

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 27 NUMBER 1 2001

ARTICLES

**CONSUMER CHOICE AND THE
MANAGED CARE BACKLASH**

Alain C. Enthoven
Helen H. Schauffler
Sara McMenamin

**A RIGHT TO PERSONAL ASSISTANCE
SERVICES: "MOST INTEGRATED SETTING
APPROPRIATE" REQUIREMENTS AND
THE INDEPENDENT LIVING MODEL OF
LONG-TERM CARE**

Andrew I. Batavja

**RIGHTS DISCOURSE AND ASSISTED
SUICIDE**

Penney Lewis

NOTES AND COMMENTS

**FDA REGULATION: AN ANSWER TO
THE QUESTIONS OF HUMAN CLONING
AND GERMLINE GENE THERAPY**

Christine Willgoos

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS
AND THE BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

A JOURNAL OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE (AJLM) is published by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and Boston University School of Law (BUSL). All decisions concerning the content of AJLM are made by a joint ASLME-BUSL editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or BUSL.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: 617-353-2912.

Address subscription or membership correspondence to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 15. Fax: 617-437-7596. Requests for permission to reproduce AJLM material should be addressed to the Managing Editor, at the preceding address. Telephone: 617-262-4990 ext. 13. Fax: 617-437-7596.

AJLM subscriptions are \$195 per year for institutions and \$105 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. All foreign subscribers must remit an additional \$35 per year for foreign postage fees. ASLME members receive AJLM as part of their member benefits. AJLM is published quarterly: Spring; Summer & Fall (double issue); and Winter.

Missing copies of AJLM will be sent free of charge to ASLME subscribers or members, provided that notice of such a claim is received by ASLME *within one month of receipt of the next issue published*. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$40 (members) and \$50 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$55 (members) and \$65 (nonmembers).

AJLM is available on-line, indexed or abstracted, in *LEXIS*, *Westlaw*, *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *MedWebPlus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *SSRN Health Law & Policy*, and *EMBASE/Excerpta Medica*.

Library of Congress Catalog No. 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (non-profit organization).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JON WESTLING, LL.D. (hon.), *President and Professor of Humanities*

JOHN R. SILBER, M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), *Chancellor, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

RONALD A. CASS, J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, LL.B., *Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law*

STEPHEN MARX, J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law*

DANIEL J. FREEHLING, J.D., *Associate Dean for Administration and Professor of Law*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS

RUTH MICKELSEN, J.D., M.P.H., *President*

SARA ROSENBAUM, J.D., *Secretary*

KEITH GHEZZI, M.D., *Treasurer*

PHILIP REILLY, J.D., M.D., *Immediate Past President*

BENJAMIN W. MOULTON, J.D., M.P.H., *Executive Vice President*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D. (dec.), *Founder and First President*

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD OF EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

**FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
EMERITUS AND FOUNDER**
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

MANAGING EDITOR
Kelly A.M. Bowdren, J.D.
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

MEMBERSHIP DIRECTOR
Sarah Black
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT
Benjamin W. Moulton, J.D., M.P.H.
American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

EDITORS

Gail B. Agrawal, J.D., M.P.H.
University of North Carolina School of Law

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Barry A. Bloch, J.D.
Hollowell, Peacock & Meyer, Raleigh

Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Private Practice
Boston, Massachusetts

Jay A. Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

Ernest M. Haddad, Esq.
Partners HealthCare System, Inc., Boston

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, LL.B.
University of Pittsburgh,
Graduate School of Public Health

David A. Hyman, M.D., J.D.
University of Maryland School of Law

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D.
Harvard University
Kennedy School of Government

Timothy S. Jost, J.D.
Ohio State University College of Law

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale University Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

David T. Morris, J.D.
Latham & Watkins, San Francisco

Joseph P. Newhouse, Ph.D.
Harvard Medical School Department of Health Care Policy

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Washington School of Medicine

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida

Arti K. Rai, J.D.
University of San Diego Law School

Philip R. Reilly, M.D., J.D.
Shriver Center for Mental Retardation

Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D.
Indiana University School of Public & Envtl. Affairs

Mark A. Rothstein, J.D.
University of Houston Law Center

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B.
Medical College of Wisconsin

David S. Szabo, J.D.
Nutter, McClennen & Fish, LLP, Boston

Linda V. Tiano, Esq.
Empire Blue Cross Blue Shield

Sidney D. Watson, J.D.
Mercer University School of Law

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
St. Francis Central Hospital

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
AEGON, Monumental Life Insurance Company

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Koichi Bai

Director, Institute of Medical Humanities
Kitasato University School of Medicine
Japan

Erwin Deutsch

Faculty of Law
University of Göttingen
Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.

Faculties of Law and Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

S.S. Fluss

World Health Organization
Switzerland

Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby

President, Court of Appeal
Supreme Court of New South Wales
Australia

H.J.J. Leenen

Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Christopher Newdick

Reader in Health Law
University of Reading
England

Amos Shapira

Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

P.D.G. Skegg

Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

M.A.M. Wachter

Director, Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS FOR
2000–2001

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Jamison R. Narbaitz

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Kristin O'Connell

MANAGING EDITORS

Joanna Bergmann

Amanda Kessel

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Tony Maida

PROJECTS EDITOR

Stefanie McNamara

ARTICLES EDITORS

Jennifer Doran

Ryan Engle

Kathleen Gabriel

Janett Patiero

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Nieve Anjomi

Allyson Behm

Melissa Freiling

Alex Lycoyannis

Peter J. Van Hemel

THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

Emily Babalas

Adrienne Chieng

Lucille Ferreira

Gregory Hayken

Sharon Hussong

Kapono Kiakona

Deborah Lavoie

Kurt Machemer

Matthew Morton

Savitha Reddy

Shaun Ryan

Jennifer Serafyn

Diane Serritella

Thuy Wagner

Cara Weddleton

Christine Willgoos

Alina B. Zanetti

STAFF MEMBERS

Melissa Arnold

Jennings Aske

Randi Burnstine

Michele Carlucci

Nicole Castagna

Andrea Curti

Edward F. Dombroski, Jr.

Kerry Dunne

Cara Feldberg

Taruna Garg

Aviva Halpern

Jodie Hamill

John Hofmann

Brian Holohan

Sabre Kaszynski

Danielle Krause

Laura Martin

Elizabeth McGinty

William Mekrut

Ruth Miller

Francine Murray

Catherine Olender

Ian Prior

Vineetha Reddy

Kathleen Romanow

Tal Sapeika

Sarah Smegal

Amy Stewart

Thomas Utzinger

Nicholas Vegliante

Angela Verrecchio

Mary Katherine Welti

Brian Winner

Mary Zendran

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 27 NUMBER 1 2001

ARTICLES

- | | | |
|--|----|--|
| CONSUMER CHOICE AND THE
MANAGED CARE BACKLASH | 1 | Alain C. Enthoven
Helen H. Schauffler
Sara McMenamin |
| A RIGHT TO PERSONAL ASSISTANCE
SERVICES: "MOST INTEGRATED SETTING
APPROPRIATE" REQUIREMENTS AND
THE INDEPENDENT LIVING MODEL
OF LONG-TERM CARE | 17 | Andrew I. Batavia |
| RIGHTS DISCOURSE AND ASSISTED
SUICIDE | 45 | Penney Lewis |

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- | | | |
|---|-----|--------------------|
| FDA REGULATION: AN ANSWER TO
THE QUESTIONS OF HUMAN CLONING
AND GERMLINE GENE THERAPY | 101 | Christine Willgoos |
|---|-----|--------------------|

RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN HEALTH LAW

- | | | |
|-------------------------------|-----|--|
| SELECT RECENT COURT DECISIONS | 125 | |
|-------------------------------|-----|--|

Copyright 2001 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc., and Boston University School of Law. All rights reserved. For permission to photocopy articles or other materials appearing in the AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, contact Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers MA 01923; tel. 978-750-8400; fax 978-750-4470; or contact the Managing Editor, American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Ste. 1634, Boston MA 02215; tel. 617-262-4990 ext. 13; fax 617-437-7596; email kbowdren@aslme.org.