

LANDMARKS: A COLLECTION OF ESSAYS ON THE RUSSIAN INTELLIGENTSIA, 1909: BERDYAEV, BULGAKOV, GERSHENZON, IZGOEV, KISTYAKOVSKY, STRUVE, FRANK. Edited by *Boris Shragin* and *Albert Todd*. Translated by *Marian Schwartz*. New York: Karz Howard (200 East 84th Street, New York, N.Y. 10028), 1977. lx, 210 pp. \$12.75.

Because of the seminal character of the contributions to *Vekhi* and their impact on Russian intellectual life and political thought since their appearance in 1909, the publication of an English translation in book form should be a source of gratification. As there can be no question of even a summary discussion of *Vekhi* (which would require a full-length essay), I will restrict myself to a few formal observations concerning this particular edition.

This is not the first appearance of *Vekhi* in English; all articles have appeared in installments in *Canadian-American Slavic Studies*, 2-4 (Summer 1968-Summer 1970), in a thoughtful and annotated translation by Professors Marshall Shatz and Judith Zimmerman. It is puzzling that no reference is made to this earlier translation, though a few lines from its introduction are quoted on the dust jacket! Personally, I find the earlier translation better, more accurate and fluent than that of Marian Schwartz which is clumsy and bespeaks little knowledge of the historical context. *Vekhi* cannot be properly understood by the contemporary Western reader without some annotation and introduction. The edition under review does have at the end a glossary of terms and names, as well as brief biographical sketches of the contributors. The glossary is helpful but not completely reliable or satisfactory. There are two introductions. The first by a certain R. Khazarnufsky verges on the scandalous: confused, unfocused, in dreadful English—it is hard to figure out to whom or for what it can be of help. The second, by Boris Shragin (one of the authors of *Samosoznanie*) purports to put *Vekhi* in meaningful focus for today's reader; but it fails to do so by assuming too much background knowledge and by not specifying the areas and ways in which *Vekhi*'s seminal role may be of relevance to Soviet dissidents and instructive to Western readers. All in all, in my opinion, the appearance of this English edition of *Vekhi* is rather unfortunate, since it probably precludes the planned publication of Professors Shatz and Zimmerman's better translation with more pertinent introduction and commentary.

MARC RAEFF
Columbia University

STALINISM: ESSAYS IN HISTORICAL INTERPRETATION. Edited by *Robert C. Tucker*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1977. xx, 332 pp. \$19.95.

What was Stalinism, and what were its causes? What was its relationship with Leninism, with Marxism, with the traditional Russian political culture? Such questions as these are of great interest to anyone concerned with twentieth-century Russia or with socialism. It is therefore a pleasure to welcome the appearance of this symposium. It contains a number of exceedingly valuable papers, which must figure in any bibliography of essential reading on the subject. There are thirteen contributors. As in any symposium, some papers are more distinguished than others, but the general standard is high.

Robert Tucker himself not only wrote an introduction and "some conclusions for a scholarly agenda," but also an intellectually challenging paper, "Stalinism as Revolution from Above," in which he stresses, more than any other contributor, the traditional Russian despotic elements. He naturally does not deny the importance of economic and social factors, but emphasizes that the way problems were perceived, and the solutions thought to be feasible, were influenced by historical-political culture,