



THE JOURNAL  
OF THE GILDED  
AGE AND  
PROGRESSIVE ERA

# THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

Volume 14 • Number 3 • July 2015

<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537781415000018> Published online by Cambridge University Press

## HISTORIOGRAPHICAL INTERVENTIONS

Reflections on Aileen Kraditor's Legacy: Fifty Years of Woman Suffrage Historiography, 1965–2014  
*Louise M. Newman*

## ESSAYS

Imperial Openings: Civilization, Exemption, and the Geopolitics of Mobility in the History of Chinese Exclusion, 1868–1910  
*Paul A. Kramer*

A Church Divided: Roman Catholicism, Americanization, and the Spanish-American War  
*Benjamin Wetzel*

Transformation in the Tabernacle: Billy Sunday's Converts and Emotional Experience in the Progressive Era  
*Jeremy C. Young*

## TEACHING FORUM: PEDAGOGY AND CONTROVERSY IN THE NEW ADVANCED PLACEMENT U.S. HISTORY FRAMEWORK

### Introduction

*Robert D. Johnston*

Teaching and Thinking about the Gilded Age and Progressive Era in the Redesigned AP U.S. History Course  
*Lawrence Charap*

An Appeal for Sanity: A Real-World Look at the Purpose, Strengths, and Weaknesses of the 2014 AP U.S. History Framework  
*Jeremy A. Stern*

Adapting to the Redesigned AP U.S. History Course  
*Brenda Santos*

A Reflection on Teaching a Redesigned APUSH Class  
*Saul Strausman*

Reviving the Excitement in Advanced Placement U.S. History  
*Mary Lopez*

In Search of "College-Level Teaching"  
*Jonathan Zimmerman*

The Kids Are (Going to Be) Alright  
*Lendol Calder*

## PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

*Richard L. McCormick*

## FILM REVIEW

## BOOK REVIEWS

Published by the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era  
[www.jgape.org](http://www.jgape.org)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Additional sponsors: Illinois State University, the University of Illinois at Chicago,  
Loyola University Chicago, and Duquesne University

**Editors:** Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois at Chicago;  
Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago  
**Book Review Editor:** Elaine Frantz Parsons, Duquesne University  
**Editorial Assistant:** Timothy Herbert  
**Online Editor:** Christopher McKnight Nichols, Oregon State University  
**Founding Editor, 2000–2003:** Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University  
**Editor, 2004–2014:** Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University

### Editorial Board

|  |   |
|--|---|
| Manfred Berg<br>University of Heidelberg   | Jennifer Koslow<br>Florida State University           |
| Cornelius Bynum<br>Purdue University       | Michele Mitchell<br>New York University               |
| Kornel Chang<br>Rutgers University–Newark  | Julia Ott<br>The New School                           |
| Lynn Dumenil<br>Occidental College         | Douglas Seefeldt<br>Ball State University             |
| Beverly Gage<br>Yale University            | Sherry Smith<br>Southern Methodist University         |
| Cristina Groeger<br>Harvard University     | Laura Westhoff<br>University of Missouri, St. Louis   |
| Melanie Gustafson<br>University of Vermont | Robert Wooster<br>Texas A&M University–Corpus Christi |
| Steven Hahn<br>University of Pennsylvania  |   |

Patrick McGinty, *ex officio*  
Cambridge University Press

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *America: History and Life*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Scopus*, and in the Thompson Reuters *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Arts & Humanities Citation Index*, and *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, [www.jstor.org](http://www.jstor.org), with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact [alwood@ilstu.edu](mailto:alwood@ilstu.edu) or go to <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga>

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 14, 2015, are \$175.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £106.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$130.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £80.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is \$50.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £31.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is \$80.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is \$20.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$500.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Single part: \$48.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £29.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org/>.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: [psc@periodicals.com](mailto:psc@periodicals.com)

Manuscripts should be submitted electronically in MS Word or RTF format to the co-editor, Robert D. Johnston, at [jgape@uic.edu](mailto:jgape@uic.edu). Before submitting any manuscript, please consult <http://journals.cambridge.org/jga> for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained via email at [jgape@uic.edu](mailto:jgape@uic.edu).

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2015. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com), email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested. *Postmaster:* Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133. Send address changes elsewhere to *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K.

## CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>CONTRIBUTORS</b>  | v   |
| <b>NOTE FROM THE EDITORS</b>   | 287 |
| <b>HISTORIOGRAPHICAL INTERVENTIONS</b>   |     |
| LOUISE M. NEWMAN Reflections on Aileen Kraditor's Legacy: Fifty Years of<br>Woman Suffrage Historiography, 1965–2014                         | 290 |
| <b>ESSAYS</b>  |     |
| PAUL A. KRAMER Imperial Openings: Civilization, Exemption, and the<br>Geopolitics of Mobility in the History of Chinese Exclusion, 1868–1910 | 317 |
| BENJAMIN WETZEL A Church Divided: Roman Catholicism, Americanization,<br>and the Spanish-American War  | 348 |
| JEREMY C. YOUNG Transformation in the Tabernacle: Billy Sunday's Converts<br>and Emotional Experience in the Progressive Era                 | 367 |
| <b>TEACHING FORUM: PEDAGOGY AND CONTROVERSY<br/>IN THE NEW ADVANCED PLACEMENT U.S. HISTORY<br/>FRAMEWORK</b>                                 |     |
| ROBERT D. JOHNSTON Introduction  | 386 |
| LAWRENCE CHARAP Teaching and Thinking about the Gilded Age and Progressive<br>Era in the Redesigned AP U.S. History Course                   | 389 |
| JEREMY A. STERN An Appeal for Sanity: A Real-World Look at the Purpose,<br>Strengths, and Weaknesses of the 2014 AP U.S. History Framework   | 400 |
| BRENDA SANTOS Adapting to the Redesigned AP U.S. History Course  | 412 |
| SAUL STRAUSSMAN A Reflection on Teaching a Redesigned APUSH Class  | 419 |
| MARY LOPEZ Reviving the Excitement in Advanced Placement U.S. History  | 424 |
| JONATHAN ZIMMERMAN In Search of "College-Level Teaching"   | 429 |
| LENDOL CALDER The Kids Are (Going to Be) Alright   | 433 |
| <b>PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT</b>   |     |
| RICHARD L. MCCORMICK Anti-Corruption in American History   | 441 |
| <b>FILM REVIEW</b>   |     |
| TIMOTHY J. GILFOYLE <i>The Immigrant</i> , Hollywood and Human Trafficking   | 455 |

**On the cover:** This 1889 cartoon from *The Wasp* criticizes the U.S. corporate efforts—here represented by the New York Chamber of Commerce—to lobby Congress on behalf of the entry of Chinese migrants and the vices they carry with them. The woman standing behind the Chinese man may be his wife—a reference to the permission granted to the spouses of the “exempt” to migrate—or she may (in reference to the “Vices” in the man’s bag) be a symbol of prostitution, consistent with the attribution of “immorality” to Chinese migrant women. Source: *The Wasp*: v. 23, July–Dec. 1889, Library of Congress.

## BOOK REVIEWS

- KIDADA E. WILLIAMS *They Left Great Marks on Me: African American Testimonies of Racial Violence from Emancipation to World War I*  
(Carole Emberton) 458
- DOUGLAS CRAIG *Progressives at War: William G. McAdoo and Newton D. Baker, 1863–1941*  
(Trygve Throntveit) 459
- SHAWN MICHELLE SMITH *At the Edge of Sight: Photography and the Unseen*  
(Brenna Wynn Greer) 462
- CAROLE EMBERTON *Beyond Redemption: Race, Violence, and the American South after the Civil War*
- K. STEPHEN PRINCE *Stories of the South: Race and Reconstruction of Southern Identity, 1865–1915*  
(Michael Trotti) 464
- DAVID SHPRINTZEN *The Vegetarian Crusade: The Rise of an American Reform Movement, 1817–1921*
- HELEN ZOE VEIT *Modern Food, Moral Food: Self-Control, Science, and the Rise of Modern American Eating in the Early Twentieth Century*  
(Megan Elias) 467
- MARTA GUTMAN *A City for Children: Women, Architecture, and the Charitable Landscapes of Oakland, 1850–1950*  
(William McGovern) 470