UK

STEPHEN DOWNES

University of Surrey, UK

KATHARINE ELLIS

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

ANNEGRET FAUSER

University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

PETER FRANKLIN

University of Oxford, UK

SOPHIE FULLER

Trinity College of Music, UK

LYDIA GOEHR

Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY

Stanford University, USA

JULIAN HORTON

University College Dublin, Ireland

LINDA HUTCHEON

University of Toronto, Canada

HERVÉ LACOMBE

Université Rennes 2 - Haute Bretagne, France

RALPH LOCKE

Eastman School of Music, USA

ROBERTA MARVIN

University of Iowa, USA

SIMON McVEIGH

Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

JULIAN RUSHTON

University of Leeds, UK

JIM SAMSON

Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

MARY ANN SMART

University of California, Berkeley, USA

NICHOLAS TEMPERLEY

University of Illinois, USA

SUSAN WOLLENBERG

University of Oxford, UK

SUSAN YOUENS

University of Notre Dame, USA

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published twice a year in June and December. Two parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 9 (2012), which includes print and electronic access, is £120 net (US\$192 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £30 net (US\$50 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £60 (US\$90 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, New York 10994-2133, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2012. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use*, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Journals Online service which can be found at journals.cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2012

Contents

VOLUME 9, ISSUE 2

Notes on Article Contributors 175

ARTICLES

George Kennaway
Haydn's (?) Cello Concertos, 1860–1930: Editions, Performances,
Reception 177

Emily Kilpatrick
Moot point: Editing Poetry and Punctuation in Fauré's Early Songs 213

Howard Irving
Empiricism, Ideology and William Crotch's *Specimens* 237

Erin Johnson-Hill
Miscellany and Collegiality in the British Periodical Press: The
Harmonicon (1823–1833) 255

Benedict Taylor
Sullivan, Scott and *Ivanhoe*: Constructing Historical Time and National
Identity in Victorian Opera 295

REVIEWS

Book Reviews

Nicholas Clapton
Ermafrodite armoniche by Marco Beghelli and Raffaele Talmelli. 323

Nathalie Hérold
Musique–Images–Instruments N° 11 : *Le pianoforte en France 1780–1820*
edited by Florence Gétreau 326

Jann Pasler
Art and Ideology in European Opera: Essays in Honour of Julian Rushton
edited by Rachel Cowgill, David Cooper and Clive Brown 331

William Marvin
Il Trittico, Turandot, and Puccini's Late Style by Andrew Davis 336

- Nicole Grimes
Johannes Brahms: 'Free But Alone': A Life for a Poetic Music, by
 Constantin Floros, translated by Ernest Bernhard Kabisch 340
- Christian Thomas Leitmeir
The Cambridge Companion to Richard Strauss edited by Charles
 Youmans 346
- Books Received 351
- CD Reviews*
- Philip Ross Bullock 353
From the Shores of a Distant Homeland: Russian Song Recorded
 Russian Songs: Mussorgsky, Cui, Rimsky-Korsakov, Balakirev,
 Borodin. Mikhail Svetlov bass. Pavlina Dokovska pf. Naxos 8.572218
 (1 CD: DDD: 56 minutes). Notes included.
 Mikhail Kuzmin: Alexandrian Songs, Sacred Verses. Mila Shkirtil
 mezzo-soprano. Yuri Serov pf. Northern Flowers NFPMA 9993 (1 CD:
 DDD: 60 minutes). Notes and translations included.
 Sonetti Romani: Viacheslav Ivanov in music of Myaskovsky, Lourié,
 Shebalin, Gretchaninov. Mila Shkirtil mezzo-soprano. Yuri Serov pf.
 Northern Flowers NFPMA 99103 (1 CD: DDD: 54 minutes). Notes and
 translations included.
- CDs Received 363
- DVD Reviews*
- Cormac Newark 365
Night of the seven stars?
Productions of Giacomo Meyerbeer's Les Huguenots on DVD
Die Hugenotten (Deutsche Oper production released on DVD in 2001)
 Stage director: John Dew
 Set and costume designer: Gottfried Pilz
 Performing edition: John Dew
 German translation: Ignatz Franz Castelli (1837)
 Cast: Angela Denning (Margarethe von Valois), Lucy Peacock
 (Valentine), Richard Leech (Raoul von Nangis), Hartmut Welker
 (Graf von Saint-Bris), Camille Capasso (Urban), Martin Blasius
 (Marcel), Lenus Carlson (Graf von Nevers)
 Chorus and Orchestra of the Deutsche Oper Berlin
 Conductor: Stefan Soltesz
 Chorus master: Georg Metz
 Director for television: Brian Large
 ArtHaus DVD 100156 PAL/100157 NTSC: arthaus-musik.com

Les Huguenots (Opera Australia production released on DVD in 2002)

Stage director: Lotfi Mansouri

Set designer: John Stoddart

Costume designer: Michael Stennett

Lighting designer: Derek Coutts

Choreographer: Lois Strike

Cast: Joan Sutherland (Marguerite de Valois), Anson Austin (Raoul de Nangis), Amanda Thane (Valentine), Clifford Grant (Marcel), Suzanne Johnston (Urbain), John Pringle (Comte de Nevers), John Wegner (Comte de Saint Bris)

Conductor: Richard Bonyngne

Director for television: Virginia Lumsden

Kultur DVD D0029: www.kultur.com

Thomas Betzwieser

Wagner at the Bayreuth Festival

373

Richard Wagner: *Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg*, Live-Mitschnitt aus dem Bayreuther Festspielhaus 2008.

Inszenierung: Katharina Wagner, Chor und Orchester der Bayreuther Festspiele,

Musikalische Leitung: Sebastian Weigle

(Berlin: United Motion, 2008)

Richard Wagner für Kinder: *Der Ring des Nibelungen*, Live-Mitschnitt von der Probebühne IV der Bayreuther Festspiele 2011;

Brandenburgisches Staatsorchester Frankfurt (Oder),

Musikalische Leitung: Hartmut Keil, Inszenierung: Maximilian von Mayenburg

(Bayreuth: BF Medien, 2011)

Score Reviews

Alexander Bonus

Johann Nepomuk Hummel: *Trumpet Concert in E major*, piano reduction and parts, edited by Michael Kube

379

Johann Nepomuk Hummel: *Concerto for Trumpet and Orchestra in E major* (Partitur Nr. 15119), and *Version in E flat Major* (Partitur 15118), edited by Michael Kube

Kirsten Rutschman

Selected Songs of the Munich School 1870–1920: Lieder for Soprano Voice and Piano edited by Robert W. Wason and Valerie Errante

387

Katharina Uhde

Johannes Brahms: *Concerto in D major for Violin and Orchestra, Op. 77* 390
edited by Clive BrownPjotr Iljitsch Tschaikowsky: *Violin Concerto in D major, Op. 35* edited by
Ernst Herttrich

Scores Received

395