

SPRING 1994

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

# Slavic Review

## ARTICLES

Padraic Kenney : *Remaking the Polish Working Class*

Theodore R. Weeks : *Poles and Russians, 1863–1914*

Steven L. Hoch : *Russian Peasant Standard of Living*

James Hughes : *Capturing the Russian Peasantry*

Matthew Schneer : *A Peasant Community during Russia's First  
Revolution*

Robert J. Brym & Evel Economakis : *Pskov Workers in St. Petersburg*

Monika Greenleaf : *Pushkin's Trace in The Gift*

Valentina G. Brougher : *Ivanov's Y and the Rooster Metaphor*

## COMMENT

Philippe C. Schmitter with Terry Lynn Karl : *Transitologists &  
Consolidologists*

## REVIEW ARTICLES

Ellen Comisso : *A Ken Jowitt Retrospective*

Irina Paperno, et al. : *Symposium*

## EDITOR

ELLIOTT MOSSMAN

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JEAN GURLEY

BOOKS EDITORS

BEN EKLOF, INDIANA UNIVERSITY

CATHERINE ALBRECHT, UNIVERSITY OF BALTIMORE

FILM EDITOR, SVETLANA BOYM, HARVARD UNIVERSITY

ASSISTANT EDITORS, BRONWYN GURLEY and RICHARD FROST

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

VITALY CHERNETSKY

BARBARA KENDA

GORDANA KOSTIĆ

LESLEY RIMMEL

IVANA VULETIĆ

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### *History*

Laura Engelstein, *Princeton University* • Boris Mironov, *Institute of Russian History, St. Petersburg* • Norman Naimark, *Stanford University* • Nancy Shields Kollmann, *Stanford University* • Ronald G. Suny, *University of Michigan* • Roman Szporluk, *Harvard University* • Gate Stokes, *Rice University* • Richard S. Wortman, *Columbia University*

### *Literature & Linguistics*

Caryl Emerson, *Princeton University* • Vyacheslav Ivanov, *Moscow University & UCLA* • Gary Saul Morson, *Northwestern University* • Stephanie Sandler, *Amherst College*

### *Social Sciences*

Mark R. Beissinger, *University of Wisconsin* • Ellen T. Comisso, *University of California, San Diego* • Mary McAuley, *Oxford University* • Blair A. Ruble, *Kennan Institute for Advanced Russian Studies* • Brian D. Silver, *Michigan State University* • Katherine M. Verdery, *Johns Hopkins University*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

*Slavic Review* (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all Association members. Members also receive the *AAASS Newsletter*. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, Jordan Quad/Acacia, 125 Panama Street, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4130; (415) 723-9668.

Membership dues: salary \$10,000–19,999—\$25.00; \$20,000–29,999—\$35.00; \$30,000–39,999—\$45.00; \$40,000–49,999—\$50.00; \$50,000–59,999—\$65.00; more than \$60,000—\$75.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$15.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$20.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$45.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$15.00; for members, \$10.00 each. For overseas postage, please add \$6.00; for Canada, add \$5.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address or items for the *Newsletter* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Stanford.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters or advertising should be sent to *Slavic Review*, 636 Williams Hall, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104-6305. Building address is 36th & Spruce Streets. Telephone: 215-898-8096; FAX: 215-898-2998; E-mail: slavrev@mail.sas.upenn.edu. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions may be found at the end of the advertising section.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Text set in Baskerville by Automated Composition Service, Inc., Lancaster, PA. Printed by Science Press, Ephrata, PA. Second-class postage paid at Palo Alto, CA and additional mailing office. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Slavic Review*, c/o AAASS, Jordan Quad/Acacia, 125 Panama Street, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4130.

Copyright © 1994 *Slavic Review*: ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc.

# Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND  
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

---

VOLUME 53 NUMBER 1 • SPRING 1994

CONTRIBUTORS vii

FROM THE EDITOR viii

## ARTICLES

Remaking the Polish Working Class: Early Stalinist Models of  
Labor and Leisure 1  
PADRAIC KENNEY

Defining Us and Them: Poles and Russians in the “Western  
Provinces,” 1863–1914 26  
THEODORE R. WEEKS

On Good Numbers and Bad: Malthus, Population Trends and  
Peasant Standard of Living in Late Imperial Russia 42  
STEVEN L. HOCH

Capturing the Russian Peasantry: Stalinist Grain Procurement  
Policy and the “Ural-Siberian Method” 76  
JAMES HUGHES

The Markovo Republic: A Peasant Community during  
Russia’s First Revolution, 1905–1906 104  
MATTHEW SCHNEER

Peasant or Proletarian? Militant Pskov Workers in St.  
Petersburg, 1913 120  
ROBERT J. BRYM AND EVEL ECONOMAKIS

Fathers, Sons and Impostors: Pushkin’s Trace in *The Gift* 140  
MONIKA GREENLEAF

Vsevolod Ivanov's Satirical Novel <i>Y</i> and the Rooster Metaphor VALENTINA G. BROUGHER	159
--	-----

## COMMENT

The Conceptual Travels of Transitologists and Consolidologists: How Far to the East Should They Attempt to Go? PHILIPPE C. SCHMITTER WITH TERRY LYNN KARL	173
--	-----

## REVIEW ARTICLES

Prediction versus Diagnosis: Comments on a Ken Jowitt Retrospective ELLEN COMISSO	186
--	-----

Symposium IRINA PAPERNO, REGINALD ZELNIK, THOMAS LAQUEUR, ERIC NAIMAN, ANNE NESBET, OLGA MATICH, LAURA ENGELSTEIN; EDITED BY IRINA PAPERNO	193
---	-----

## FEATURED REVIEWS

Nils Åke Nilsson, ed., <i>Czesław Miłosz: A Stockholm Conference, September 9–11, 1991</i> (Tomas Venclova)	225
Michael Makin and Jindřich Toman, eds., <i>On Karel Čapek</i> (Michael Heim)	227
Gayla Diment and Yuri Slezkine, eds., <i>Between Heaven and Hell: The Myth of Siberia in Russian Culture</i> (Mark Bassin)	228
Cathy A. Frierson, <i>Peasant Icons: Representations of Rural People in Late Nineteenth-Century Russia</i> (Isabel A. Tirado)	231
Joan Neuberger, <i>Hooliganism: Crime, Culture, and Power in St. Petersburg, 1900–1914</i> (Laurie Bernstein)	232
James von Geldern, <i>Bolshevik Festivals, 1917–1920</i> (Choi Chatterjee)	233
Hélène C. d'Encausse, <i>The Great Challenge: Nationalities and the Bolshevik State, 1917–1930</i> (Mark von Hagen)	234
David T. Twining, <i>Strategic Surprise in the Age of Glasnost</i> (Stephen J. Cimbala)	236
Kimberley M. Zisk, <i>Engaging the Enemy: Organization Theory and Soviet Military Innovation, 1955–1991</i> (Thomas M. Nichols)	237
William C. Wohlforth, <i>The Elusive Balance: Power and Perceptions during the Cold War</i> (Andrew Bennett)	238

## BOOK REVIEWS

- Marjorie Yovino-Young, *Pagan Ritual and Myth in Russian Magic Tales: A Study of Patterns* (Joanna Hubbs) 240
- Frank J. Miller, *Folklore for Stalin: Russian Folklore and Pseudofolklore of the Stalin Era* (Adele Barker) 241
- Elise K. Wirtschafter, *From Serf to Russian Soldier* (Jonathan W. Daly) 242
- Orlando Figes, *Peasant Russia, Civil War: The Volga Countryside in Revolution, 1917–1921* (Graeme Gill) 243
- David Moon, *Russian Peasants and Tsarist Legislation on the Eve of Reform: Interaction between Peasants and Officialdom 1825–1855* (Steven L. Hoch) 244
- William Pokhlebkin, *A History of Vodka* (David Christian) 245
- Mark C. Bartusis, *The Late Byzantine Army: Arms and Society, 1204–1453* (Jonathan Grant) 247
- Daniel R. Brower, *The Russian City between Tradition and Modernity, 1850–1900* (Joseph Bradley) 248
- Edward H. Judge, *Easter in Kishinev: Anatomy of a Pogrom* (Neil B. Weissman) 249
- Vladimir N. Brovkin. ed. and trans., *Dear Comrades: Menshevik Reports on the Bolshevik Revolution and the Civil War* (Michael Melancon) 250
- Gennady Shkliarevsky, *Labor in the Russian Revolution: Factory Committees and Trade Unions, 1917–1918* (William B. Husband) 252
- Robert C. Tucker, *Stalin in Power: The Revolution from Above, 1928–1941* (Jan S. Adams) 252
- Donald Filtzer, *Soviet Workers and De-Stalinization: The Consolidation of the Modern System of Soviet Production Relations, 1953–1964* (Walter D. Connor) 254
- Loren R. Graham, *Science in Russia and the Soviet Union: A Short History* (Donald W. Treadgold) 255
- Andrea Graziosi, *Stato e industria in Unione Sovietica (1917–1953)* (Francesco Benvenuti) 256
- Peter Rutland, *The Politics of Economic Stagnation in the Soviet Union* (John P. Willerton) 257
- David W. Benn, *From Glasnost to Freedom of Speech: Russian Openness and International Relations* (William M. Reisinger) 258

Murray Yanowitch, <i>Controversies in Soviet Social Thought: Democratization, Social Justice, and the Erosion of Official Ideology</i> (Mervyn Matthews)	258
Uri Ra'anan, Keith Armes and Kate Martin, eds., <i>Russian Pluralism: Now Irreversible?</i> (Peter Reddaway)	259
Moti Nissani, <i>Lives in the Balance: The Cold War and American Politics, 1945–1991</i> (Robert E. Williams)	261
Michael R. Beschloss and Strobe Talbott, <i>At the Highest Levels: The Inside Story of the End of the Cold War</i> (William Taubman)	262
Jonathan S. Lockwood and Kathleen O. Lockwood, <i>The Russian View of U.S. Strategy: Its Past, Its Future</i> (Dale R. Herspring)	263
Harold J. Goldberg, ed., <i>Documents of Soviet-American Relations, vol. 1, Intervention, Famine Relief, International Affairs, 1917–1933</i> (James K. Libbey)	264
Wayne S. Smith, ed., <i>The Russians Aren't Coming: New Soviet Policy in Latin America</i> (Jan S. Adams)	265
Ramesh Thakur and Carlyle A. Thayer, <i>Soviet Relations with India and Vietnam</i> (Peter J.S. Duncan)	266
David M. Crowe, <i>The Baltic States and the Great Powers: Foreign Relations, 1938–1940</i> (Hugh I. Rodgers)	267
Anthony Arnold, <i>The Fateful Pebble: Afghanistan's Role in the Fall of the Soviet Empire</i> (Henry S. Bradsher)	269
Avril Pittman, <i>From Ostpolitik to Reunification: West German-Soviet Political Relations since 1974</i> (Angela Stent)	270
Oles M. Smolansky and Bettie M. Smolansky, <i>The USSR and Iraq: The Soviet Quest for Influence</i> (Elizabeth K. Valkenier)	271
Robert Desjardins, <i>The Soviet Union through French Eyes, 1945–1985</i> ; Pierre Rigoulot, <i>Les paupières lourdes. Les Français face au goulag: aveuglements et indignations</i> (Ruth Rischin)	272
Miron Rezun, ed., <i>Nationalism and the Breakup of an Empire: Russia and Its Periphery</i> (William Gleason)	273
Milan Hauner, <i>What Is Asia to Us? Russia's Asian Heartland Yesterday and Today</i> (David MacKenzie)	274
Jo-Ann Gross, ed., <i>Muslims in Central Asia: Expressions of Identity and Change</i> (Devin DeWeese)	275
Ed A. Hewett and Clifford G. Gaddy, <i>Open for Business: Russia's Return to the Global Economy</i> (Josef C. Brada)	276

Martin Myant, <i>Transforming Socialist Economies: The Case of Poland and Czechoslovakia</i> (Joshua Charap)	277
Anthony B. Atkinson and John Micklewright, <i>Economic Transformation in Eastern Europe and the Distribution of Income</i> ; Jenny Brine, comp., <i>Comecon: The Rise and Fall of an International Socialist Organization. International Organization Series</i> (Hans-Peter Brunner)	278
Anders Åman, <i>Architecture and Ideology in Eastern Europe during the Stalin Era: An Aspect of Cold War History</i> (William C. Brumfield)	280
James H. Satterwhite, <i>Varieties of Marxist Humanism: Philosophical Revision in Postwar Eastern Europe</i> (Anto Knežević)	281
Hans-Joachim Torke, ed., <i>Forschungen zur osteuropäischen Geschichte</i> (Valerie A. Kivelson)	282
Ladislav Matejka, ed., <i>Cross Currents 11: A Yearbook of Central European Culture</i> (Addison Bross)	283
R. J. W. Evans and T. V. Thomas, eds., <i>Crown, Church and Estates: Central European Politics in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries</i> (Charles Ingrao)	284
Solomea Pavlychko, <i>Letters from Kiev</i> (Michael F. Hamm)	286
Paul Latawski, ed., <i>The Reconstruction of Poland 1914–23</i> (Jaroslaw Piekalkiewicz)	286
Miriam P.-Mariańska and Mordecai Peleg, <i>Witnesses: Life in Occupied Kraków</i> (Jan T. Gross)	288
Lee Congdon, <i>Exile and Social Thought: Hungarian Intellectuals in Germany and Austria, 1919–1933</i> (George Barany)	288
Juliana G. Pilon, <i>The Bloody Flag: Post-Communist Nationalism in Eastern Europe, Spotlight on Romania</i> (Daniel N. Nelson)	291
Tahsin Gemil, <i>Români și Otomani în secolele xiv-xvi</i> (Paul E. Michelson)	292
Susan M. Stuard, <i>A State of Deference: Ragusa/Dubrovnik in the Medieval Centuries</i> (Zdenko Zlatar)	293
Charles Jelavich, <i>South Slav Nationalisms: Textbooks and Yugoslav Union before 1914</i> (Peter F. Sugar)	294
Gale Stokes, <i>Politics as Development: The Emergence of Political Parties in Nineteenth-Century Serbia</i> (Frederick B. Chary)	295
Murlin Croucher, comp. and ed., <i>Slavic Studies: A Guide to Bibliographies, Encyclopedias, and Handbooks</i> , 2 vols. (Zdeněk V. David)	296

Lynne Attwood, et al., <i>Red Women on the Silver Screen: Soviet Women and Cinema from the Beginning to the End of the Communist Era</i> (Denise J. Youngblood)	298
Andrew Horton and Michael Brashinsky, <i>The Zero Hour: Glasnost and Soviet Cinema in Transition</i> (Vance Kepley, Jr.)	299
Matthew C. Bown and Brandon Taylor, eds., <i>Art of the Soviets: Painting, Sculpture and Architecture in a One-Party State, 1917–1922</i> (James M. Curtis)	300
David A. Ross, ed., <i>Between Spring and Summer: Soviet Conceptual Art in the Era of Late Communism</i> (Vitaly Chernetsky)	301
Barbara Lesák, <i>Russische Theaterkunst 1910–1936</i> (Harold B. Segel)	303
Gary R. Jahn, <i>The Death of Ivan Ilich: An Interpretation</i> (Kathleen Parthé)	305
Michael Gardiner, <i>The Dialogics of Critique: M. M. Bakhtin and the Theory of Ideology</i> (Robert F. Barsky)	306
Christiane Schulz, <i>Aspekte der Shillerschen Kunsttheorie im Literaturkonzept Dostoevskijs</i> (Rudolf Neuhäuser)	308
Fyodor Dostoevsky, <i>The Brothers Karamazov</i> , trans. Richard Pevear and Larissa Volokhonsky; <i>Crime and Punishment</i> , trans. David McDuff (Liza Knapp)	309
Frank Göpfert, <i>Dichterinnen and Schriftstellerinnen in Rußland: von der Mitte des 18. bis zum Beginn des 20. Jahrhunderts</i> (Mary F. Zirin)	311
P. Trannua, ed., <i>Tri veka poezii russkogo Erosa: Publikatsii i issledovaniia</i> (Vladimir Golstein)	312
Viktor Dmitriev, <i>Serebrianyi gost!: O liricheskom geroe Bal'monta</i> (Mary A. Nicholas)	313
Vladimir Markov, <i>Kommentar zu den Dichtungen von K.D. Bal'mont</i> , vols. 1 and 2 (Michael Wachtel)	315
Sonia I. Ketchian, ed., <i>Anna Akhmatova, 1889–1989: Papers from the Akhmatova Centennial Conference, Bellagio Study and Conference Center, June 1989</i> (Sibelan Forrester)	316
<b>LETTERS</b>	318