

VOLUME 23

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2014

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

*A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists*

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

The International Bioethics Retreat
<http://www.cpmc.org/services/ethics/retreat.html>

Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education
<http://cambridgebioethics.com/>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *Division of Medical Ethics, NYU Lagone Medical Center, New York*
John Coggon, *School of Law, University of Southampton, England*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Denise Dudzinski, *Department of Bioethics and Humanities, University of Washington School of Medicine*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center for Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University*
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Annon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Bioethics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Doris Schroeder, *Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, England*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to kushnertk@gmail.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, *Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308*.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 23 (2014) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$420/£262; online only: \$333/£208; print only: \$416/£260. Individual rates, print only: \$108/£66. Single part: \$114/£71. Students and retirees: \$93/£58. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$78/£47. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2013. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 23, Number 1, January 2014

CONTENTS

Contributors 1

Special Section: Rationality, Morality, and Disability

Guest Editorial: Creating and Respecting Lives of Value:
Reproductive Choices, Disability, and Ethics

JOHN COGGON 3

Martha as a Mother: Parents, Parental Choices,
and Preimplantation Selection

HEATHER DRAPER 8

Time, Rationality, and Human Existence

HETA ALEKSANDRA GYLLING 17

A Heaven without Giants or Dwarfs: Equality, Gender,
and Disabilities

SIMONA GIORDANO 22

There Can Be No Moral Obligation to Eradicate All Disability

REBECCA BENNETT 30

Disability, Harm, and the Origins of Limited Opportunities

SIMO VEHMAS AND TOM SHAKESPEARE 41

Harris, Disability, and the Good Life

STEVEN D. EDWARDS 48

Time to Exorcise the Cloning Demon

JOHN HARRIS 53

Departments and Columns

Responses and Dialogue

Häyry Reconsidered

KRISTEN HINE 63

A response to "Considerable Life Extension and Three
Views on the Meaning of Life" by Matti Häyry (CQ 20(1))

Some Additional Thoughts on Considerable Life Extension
and the Meaning of Life

MATTI HÄYRY 68

The Great Debates

Introduction: Common Morality

D. MICAH HESTER AND ALISSA SWOTA 73

Contents continued

Contents continued

Living with Pirates: Common Morality and Embodied Practice
REBECCA KUKLA 75

On Common Morality as Embodied Practice: A Reply to Kukla
TOM L. BEAUCHAMP 86

Kukla’s Argument against Common Morality as a Set of Precepts:
On Stranger Tides
CARSON STRONG 93

Response to Strong and Beauchamp: At World’s End
REBECCA KUKLA 99

A Few More Comments on Common Morality, Noting Some
Points of Agreement
CARSON STRONG 103

CQ Review
Greg S. Loeben, section editor
The History and Future of Bioethics: A Sociological View,
by John Evans
REVIEWED BY JEFFREY P. BISHOP AND AMANDA HINE 105

Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work
The Case: A Son’s Request to Forgo Treatment
RUCHIKA MISHRA 108

Commentary: Interpreting Patient Wishes
HONG LEE 109

Commentary: The Need for More Questions
ANNETTE MENDOLA 111

What Actually Happened 113

Best Practices Guidelines for Publishing in the Bioethics Literature