

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation
Volume 17, Number 4, Fall 1992

The University of Chicago Press

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation

Published by The University of Chicago Press

<i>Editors</i>	Arthur F. McEvoy Elizabeth Mertz Peter Siegelman
<i>Review Editor</i>	Howard S. Erlanger
<i>Associate Editors</i>	Karyl A. Kinsey Christopher L. Tomlins
<i>Managing Editor</i>	John Atkinson

Editorial Board

- Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Ian Ayres, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Donald Black, Professor of Sociology, University of Virginia
Erhard Blankenburg, Professor of Sociology of Law, Free University of Amsterdam
John Braithwaite, Professor of Law and Sociology, The Australian National University
Jane F. Collier, Professor of Anthropology, Stanford University
Phoebe C. Ellsworth, Professor of Law and Psychology, University of Michigan
Eliot L. Freidson, Professor of Sociology, New York University
Lawrence M. Friedman, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Hazel Genn, Professor of Law, Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London
Carol J. Greenhouse, Professor of Anthropology, Indiana University
Valerie P. Hans, Professor of Criminal Justice, University of Delaware
Earl Johnson, Jr., Associate Justice, California State Court of Appeal
Doreen McBarnet, Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Wolfson College, Oxford
Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Laura Nader, Professor of Anthropology, University of California-Berkeley
Judith Resnik, Professor of Law, University of Southern California
Daniel Rubinfeld, Professor of Economics, University of California-Berkeley
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Professor of Sociology, Brown University
Martin M. Shapiro, Professor of Law, University of California-Berkeley
Susan S. Silbey, Professor of Sociology, Wellesley College
David Sugarman, School of Law, Lancaster University
David M. Trubek, Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin
Barbara Yngvesson, Professor of Anthropology, Hampshire College
Michael Zander, Professor of Law, Department of Law, London School of Economics
-

Law & Social Inquiry

Volume 17, Number 4, Fall 1992

DEBATE: Do Lawyers Impair Economic Growth?

Do Lawyers Impair Economic Growth?	585
Charles R. Epp	
<i>Commentaries</i>	
Do Lawyers Impair Economic Growth?	625
Mancur Olson	
How Many Lawyers Does It Take to Change an Economy?	635
Ronald J. Gilson	
Lawyers and Economic Growth—A Red Herring?	645
Philip Keefer	
Law versus Economics?	653
Frank B. Cross	
Elevating the Debate on Lawyers and Economic Growth	659
Richard H. Sander	
The Optimum Number of Lawyers: A Reply to Epp	667
Stephen P. Magee	
<i>Rejoinder</i>	
Toward New Research on Lawyers and the Economy	695
Charles R. Epp	

REVIEW SECTION SYMPOSIUM

The Supreme Court and Social Change	
Reform Litigation on Trial	715
Michael W. McCann	
Hollow Hopes, Flypaper, and Metaphors	745
Malcolm M. Feeley	
Hollow Hopes and Other Aspirations: A Reply to Feeley and McCann	761
Gerald N. Rosenberg	

REVIEW ESSAYS

The Question That Killed Critical Legal Studies	779
Richard Michael Fischl	
<i>Review Commentary</i>	
The Faith Healers	821
Calvin R. Massey	
<i>Review Rejoinder</i>	
Privileged Positions	831
Richard Michael Fischl	
Subjects in Spite of Themselves: Legal Consciousness among Working-Class New Englanders	839
Susan F. Hirsch	

BOOK NOTES	859
-------------------	-----

INDEX TO VOLUME 17	873
---------------------------	-----

Publication Policy

The American Bar Foundation is an independent research institute committed to socio-legal research. Consistent with its mandate to create and disseminate knowledge about law, the legal profession, and legal institutions, *Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation* invites the submission of articles that make original contributions to understanding of socio-legal processes. *Law and Social Inquiry* publishes both empirical and theoretical studies from a variety of disciplinary perspectives. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions are those of the authors alone.

Manuscript Evaluation: *Law and Social Inquiry* is a refereed journal. Manuscripts that the Editors deem appropriate for the journal are evaluated by two or more reviewers with expertise in the relevant subject matter and methodology. Manuscripts produced by ABF research fellows are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

Submission of Manuscripts: Manuscripts submitted to *Law and Social Inquiry* should be typed double-spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. The review process is anonymous; all identifying information should appear only on a separate cover sheet and not in the body of the manuscript.

Law and Social Inquiry does not accept multiply submitted articles. The Editors endeavor to make decisions promptly, usually about two months after submission.

Editing of Manuscripts: All manuscripts accepted for publication are edited for style by professional copyeditors in consultation with the author. Copyeditors do not check citations. Authors see edited manuscripts and/or proofs.

Reprints to Authors: Without charge, we provide authors with 25 reprints of their article or essay or of the Review Symposium in which the essay appears. Additional reprints may be ordered at author's expense. Article authors receive 3 copies of the issue in which their contribution appears; review essay and book review authors receive 1 copy.

Republication Rights: The Foundation normally permits authors to republish their manuscripts in books or use their manuscripts after publication, but *Law and Social Inquiry* has the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The journal retains the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

Copying Beyond Fair Use: The code on the first page of a contribution in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the contribution may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to the Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

Comments and Responses: Comments on or responses to articles or review essays in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

Send article manuscripts to:

John Atkinson
Managing Editor
Law and Social Inquiry
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding
review essays to:

Howard S. Erlanger
Review Editor
Law and Social Inquiry
Institute for Legal Studies
Law School
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53706
(608) 263-7405

Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation is published quarterly by The University of Chicago Press.

Annual U.S. subscription rates:

	1 yr.	2 yr.	3 yr.
Individuals	\$36	\$66.25	\$91.80
Academic	\$29	\$53.35	\$73.95
Institutions	\$59	\$108.55	\$150.45

Outside U.S. please add a postage charge of \$6.00 per year to the U.S. rates. **Canadians please add** 7% GST tax to above rates as follows: One-year rates: Individuals \$2.52; Academic \$2.03; Institutions \$4.13. Two-year rates: Individuals \$4.63; Academic \$3.73; Institutions \$7.59. Three-year rates: Individuals \$6.42; Academic \$5.17; Institutions \$10.53.

Single copies: \$14.75 for institutions, \$9.00 for individuals; available from Fred B. Rothman & Company, 10368 West Centennial Road, Littleton, Colorado 80127. (303) 979-5657

Volumes available in microfilm from University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

© 1993 American Bar Foundation. All rights reserved.

Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation (ISSN: 0897-6546) is published quarterly—winter, spring, summer, and fall—by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 South Woodlawn Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Second-class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and at additional mailing office.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: *Law and Social Inquiry*, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

From the Editors

With this issue, we initiate our term as joint editors of *Law & Social Inquiry*. We begin with an expression of appreciation and gratitude to the outgoing editor, Terence Halliday, for his outstanding work in helping to move the journal to its current position at the cutting edge of law and society scholarship. Terry's contribution has been widely recognized, as attested to by unsolicited commentary from some of the leading figures in the field, who wrote us to say that *LSI* "has assumed . . . the premier status as a vehicle for social scientific inquiry about law" (Susan Silbey) and that *LSI* is now "quite simply one of the best English language periodicals in the area of law and society" (David Sugarman). In 1985, Terry and Rayman Solomon began joint editorship of the articles section of the journal, working to broaden the disciplinary range both of its contributors and its readership. In the last five years, under Terry's sole leadership, the articles section of the journal developed a still broader base, earning a reputation for maintaining high scholarly standards while publishing daring and innovative work. In 1990 the journal became a University of Chicago Press publication. A key component of *LSI*'s success has been its Review Section, which owes its high level of quality and quantity to the energy and critical insight of Howard Erlanger of the University of Wisconsin Law School. We thank Terry, Howie, and Ray for the hard work that left us in the enviable position of building upon the considerable base they have created for the journal.

We see the basic editorial philosophy of *LSI* in much the same way that Terry Halliday did: to publish the best work in law and social science, including both empirical and theoretical articles, from the full variety of perspectives that constitute the law and society community. We plan to continue to develop the journal as a forum for debate, innovative approaches, well-grounded theoretical studies, and interesting empirical work on law and society. We will also, of course, maintain the exacting peer review process that has helped to guarantee high standards of scholarship for the journal. We can offer authors a relatively quick turnaround time and, especially for younger scholars, the opportunity to work closely with the editors on polishing the substantive and structural aspects of

their work. We have developed an unusually interactive revise-and-resubmit policy for articles judged by reviewers to be very promising but not yet ready for publication. It is our hope that this policy will ensure that good work receives every possible opportunity of being polished and published. In addition, we plan on including more symposia and debate or commentary sections. This issue features a fascinating debate on the role of lawyers in promoting or retarding economic growth—built around an empirical article by Charles Epp—with a variety of distinguished participants. Plans are under way for symposia on the legal treatment of violence against women, on law and the problem of “lustration” (attempts on the part of new governments to purge or punish the wrongdoers of previous regimes), and on lawyers’ role in the creation of new legal devices. We welcome proposals for other symposia, as well as suggestions as to how the journal might best enhance, encourage, and enliven current sociolegal scholarship. Commentaries and brief reactions to pieces that we have already published will be appearing in the journal when we feel that they advance the discussion in a particular area.

The editors have also been at work for some time now on plans for a new department that will feature review articles akin to the “annual review” essays published in other social science fields. These review articles will provide critical overviews of areas of scholarship, providing our readership with accessible and theoretically informed overviews of complex literatures. Please watch for a more in-depth announcement about this new department in an upcoming issue. We are eager to hear from scholars who would be interested in participating in this new department.

We welcome two new associate editors to the journal: Karyl Kinsey, a social psychologist known for her work in the tax compliance area, and Christopher Tomlins, a renowned labor law historian. We look forward with great anticipation to working with Karyl, Chris, and Howard Erlanger in developing *Law & Social Inquiry* still further as an outlet for exciting and important scholarship in sociolegal studies.

Acknowledgments to Reviewers

The Editors wish to thank the following reviewers whose careful evaluations and helpful recommendations have greatly assisted us in selecting manuscripts for Volume 17 of *Law and Social Inquiry*. We are grateful for their willingness to provide their expertise in furthering our efforts to ensure the publication of high-quality contributions to sociolegal scholarship.

Lori Andrews	Herbert Hovenkamp	David Rothman
Ian Ayres	Alan Hunt	Diana Russell
Benoit Bastard	Herbert Kritzer	Richard Sander
Michael Bell	E. Allan Lind	Austin Sarat
John Brigham	Kristen Luker	John Scholz
A. W. Coats	Stephen P. Magee	Susan Silbey
Sara Cobb	Doreen McBarnett	Stephen Skowronek
John Comaroff	Richard McGahey	Kent W. Smith
John Conley	Kathleen McGaw	Clyde Spillinger
Robert Cooter	Thomas McGraw	John Sutton
Kenneth Dau-Schmidt	John Mendeloff	Randall Thomas
Robert Destro	Fred Myers	Christopher L. Tomlins
Yves Dezalay	Robert Nelson	Tom Tyler
John Donohue	William O'Barr	Charles Van Onselen
William L. F. Felstiner	James R. O'Connor	Barrick Van Winkle
Paul Fenn	Thomas Palay	David Van Zandt
William Forbath	Richard Posner	Douglas Weiner
Nancy Fraser	Leslie Reagan	Catherine Wells
Mary Ann Glendon	Sean Redding	Robin West
Carol Heimer	Carol Rose	Joan Williams
Allan V. Horwitz	Robert Rosen	Barbara Yngvesson

CALL FOR PAPERS

Problems of Lustration

Lustration (from Latin, *lustrare*, to purify) is a word that seems to have first been used in Eastern Europe to describe a democratic polity's attempt to deal with evildoers who were acting on behalf of the state under a previous nondemocratic regime. Thus, what to do with KGB agents in Russia? What to do with torturers in South Africa, Argentina, or any country where a democratic state has succeeded a repressive one?

Law and Social Inquiry, a quarterly journal of sociolegal scholarship, is sponsoring a symposium on lustration, in an attempt to examine the issue through a variety of lenses. We would like to see it addressed as an issue of jurisprudence; as a problem of politics (what factors allow this process to go forward in certain countries and not in others; is it a good idea for fledgling democracies to take on their once-powerful internal enemies?); as a question in moral philosophy; as a problem of criminology; and as a sociological question—what does it mean for a society/polity to purify itself? Are there tensions between “purification” and democracy, or simply democratic and nondemocratic means of purification? We are open, as well, to broader questions. For example, does the problem of lustration occur whenever a society is asked to confront its own past injustices (as might occur, for example, when aboriginal inhabitants demand reparations for land taken by a colonial state)? All approaches, from positivist to post-modern, are welcome.

We would like to see initial abstracts describing work in progress by July 15, 1993. The deadline for completed submissions will be November 1, 1993. All submissions will be peer reviewed, following standard journal policy.

PLEASE SEND SUBMISSIONS OR QUESTIONS TO:

Peter Siegelman
Law and Social Inquiry
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611

FAX: (312) 988-6579
PHONE: (312) 988-6520