

VOLUME 11
NUMBER 3
SEPTEMBER 1988

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Event-related potentials and cognition: A critique of the context updating hypothesis and an alternative interpretation of P3

Rolf Verleger

Is the P300 component a manifestation of context updating?

Emanuel Donchin & Michael G. H. Coles

Feedforward versus feedbackward: An ethological alternative to the law of effect R. Allen Gardner & Beatrix T. Gardner

Précis of *The Intentional Stance* Daniel C. Dennett

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Evolution and ontogeny of neural circuits" (Ebbesson)

"Evolving concepts of sleep cycle generation: From brain centers to neuronal populations" (Hobson, Lydic & Baghdoyan)

"Relationships between the superior colliculus and hippocampus: Neural and behavioral considerations" (Foreman & Stevens)

"How brains make chaos in order to make sense of the world"
(Skarda & Freeman)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

ISSN 0140-525X

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor

Chooi-Yeok Kuan

Copy Editor (Chief)

Avis Kniffen

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge
Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Birbeck College, London

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/Harvard

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 11 (1988) is US \$147.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£89.00 in the U.K.; £96.00 in the rest of the world) for institutions; US \$63.00 net (£41.00) for individuals; US \$36.00 net (£25.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$36.00 net (£25.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$41.00 net (£25.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 11:3 September 1988

Verleger, R. Event-related potentials and cognition: A critique of the context updating hypothesis and an alternative interpretation of P3	343
---	------------

Donchin, E. & Coles, M. G. H. Is the P300 component a manifestation of context updating?	357
---	------------

Open Peer Commentary

Aleksandrov, I. O. & Maksimova, N. E. P300 and the validity of psychophysiological descriptions of behavior	374	Kok, A. Probability mismatch and template mismatch: A paradox in P300 amplitude?	388
Birbaumer, N. & Elbert, T. P3: Byproduct of a byproduct	375	Markowitsch, H. J. Problems with brain origins	389
Brandeis, D. & Callaway, E. While on the subject of closure . . .	377	Rabbitt, P. Has the P300 been cost effective?	390
Chapman, R. M. Dual thrust in interpreting P3 and memory	377	Rösler, F. The P300 event-related potentials: A one-humped dromedary's saddle on a two-humped camel	392
Deecke, L. & Lang, W. P300 as the resolution of negative cortical DC shifts	379	Roth, W. T. & Ford, J. M. P3 and (de)activation	393
Donald, M. W. Updating the context of ERP research	381	Rugg, M. D. Event-related potentials and psychological explanation	394
Friedman, D. ERPs and memory: P300 as well as other components are functionally implicated	382	Sanders, A. F. & Collet, W. Neither context updating nor context closure corresponds closely to human performance concepts	395
Halgren, E. The P3: A view from the brain	383	Scholz, R. W. Variants of expectancy and subjective probability in P300 research	396
Hampson, R. E. & Deadwyler, S. A. Reflections on closure and context, with a note on the hippocampus	385	Verbaten, M. N. Novelty and the P3	398
Jones, G. V. Event-related potentials and memory retrieval	386		
Jones, M. R. What does expectancy mean?	387		

Author's Response

Verleger, R. From epistemology to P3-ology	399
Donchin, E. & Coles, M. G. H. On the conceptual foundations of cognitive psychophysiology	408

Gardner, R. A. & Gardner, B. T. Feedforward versus feedbackward: An ethological alternative to the law of effect	429
---	------------

Open Peer Commentary

Andrew, R. J. Contiguity, contingency, and causation	447	Nelson, K. Chimp communication without conditioning	461
Baum, W. M. Selection by consequences is a good idea	447	Odling-Smee, F. J. & Plotkin, H. C. Gardners teach Washoe: Feedforward? Washoe teaches Gardners: Feedback?	462
Bechtel, W. & Abrahamsen, A. Learning, reward, and cognitive differences	448	Reid, R. L. Where are the limits to operant psychology?	463
Bolles, R. C. The bathwater and everything	449	Russell, W. M. S. Ethology, conditioning, and learning	464
Catania, A. C. & Shimoff, E. Why contingencies won't go away	450	Sevenster, P. Arbitrary effect of consequences yet indispensable?	465
Church, R. M. Yoked control designs for assessment of contingency	451	Shettleworth, S. J. Constraints on learning or laws of performance?	465
Dickinson, A. & Mackintosh, N. J. Exorcizing Watson's ghost	452	Skinner, B. F. Signs and countersigns	466
Dinsmoor, J. A. The yoked control design is not the only test for reinforcement	453	Staddon, J. E. R. On the process of reinforcement	467
Dyer, A. B. The neglected developmental dimension of "obligatory" behavior	454	Stewart, J. & Rochford, J. Behavior change without a theory of learning?	469
Fantino, E. Guthrie revisited: For better and worse	455	Thomas, D. R. The law of effect: Contiguity or contiguity	470
Graham, C. Truth about consequences	455	Thompson, C. R. The law of obligation is insufficient	471
Hineline, P. N. Feeding, forward and backward: Mostly red herrings	456	Timberlake, W. Feedforward and feedback processes in learning: The importance of appetitive structure	472
Iversen, I. H. How to change behavior?	457	Toates, F. Feedforward <i>and</i> (not versus) feedbackward	474
Johnston, T. D. & Sharp, J. A. Misrepresenting the law of effect and ethology as its alternative	458	Tomasello, M. & Snow, C. E. Well-fed organisms still need feedback	475
Lea, S. E. G. & Midgley, M. Learning as a constraint on obligatory responding	459	Tomie, A. Contingency: Effects of symmetry of choice responses	476
Lieberman, P. Language, evolution, and learning	459		
Marken, R. S. The ethology of purpose	460		

Wasserman, E. A. Response bias in the yoked control procedure	477
Whitehurst, G. J. & Fischel, J. E. Feedback in the acquisition of language and other complex behavior	478

Authors' Response	
Gardner, R. A. & Gardner, B. T. Truth or consequences	479

Dennett, D. C. Précis of *The Intentional Stance* 495

Open Peer Commentary

Amundson, R. Logical adaptationism	505
Cheney, D. & Seyfarth, R. Another "Just So" story: How the leopard-guarders spot	506
Churchland, P. M. The ontological status of intentional states: Nailing folk psychology to its perch	507
Cussins, A. Dennett's realisation theory of the relation between folk and scientific psychology	508
Danto, A. C. The notional world of D. C. Dennett	509
Dretske, F. The stance stance	511
Dummett, M. Dennett on belief	512
Goldman, A. I. Derived intentionality?	514
Griffin, D. R. Real intentions?	514
Harman, G. What is the intentional stance?	515
Kirsh, D. Competence models are causal	515
Kitcher, P. & Kitcher, P. The devil, the details, and Dr. Dennett	517
Lycan, W. G. Dennett's instrumentalism	518
MacLennan, B. J. Causes and intentions	519

Newell, A. The intentional stance and the knowledge level	520
Premack, D. Intentionality: How to tell Mae West from a crocodile	522
Roitblat, H. L. How to build a mind	525
Rosenberg, A. Will the argument for <i>abstracta</i> please stand up?	526
Searle, J. R. The realistic stance	527
Sloman, A. Why philosophers should be designers	529
Smith, M. P. Styles of computational representation	530
Stich, S. P. Connectionism, Realism, and realism	531
Taylor, C. What really matters	532
Van Kleeck, M. H. Intentional system theory and experimental psychology	533

Editorial Commentary 534

Author's Response	
Dennett, D. C. Science, philosophy, and interpretation	535

Continuing Commentary

On Ebbesson, S. O. E. (1984) Evolution and ontogeny of neural circuits. BBS 7:321–66. 547

Johnson, M. Parcellation and plasticity: Implications for ontogeny	547
--	-----

Author's Response	
Ebbesson, S. O. E. Ontogenetic parcellation: Dual processes	548

On Hobson, J. A., Lydic, R. & Baghdoyan, H. A. (1986) Evolving concepts of sleep cycle generation: From brain centers to neuronal populations. BBS 9:371–448. 549

Corner, M. A. The reciprocal interaction theory of sleep rhythmicity—truly expanding or just fading away?	549
---	-----

Morgane, P. J. Extended cholinergic sleep systems: Not so new—they do go back to 1962, 1963!	550
--	-----

On Foreman, N. & Stevens, R. (1987) Relationships between the superior colliculus and hippocampus: Neural and behavioral considerations. BBS 10:101–51. 552

Thinus-Blanc, C. Exploration and Memory	552
---	-----

Authors' Response	
Foreman, N. & Stevens, R. Memory—we had not forgotten	554

On Skarda, C. A. & Freeman, W. J. (1987) How brains make chaos in order to make sense of the world. BBS 10:161–95. 557

Stowell, H. How might brains work?	558
------------------------------------	-----

Authors' Response	
Skarda, C. A. Research options and the "creativity" of chaos	558
Freeman, W. J. Too soon for time and consciousness	559