# A MINIMAX EQUALITY RELATED TO THE LONGEST DIREGTED PATH IN AN AGYCLIC GRAPH 

K. VIDYASANKAR AND D. H. YOUNGER

1. Introduction. As an analog of a recently established minimax equality for directed graphs [1], I. Simon has suggested that the following be investigated.
1.1. For a finite acyclic directed graph $G$, a minimum collection of directed coboundaries whose union is the edge set of $G$ has cardinality equal to that of $a$ maximum strong matching of $G$.

This minimax equality is here proved, using a characterization of a maximum strong matching of an acyclic graph as the set of edges of a longest directed path in the graph.

The terms employed in the above theorem are defined as follows. Let $G$ be a finite directed graph with vertex set $V G$ and edge set eG. For each edge $\alpha$, one of its ends is specified the positive end $p \alpha$, the other the negative end $n \alpha$. For a subset $X$ of $V G$, coboundary $\delta_{G} X$, or simply $\delta X$, is the set of edges each with one end in $X$ and the other in $V G-X$. If each edge has its positive end in $X$, then $\delta X$ is outdirected; if each edge has its negative end in $X$, then $\delta X$ is indirected; in either case, $\delta X$ is a directed coboundary. A strong matching is a set of edges no two of which lie in the same directed coboundary. A set is minimum with a given property if it has that property but no set with smaller cardinality has that property; on the other hand, a set with a given property is minimal if no proper subset has the property. "Maximum" and "maximal" are defined analogously.
2. Maximum strong matching and a longest directed path. A directed path from a to b in directed graph $G$ is a finite sequence ( $v_{0}, \alpha_{1}, v_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \ldots, \alpha_{n}, v_{n}$ ), whose terms are alternately vertices $v_{i}$ and edges $\alpha_{j}$, such that each edge $\alpha_{j}$ has positive end $v_{j-1}$ and negative end $v_{j}$. The origin $v_{0}$ is equal to $a$, the terminus $v_{n}$ is equal to $b$. Let $a \rightarrow b$ denote the existence in $G$ of a directed path from $a$ to $b$. The set of edges in path $\pi$ is denoted $e \pi$. The length of path $\pi$ is equal to $n$, the subscript on the terminus $v_{n}$; for an acyclic graph and a directed path, $|e \pi|=n$. A longest directed path is one of maximum length.
2.1. For any two distinct edges of an acyclic graph, there is a directed path that contains them both if and only if there is no directed coboundary that contains them both.

Received September 12, 1973.

Proof. For $\alpha$ and $\beta$ distinct edges in acyclic graph $G$, let $X_{\alpha}$ equal $\{x \in V G: x \rightarrow p \alpha\}$ and let $X_{\beta}$ equal $\{x \in V G: x \rightarrow p \beta\}$.

Consider first the case in which no directed path contains both $\alpha$ and $\beta$. Then $n \alpha$ and $n \beta$ each lie in $V G-X_{\alpha} \cup X_{\beta}$, whence $\alpha$ and $\beta$ each lie in $\delta\left(X_{\alpha} \cup X_{\beta}\right)$, which is an outdirected coboundary, since each of $\delta X_{\alpha}$ and $\delta X_{\beta}$ is outdirected.

Consider next the case in which $\alpha$ and $\beta$ lie in the same directed path. Then either $n \alpha \rightarrow p \beta$ or $n \beta \rightarrow p \alpha$; adjust notation if necessary so that $n \alpha \rightarrow p \beta$. Suppose that some directed coboundary $\delta X$ contains both $\alpha$ and $\beta$; choose $X$ so that $\delta X$ is outdirected. Since $n \alpha \in V G-X, p \beta \in X$ and $n \alpha \rightarrow p \beta$, there is some edge with positive end in $V G-X$ and negative end in $X$, in contradiction to $\delta X$ outdirected. So no directed coboundary $\delta X$ contains both $\alpha$ and $\beta$. The proof is complete.
2.2. In an acyclic graph $G, a$ set $m$ of edges is a strong matching if and only if there is a directed path in $G$ that contains all the elements of $m$.
Proof. Any subset of the edge set of a directed path is a strong matching by 2.1. To prove the converse, assume that $m$ is a strong matching. The proof proceeds by induction on $|m|$, the cardinality of $m$. For $|m|$ equal to 0 or 1 , the assertion holds trivially. For $|m|$ equal to 2, it follows from 2.1. For $|m|$ greater than 2 , assume as induction hypothesis that the assertion holds for each proper subset of $m$. For $\alpha$ in $m$, let $m^{\prime}$ equal $m-\{\alpha\}$. There is a directed path $\pi^{\prime}$ such that $m^{\prime} \subseteq e \pi^{\prime}$. Let $\alpha_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \ldots, \alpha_{k}$ be the edges of $m^{\prime}$, arranged in order of their occurrence as edge-terms of $\pi^{\prime}$; then $n \alpha_{i-1} \rightarrow p \alpha_{j}$ for each $i$ between 1 to $k$. Since $\alpha$ does not lie in the same directed coboundary as any of the edges of $m^{\prime}$, thus by 2.1 either $n \alpha_{i} \rightarrow p \alpha$ or $n \alpha \rightarrow p \alpha_{i}$ for each $i$ between 0 and $k$. Say that $\alpha_{i}$ precedes $\alpha$ if $n \alpha_{i} \rightarrow p \alpha$ and that $\alpha_{i}$ succeeds $\alpha$ if $n \alpha \rightarrow p \alpha_{i}$. If $\alpha_{0}$ succeeds $\alpha$ or if $\alpha_{k}$ precedes $\alpha$, then the assertion follows directly. Assume that $\alpha_{0}$ precedes $\alpha$ and $\alpha_{k}$ succeeds $\alpha$. There must then exist a subscript $i$ such that $\alpha_{i-1}$ precedes $\alpha$ and $\alpha_{i}$ succeeds $\alpha$. That is, there is a directed path from $n \alpha_{i-1}$ to $p \alpha_{i}$ that includes $\alpha$; call that path $\pi_{\alpha}$. Let path $\pi$ be obtained from $\pi^{\prime}$ by replacing the segment of $\pi^{\prime}$ from $n \alpha_{i-1}$ to $p \alpha_{i}$ by $\pi_{\alpha}$. Then $\pi$ is a directed path such that $m \subseteq e \pi$; this is the asserted path.

Proposition 2.2 has the following corollary.
2.3. A set $m$ of edges in acyclic graph $G$ is a maximum strong matching if and only if $m$ is the edge set of a longest directed path in $G$.

## 3. A minimax equality.

3.1. For a finite acyclic graph $G$, a minimum collection of directed coboundaries whose union is the edge set of $G$ has cardinality equal to the length of a longest directed path in $G$.

Proof. For any collection $D$ of directed coboundaries whose union is $e G$ and
any directed path $\pi,|D| \geqq|e \pi|$. Hence it suffices to show that there is a pair $D$ and $\pi$ such that $|D|=|e \pi|$. Such a path $\pi$ must be a longest directed path in $G$ and so its origin must be a source, i.e. a vertex not the negative end of any edge in $G$.

The proof proceeds by induction on the length of a longest directed path $\pi$. If $|e \pi|=0$, then the null set is the required collection $D$. Assume that $|e \pi|=$ $k>0$ and, as induction hypothesis, that the assertion holds for all acyclic graphs in which the length of a longest directed path is at most $k-1$. Let $S$ be the set of source vertices in $G$; then $\delta S$ is an outdirected coboundary in $G$. Let $G^{\prime}$ be the subgraph of $G$ obtained by deleting each vertex of $S$ and its incident edges.

Of course, $G^{\prime}$ is acyclic. Moreover, a longest directed path in $G^{\prime}$ has length one less than that of a longest directed path in $G$, since the origin of the latter must lie in $S$. By the induction hypothesis, there is a collection $D^{\prime}$ of directed coboundaries in $G^{\prime}$ whose union is $e G^{\prime}$, such that $\left|D^{\prime}\right|$ is equal to the length of a longest directed path $\pi^{\prime}$ in $G^{\prime}$. Expressing each element of $D^{\prime}$ as an outdirected coboundary $\delta_{G^{\prime}} X$, let $D$ equal

$$
\left\{\delta_{G} S\right\} \cup\left\{\delta_{G}(S \cup X): \delta_{G^{\prime}} X \in D^{\prime}\right\}
$$

Each coboundary in $D$ is outdirected. Moreover, since $\delta_{G^{\prime}} X \subseteq \delta_{G}(S \cup X)$, thus $\cup D=\delta S \cup e G^{\prime}=e G$. Finally, $|D|=\left|D^{\prime}\right|+1=\left|e \pi^{\prime}\right|+1=|e \pi|$, for $\pi$ a longest directed path in $G$. Consequently the assertion holds for $G$. By induction, 3.1 holds generally.

Implicit in the proof just given is an algorithm for finding a minimum collection $D$ and a longest directed path $\pi$. The number of execution steps in

that algorithm is bounded above by some fairly small power of the number of edges and vertices in the graph.

Theorem 1.1 follows directly from 3.1 and 2.3 .
It is natural to ask whether replacement of "directed coboundary" by "minimal nonnull directed coboundary" in the statement of Theorem 1.1, and in the definition of strong matching, yields another valid proposition. That this is not the case is shown by the counterexample pictured in Figure 1.

In the graph shown there, $\left\{\alpha_{1}, \beta_{1}\right\}$ is a maximum set of edges no two of which lie in the same minimal nonnull directed coboundary. On the other hand, a minimum collection of minimal nonnull directed coboundaries whose union contains every edge of $G$ has cardinality 3 . The observation that this variant is invalid was first made by G. N. Robertson.

## Reference

1. C. L. Lucchesi and D. H. Younger, A minimax theorem for directed graphs (to appear).

University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario

