

VOLUME 71 NUMBER 4

FALL 2009

The
Review
of
Politics

ARTICLES

Andrew F. March, “What Is Comparative Political Theory?”

Farah Godrej, “Response to What Is Comparative Political Theory?”

Paul S. Rowe, “Render Unto Caesar . . . What? Reflections on the
Work of William Cavanaugh”

William T. Cavanaugh, “If You Render Unto God What is God’s,
What is Left for Caesar?”

Michael J. Perry, “Liberal Democracy and the Right to Religious
Freedom”

Allan Arkush, “Theocracy, Liberalism, and Modern Judaism”

THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor

CATHERINE H. ZUCKERT

Executive Associate Editor

DENNIS WM MORAN

Book Review Editor

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

Assistant Editor

LES HARRIS

Editorial Intern:

Joshua M. Bandoch

Andrew W. Bramsen

Associate Editors

Fred Dallmayr
E.A. Goerner
A. James McAdams

Ruth M. Abbey
Guillermo O'Donnell
James Turner

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian
M.A. Fitzsimons
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson
Donald P. Kommers
Walter Nicgorski

Editorial Advisory Board

Shlomo Avineri
*Hebrew University of
Jerusalem*

Barry Cooper
University of Calgary

John Dunn
Cambridge University

Jean Bethke Elshtain
University of Chicago

Michael A. Gillespie
Duke University

Leslie Goldstein
University of Delaware

Russel Hittinger
University of Tulsa

Axel Honneth
*Institute for Social Research,
Frankfurt*

Shozo Iijima
*Waseda University,
Tokyo*

Ramin Jahanbegloo
University of Toronto

Pierre Manent
*L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en
sciences sociales*

Harvey C. Mansfield
Harvard University

Mary Nichols
Baylor University

Bruce M. Russett
Yale University

Arlene Saxonhouse
University of Michigan

Steven B. Smith
Yale University

Peter Steinberger
Reed College

John Witte, Jr.
Emory University

Jean M. Yarbrough
Bowdoin College

Administrative Assistant: Kelli Brown

The Review of Politics publishes primarily philosophical and historical studies of politics, especially those concentrating on political theory and American political thought. The journal also includes thoughtful scholarly reflections on all aspects of politics—including analysis of institutions and techniques, international relations, comparative politics, literary reflections on politics or political interpretations of literary works, constitutional theory and practices.

TABLE OF CONTENTS FALL 2009

Vol. 71 Fall 2009 No. 4

Andrew F. March
What Is Comparative Political Theory? 531

Farah Godrej
Response to "What Is Comparative Political Theory?" 567

Paul S. Rowe
Render Unto Caesar . . . What? Reflections on the Work of
William Cavanaugh 583

William T. Cavanaugh
If You Render Unto God What Is God's, What Is
Left for Caesar? 607

Michael J. Perry
Liberal Democracy and the Right to Religious Freedom . . . 621

Allan Arkush
Theocracy, Liberalism, and Modern Judaism 637

Reviews:

Richard J. Bernstein: INSIGHTFUL, HUMANE, AND
RELEVANT
Review of Hans Jonas's *Memoirs* 659

Michael Zank: JEWISH PHILOSOPHER OF THE HOUR?
Review of David Janssens's *Between Athens
and Jerusalem: Philosophy, Prophecy, and Politics in
Leo Strauss's Early Thought* and Daniel Tanguay's
Leo Strauss: An Intellectual Biography 662

Elliot Bartky: POETIC AND PHILOSOPHICAL
HISTORIAN
Review of Ann Ward's *Herodotus and the Philosophy
of Empire* 668

Kevin M. Cherry: ARISTOTLE'S SOCRATIC TURN
Review of Ronna Burger's *Aristotle's Dialogue with
Socrates: On the "Nicomachean Ethics"* 672

Douglas Kries: PARALLEL THOUGHTS
Review of Dean Hammer's *Roman Political Thought
and the Modern Theoretical Imagination* 675

Marc D. Guerra: CHRISTIANITY AND THE POLITICAL ORDER	
Review of Eric Gregory's <i>Politics and the Order of Love: An Augustinian Ethic of Democratic Citizenship</i>	677
Thomas M. Izbicki: HOW LAW BECAME A PROFESSION	
Review of James A. Brundage's <i>The Medieval Origins of the Legal Profession: Canonists, Civilians, and Courts</i>	680
Sanford Lakoff: REASONS AND ANTIPATHIES	
Review of Robert Zaretsky and John T. Scott's <i>The Philosophers' Quarrel: Rousseau, Hume, and the Limits of Human Understanding</i>	682
Joseph Cosgrove: AUTHORITIES IN TENSION	
Review of Desmond Avery's <i>Beyond Power: Simone Weil and the Notion of Authority</i>	685
Robert J. Lacey: RADICAL DEMOCRAT	
Review of Peter T. Manicas's <i>Rescuing Dewey: Essays in Pragmatic Naturalism</i>	687
Bruce Kuklick: DIPLOMAT AS LITTERATEUR	
Review of Lee Congdon's <i>George Kennan: A Writing Life</i>	690
James Walton: ODD COUPLE	
Review of Michael Kimmage's <i>The Conservative Turn: Lionel Trilling, Whittaker Chambers, and the Lessons of Anti-Communism</i>	692
Peri E. Arnold: NOT UP TO THE JOB	
Review of Paul C. Light's <i>A Government ILL EXECUTED: The Decline of the Federal Service and How to Reverse It</i>	695
Sean J. Savage: NOT A COMPROMISE	
Review of Michael F. Holt's <i>By One Vote: The Disputed Presidential Election of 1876</i>	698
Gerald Mara: TESTING THEORIES OF ATHENIAN DEMOCRACY	
Review of Josiah Ober's <i>Democracy and Knowledge: Innovation and Learning in Classical Athens</i>	700
Cynthia R. Rugeley: THE MORE THINGS CHANGE, THE MORE THEY STAY THE SAME	
Review of Michael S. Lewis-Beck, William G. Jacoby, Helmut Norpoth, and Herbert F. Weisberg's <i>The American Voter Revisited</i>	703
<i>Index to Volume 71</i>	707

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE

ANDREW F. MARCH is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Yale University. **FARAH GODREJ** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Riverside. **PAUL S. ROWE** is Associate Professor and Coordinator of Political and International Studies at Trinity Western University, Canada. **WILLIAM T. CAVANAUGH** is Associate Professor of Theology at the University of St. Thomas Center for Catholic Studies. **MICHAEL PERRY** is Robert W. Woodruff Professor of Law at Emory University. **ALLAN ARKUSH** is Professor of Judaic Studies at Binghamton University SUNY.

RICHARD J. BERNSTEIN is Vera List Professor of Philosophy at New School University, New York. **MICHAEL ZANK** is Associate Professor of Religion at the College and Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, Boston University. **ELLIOT BARTKY** is Adjunct Professor for the Program of Liberal Studies at the University of Notre Dame. **KEVIN M. CHERRY** is Assistant Professor in the Department of Politics at Saint Anselm College, Manchester, New Hampshire. **DOUGLAS KRIES** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Gonzaga University, Spokane, Washington. **MARC D. GUERRA** is Assistant Professor of Theology at Ave Maria University, Ave Maria, Florida. **THOMAS M. IZBICKI** is Librarian for Research and Instructional Services at Rutgers University Libraries. **SANFORD LAKOFF** is Professor Emeritus of Political Science at the University of California, San Diego. **JOSEPH COSGROVE** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Providence College in Rhode Island. **ROBERT J. LACEY** is Assistant Professor of Political Science & International Studies at Iona College. **BRUCE KUKLICK** is Roy F. and Jeannette P. Nichols Professor of American History at the University of Pennsylvania. **JAMES WALTON** is Professor Emeritus of English at the University of Notre Dame. **PERI E. ARNOLD** is Professor of Political Science at the University of Notre Dame. **SEAN J. SAVAGE** is Professor of Political Science at Saint

Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana. **GERALD MARA** is Executive Associate Dean, Graduate School of Arts and Sciences and Professorial Lecturer, Department of Government, Georgetown University. **CYNTHIA R. RUGELEY** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Texas Tech University.

Subscription Information: *The Review of Politics* (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly in February, May, August and November by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA/The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK for the University of Notre Dame. Annual subscription rates for Volume 71 (2009): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$116.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £66.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$105.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £56.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$111.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £60.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$36.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £18.00 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Editorial Office: All correspondence concerning submissions and manuscripts under review should be sent to *The Review of Politics*, University of Notre Dame, 547 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Phone: 574-631-6623. Email: ROP.Editor.1@nd.edu. Website: www.nd.edu/~rop

Abstracting and Indexing Information: Articles in *The Review of Politics* are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index; abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts; and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., Historical Abstracts, Social Science Index (also available in the electronic versions), Book Review Index, and International Bibliography of the Social Sciences.

Copyright © 2009 University of Notre Dame. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press, Rights and Permissions Manager, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA. For further information see <http://us.cambridge.org/information/rights/>.

Periodicals postage paid in New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Review of Politics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133 USA.

Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: the Item-Fee Code for the publication (0034-6705/09 \$9.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) provided that the appropriate remittance of \$9.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.