

VOLUME 20

NUMBER 2

APRIL 2011

CQ

---

*Cambridge*

---

*Quarterly of*

---

*Healthcare*

---

*Ethics*

---

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,  
<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantton/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*  
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*  
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*  
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*  
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [TKushner@aol.com](mailto:TKushner@aol.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 20 (2011) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$333/£195; online only: \$278/£166; print only: \$319/£185. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$88/£51. Students and retirees: \$82/£41. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$70/£35. Student and retiree: \$82/£41. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com). ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 20, Number 2, April 2011

## CONTENTS

Contributors 155

### *Special Section: Methodology in Philosophical Bioethics*

Guest Editorial: On Method and Resolution in  
Philosophical Bioethics  
JOHN COGGON 159

Classification and Normativity: Some Thoughts on Different  
Ways of Carving Up the Field of Bioethics  
SØREN HOLM 165

Vorsprung durch Technik: On Biotechnology, Bioethics, and  
Its Beneficiaries  
NICKY PRIAULX 174

Bays, Beaches, and Bioethical Barkings  
JAN HELGE SOLBAKK 185

Eugenics and the Genetic Challenge, Again: All Dressed  
Up and Just Everywhere to Go  
TOM KOCH 191

The Challenge of Nonconfrontational Ethics  
JOHN HARRIS 204

Confronting Rationality  
RONALD M. GREEN 216

Nonconfrontational Rationality or Critical Reasoning  
VILHJÁLMUR ÁRNASON 228

Are All Rational Moralities Equivalent?  
DARRYL GUNSON 238

Genetic Enhancement in Sports: The Role of Reason and  
Private Rationalities in the Public Arena  
SILVIA CAMPORESI AND PAOLO MAUGERI 248

Reasons, Rationalities, and Procreative Beneficence:  
Need Häyry Stand Politely By While Savulescu and  
Herissone-Kelly Disagree?  
PETER HERISSONE-KELLY 258

Balancing Procreative Autonomy and Parental Responsibility  
TOM BULLER AND STEPHENIE BAUER 268

*Contents continued*

*Contents continued*

***Symposium on Global Bioethics***

Introduction: Access to Life-Saving Medicines and Intellectual Property Rights DORIS SCHROEDER	277
Access to Life-Saving Medicines and Intellectual Property Rights: An Ethical Assessment DORIS SCHROEDER AND PETER SINGER	279
Developing Medicines in Line with Global Public Health Needs: The Role of the World Health Organization TIKKI PANG	290
Does the Pharmaceutical Sector Have a Coresponsibility for the Human Right to Health? DORIS SCHROEDER	298
Access to Healthcare and the Pharmaceutical Sector KLAUS M. LEISINGER AND KARIN M. SCHMITT	309
Collaborating with the Pharmaceutical Industry: An Aboriginal Perspective JACK BEETSON	326
Epilogue: New Drugs for Neglected Diseases THOMAS POGGE AND AIDAN HOLLIS	329