

JOURNAL

of Law and Religion

Volume XIX

Number 1

2003-2004

Article

Canon Law and the Human Person *Rev. John J. Coughlin, O.F.M.*

Symposium: American Muslims and Civil Rights: Testimonies and Critiques

Opening Remarks *Azizah al-Hibri*

Testimony *Kareema Altomare*
Gazala Ashraf
Meredith McEver
Aysha Nudrat Unus

Critique *Elisa Massimino*
Joseph Onek
Eric Treene

Raiding Islam: Searches that Target Religious Institutions *John G. Douglass*

The Bottom Rung of America's Race Ladder: After the
September 11 Catastrophe Are American Muslims
Becoming America's New N . . . s? *Jonathan K. Stubbs*

Article and Review Essay

Scientology in the German Courts *Greg Taylor*

*Bright Promise, Failed Community: Catholics and the
American Public Order*, by Joseph A. Varacalli *David L. Gregory*

Poetry

Memory of Absences (poem) *Gershon Hepner*

Sponsored by: Hamline University School of Law

Published by: Hamline University School of Law
ISSN: 0748-0814

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XIX

2003-2004

NUMBER 1

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Associate Editors

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

Book Review Editor

STEVEN D. SMITH, San Diego School of Law

Technical Editors

MARY L. DUNNEWOLD, Hamline University School of Law

STEPHEN LIEBO, Hamline University School of Law

Production/Subscription Manager

LINDA BERGLIN, Hamline University School of Law

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

JAMES AUSTAD
DEBRA NEWELL

RYAN KAATZ
JOHN SANDOWSKI
JIM ZULEGER

JOHN KULESZ
SARA SMITH

EDITORIAL BOARD

ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Law, Chair

AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond

STEPHEN L. CARTER, Yale Law School

PAULA COOEY, Macalester College

ANTHONY E. COOK, Georgetown University Law Center

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Ex Officio

JON M. GARON, Hamline University School of Law

EMILY ALBRINK HARTIGAN, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

AFRA JALABI, Islamic Scholar, Montreal, Quebec

JOSÉ ROBERTO JUÁREZ, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

PATRICK R. KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary

HOWARD LESNICK, University of Pennsylvania Law School

ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee, Secretary

THOMAS PORTER, JUSTPEACE Center for Mediation & Conflict Transformation
RICHARD QUINNEY, Northern Illinois University
EARL SCHWARTZ, Hamline University
STEVEN D. SMITH, San Diego School of Law
Ex Officio
DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University
DARRYL TRIMIEW, Colgate Rochester Crozer Divinity School
AMELIA UELMEN, Fordham University School of Law
HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law, Treasurer

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University of New York, Co-chair

DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University, Co-chair

TAHA JABER AL-ALWANI, Graduate School of Social and Islamic Sciences

ZAFAR ISHAQ ANSARI, The International Institute of Islamic Thought, Pakistan

RICHARD BAEPLER, Professor Emeritus, Valparaiso University School of Law

MILNER BALL, University of Georgia School of Law

HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law

GERARD BRADLEY, Notre Dame University Law School

JAMES BRESNAHAN, Boston College

MICHAEL J. BROYDE, Emory University School of Law

LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law

FRED CARNEY, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University

MOHAMED S. EL-AWA, Islamic Scholar, Cairo, Egypt

CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law

EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University

RICHARD HIERS, University of Florida

CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School

DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths

SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law

DAVID LITTLE, Harvard University Divinity School

ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University

SEYYED HUSSEIN NASR, George Washington University

LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College

MICHAEL PERRY, Emory University School of Law

KAY PRANIS, Saint Paul, Minnesota

ELISABETH SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School

THOMAS L. SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School

PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law

CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, University of Cape Town, South Africa

ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Retired, Minnesota Supreme Court

MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany

JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law

WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota

The Journal of Law and Religion is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a interdisciplinary, interfaith academic and professional publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$25 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$35 for institutions, and \$12 for students. Add an additional \$10 for foreign postage. Subscription requests, manuscripts, book reviews, books to be reviewed, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

The Journal of Law and Religion
1536 Hewitt Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104
or jlr@gw.hamline.edu

Citations generally conform to the Association of Legal Writing Directors' *ALWD Citation Manual*. Citations to Jewish/Christian Biblical sources conform to the *SBL Handbook of Style* and the *Jewish Law Annual*. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on-line on a variety of computer database services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available online through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

Internet access to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 19 J LAW & RELIG 1

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

The Journal of Law and Religion was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

The Journal of Law and Religion is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

- Historical** The *Journal* intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.
- Theoretical** The *Journal* intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.
- Ethical** The *Journal* intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.
- Global** The *Journal* intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.
- Professional** The *Journal* intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.
- Spiritual** The *Journal* recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The *Journal* is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the *Journal* intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

HAMLIN
UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF LAW

A subscription to the
JOURNAL OF LAW AND
RELIGION

Cost per volume (two issues):

\$25.00 individual (U.S.A.)
\$35.00 individual (foreign)
\$35.00 institution (U.S.A.)
\$45.00 institution (foreign)
\$12.00 student

Circulation Manager
Journal of Law and Religion
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104

Payment Enclosed

Name: _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Phone: _____ Fax: _____ E-Mail: _____

ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire
back stock, reprint and
microform rights to the

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Complete sets to date
are now available.
We can also furnish
single volumes and issues.

WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.
1285 Main Street
Buffalo, New York 14209

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XIX

2003-2004

NUMBER 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface xi

ARTICLE

Rev. John J. Coughlin,
O.F.M. Canon Law and the Human Person 1

SYMPOSIUM: AMERICAN MUSLIMS and CIVIL RIGHTS: TESTIMONIES and CRITIQUES

Azizah al-Hibri Opening Remarks 59

Testimony

Kareema Altomare 63
Gazala Ashraf 69
Meredith McEver 73
Aysha Nudrat Unus 79

Critique

Elisa Massimino 81
Joseph Onek 85
Eric Treene 89
John G. Douglass Raiding Islam: Searches that Target
Religious Institutions..... 95

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

Jonathan K. Stubbs The Bottom Rung of America's
Race Ladder: After the September 11
Catastrophe Are American Muslims Becoming
America's New N s?..... 115

ARTICLE and REVIEW ESSAY

Greg Taylor Scientology in the German Courts 153

David L. Gregory *Bright Promise, Failed Community: Catholics
and the American Public Order*, by Joseph A.
Varacalli 199

POETRY

Gershon Hepner Memory of Absences (poem) 207