

---

*History  
of Education  
Quarterly*

---

*Winter 1996*

---

V o l u m e  
3 6  
N u m b e r  
4

# History of Education Society

The History of Education Society is an international scholarly society. Its purposes are to encourage and facilitate research in the history of education; to promote and improve the teaching of history of education; to encourage cooperation among specialists in history of education; and to promote an appreciation of the value of historical perspective in the making of educational policy. The Society is affiliated with the International Standing Conference for the History of Education, and members of the Society are automatically members of the Standing Conference.

## *Officers (1996)*

*President*

RONALD D. COHEN, *Indiana University Northwest*

*Vice-President*

JEFFREY MIREL, *Northern Illinois University*

*Secretary-Treasurer*

C. H. EDSON, *University of Oregon, 1994–96*

*Directors*

MARIS VINOVSIS, *Past President, 1995, University of Michigan*

MARY ANN DZUBACK, *Washington University, 1994–96*

LINDA EISENMANN, *University of Massachusetts, Boston, 1995–97*

KATHARINE D. KENNEDY, *Agnes Scott College, 1996–98*

**THE HISTORY OF EDUCATION SOCIETY AWARD:** This award of \$500 will be made biennially to the best essay in the history of education published in any journal over the previous two years. The next award will be presented at the fall 1998 meeting of the History of Education Society. Any article published in 1996 or 1997 will be eligible for the award.

**THE HENRY BARNARD PRIZE:** This prize of \$500 is awarded biennially to the best essay in the history of education by a graduate student. The next award will be presented at the fall 1997 meeting of the History of Education Society. The recipient will have the essay published in the *History of Education Quarterly*.

The Society reserves the right not to make awards in years when the Prize Committee judges all entries to be of insufficient quality.

Inquiries regarding these awards should be directed to the chairperson of the Prize Committee: Roberta Wollons, Dept. of History and Philosophy, Indiana University Northwest, Gary, IN 46408.

**OUTSTANDING BOOK AWARD:** This award of \$500 is made biennially to the author of the best book published in the two previous years. The committee will accept nominations but will also make every effort to review all relevant works, whether or not they have been nominated. The award for books bearing 1995 and 1996 publication dates will be announced at the annual meeting of the Society in 1997.

Inquiries regarding the Outstanding Book Award should be directed to the chairperson: Anne Boylan, Department of History, University of Delaware, Newark, DE 19716.

# *History of Education Quarterly*

## *Editorial Staff*

*Editor*

*Associate Editors*

B. EDWARD MCCLELLAN, *Indiana University*  
JAMES C. ALBISETTI, *University of Kentucky*  
MARY ANN DZUBACK, *Washington University*  
WILLIAM J. REESE, *University of Wisconsin,  
Madison*  
ANDREA WALTON, *Indiana University*  
MARY E. REILLY  
LAURIE MOSES HINES  
ERIC METZLER

*Managing Editor*

*Subscriptions Manager*

*Editorial Assistant*

## *Editorial Board*

PAUL AXELROD, *York University*  
BARBARA BEATTY, *Wellesley College*  
RICHARD BLACKETT, *Indiana University*  
CAROL COBURN, *Avila College*  
WAYNE E. FULLER, *University of Texas at El Paso*  
MICHAEL KATZ, *University of Pennsylvania*  
KATHARINE D. KENNEDY, *Agnes Scott College*  
DONALD LEINSTER-MACKAY, *University of Western Australia*  
WILLIAM A. LINK, *University of North Carolina at Greensboro*  
ROBERT LOWE, *National-Louis University*  
THEODORA PENNY MARTIN, *Bowdoin College*  
DAVID PARKER, *University of Plymouth*  
ALISON PRENTICE, *Ontario Institute for Studies in Education*  
ANNE T. QUARTARARO, *United States Naval Academy*  
TIMOTHY REAGAN, *University of Connecticut*  
THERESA M. RICHARDSON, *University of South Florida*  
REBECCA ROGERS, *University of Iowa*  
WILLIAM J. RORABAUGH, *University of Washington*  
NANCY M. SHEEHAN, *University of British Columbia*  
GEOFFREY SHERINGTON, *University of Sydney*  
LOUISE L. STEVENSON, *Franklin and Marshall College*  
MARCIA SYNNOTT, *University of South Carolina*  
AKIRA TACHIKAWA, *International Christian University*  
EILEEN H. TAMURA, *University of Hawaii Manoa*  
RICHARD TEESE, *University of Melbourne*  
ROBERT WESTBROOK, *University of Rochester*  
JOHN S. WHITEHEAD, *University of Alaska*

The *History of Education Quarterly* (ISSN US 00 182680) is published spring, summer, fall, and winter by the History of Education Society in cooperation with the School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Membership in the Society, which includes subscription to the *Quarterly*, is available at the following rates: students, \$15; others, \$30 (non-U.S. members add \$2 to cover additional postage, surface mail; add \$16 for overseas airmail). Institutional subscription rates are: \$57, U.S.; \$61, non-U.S. All payment must be made in U.S. dollars. Single copies of some back issues available at \$8 plus postage. Periodicals postage paid at Bloomington, Ind. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405.

*History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 36 No. 4 Winter 1996

# History of Education Society

**INDIVIDUAL MEMBERSHIP:** Membership is open to all persons interested in the study of the history of education. Membership provides for subscription to the *History of Education Quarterly*; subscription to *Network*, a newsletter published jointly with Division F of the American Educational Research Association; and receipt of the program of the annual meeting of the Society. Members of the Society are automatically members of the International Standing Conference for the History of Education. Membership offers subscription to publications on a calendar-year basis only. Dues are \$15 for students, \$30 for others. Non-U.S. members should add \$2 to cover additional postage for surface mail; \$16 for airmail. The portions of dues designated for support of the *Quarterly* are \$15 of student dues, \$22 of other individual dues. To become a member, send a check for the appropriate amount in U.S. dollars only to the *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. Make checks payable to History of Education Society. Indicate preferred mailing address and the calendar year in which your subscription should begin.

## *History of Education Quarterly*

**INSTITUTIONAL SUBSCRIPTIONS:** Institutions may subscribe to the *History of Education Quarterly* directly (send checks to *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405) or through subscription agencies. Rates are \$57, U.S.; \$61, non-U.S., U.S. dollars only.

**BACK ISSUES:** Some back issues are available (cost \$8 per issue plus postage).

**INDEXES:** Three indexes are available: Index to Vols. I–X (1961–1970), by Murray S. Shereshevsky (\$5); Index to Vols. XI–XX (1971–1980), by Paul Mattingly and Marilyn Tobias (\$7); and Index to Vols. XXI–XXX (1981–1990), by Gary L. Bailey (\$14 to HES members and \$20 to others).

**ARTICLE SUBMISSIONS:** Contributions should be addressed to: Editor, *History of Education Quarterly*, School of Education, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN 47405. See last page of this issue for guidelines on submission. The editor will only consider articles that have been submitted *exclusively* to the *History of Education Quarterly*.

**BOOK REVIEWS:** Assignments of reviews are made from a file of potential reviewers. To have your name added to the file, send curriculum vitae to the editor. Requests to review particular books cannot be honored.

The *History of Education Quarterly* is printed by Indiana University Printing Services. Design by Dennis H. Hill, Indiana University Publications.

# History of Education Quarterly

---

Volume 36 • Number 4 • Winter 1996

## Contents

---

### *Articles*

- 429 Reluctant Scholars: Apprentices and the Petersburg  
(Virginia) Benevolent Mechanics' Association's School  
*James D. Watkinson*
- 449 "If you can educate the Native woman . . .": Debates  
over the Schooling and Education of Girls and Women in  
Southern Rhodesia, 1900–1934  
*Carol Summers*

---

### *Forum*

- 473 History and Educational Reform  
*Robert L. Hampel, William R. Johnson, David N. Plank,  
Diane Ravitch, David Tyack, and Larry Cuban*

---

### *Book Reviews*

- 503 Graff, *Conflicting Paths*  
by Elliott West
- 505 Borst, *Catching Babies*  
by Sylvia D. Hoffert
- 506 Costin, Karger, and Stoesz, *The Politics of Child Abuse  
in America*  
by LeRoy Ashby
- 508 King, *Stolen Childhood*  
by V. P. Franklin
- 509 Frankel (photographs) and Goldstein (text), *In the Alleys*  
by Alan Wieder

- 512 Friedman, *These Are Our Children*  
by Roberta Wollons
- 514 Kirk, *Earning Their Stripes*  
By D'Ann Campbell
- 515 Beatty, *Preschool Education in America*  
by Julia Wrigley
- 517 Vinovskis, *Education, Society, and Economic Opportunity*  
by David W. Galenson
- 518 Reese, *The Origins of the American High School*  
by Michael B. Katz
- 522 Mintz, *Moralists and Modernizers*  
by Lori D. Ginzberg
- 524 Yohn, *A Contest of Faiths*  
by Julie Roy Jeffrey
- 526 Adams, *Education for Extinction*  
by Margaret Connell Szasz
- 527 Morgan, *Historical Perspectives on the Education of Black Children*  
by Thomas V. O'Brien
- 529 Gordon, *Caste and Class*  
by Janice M. Leone
- 530 Ryan, *John Dewey and the High Tide of American Liberalism*  
by Daniel J. Wilson
- 532 Myers, *The Elephants Teach*  
by Roger Mitchell
- 533 Mungazi, *Where He Stands*  
by Wayne J. Urban
- 535 Walsh, *Schoolmarms*  
by Margaret A. Laughlin
- 536 Allison, *Present and Past*  
by Ronald E. Butchart
- 538 Potter and Logan, *A History of Teacher Education in Hawai'i*  
by Eileen H. Tamura

- 539 Contosta, *Villanova University, 1842–1992*  
by Kathleen Mahoney
- 541 Knoll, *Prairie University*  
by Charles C. Bishop
- 542 Armstrong, *A More Perfect Legacy*  
by Sheryl A. Kujawa
- 544 Lester, *Stagg's University*  
by John R. Thelin
- 545 Reid, *Year One*  
by Alex Duke
- 546 Röhrs, *The Classical German Concept of the University  
and Its Influence on Higher Education in the United  
States*  
by Thomas Neville Bonner
- 548 Ehrich, *Städtische Lehrerinnenausbildung in Preussen*  
by Ann Taylor Allen
- 549 Schultheis, *Zur Problematik der eigenständigen  
Mädchenbildung*  
by James C. Albisetti
- 551 Karanovich, *The Development of Education in Serbia  
and Emergence of Its Intelligentsia, 1838–1858*  
by John Georgeoff
- 552 Friedman, *Northern English Books, Owners, and  
Makers in the Late Middle Ages*  
by Mary C. Erler
- 554 Dukes, ed., *The Universities of Aberdeen and Europe*  
by Thomas G. Velek
- 555 Hohmann and Langer, “*Stolz, ein Deutscher zu sein . . .*”:  
by Gregory Paul Wegner
- 556 Openshaw, *Unresolved Struggle*  
by W. F. Connell
- 557 Boardman et al., *Sydney Teachers College*  
by David R. Jones
- 559 Fujimura-Fanselow and Kameda, eds., *Japanese Women*  
by Yoko H. Thakur
- 563 **Book Notes**
- 565 **Index to Volume 36**