

NUMBER 52 FALL 1997

International Labor and Working-Class History



WOMEN,
WORK
AND
CITIZENSHIP



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

INTERNATIONAL LABOR AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY

Founded by
Robert F. Wheeler

EDITORS

Helmut Gruber
Polytechnic University

Louise A. Tilly
*New School for
Social Research*

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Guy Baldwin
*New School for
Social Research*

ISSUE COORDINATOR

Helmut Gruber

EDITORIAL BOARD

Dorothy Sue Cobble
Rutgers University

Lizabeth Cohen
New York University

Geoffrey Field
*State University of
New York, Purchase*

Michael Hanagan
*New School for
Social Research*

Victoria Hattam
*New School for
Social Research*

Ira Katznelson
Columbia University

Stephen Kotkin
Princeton University

Bruce Levine
University of Cincinnati

David Montgomery
Yale University

Mary Nolan
New York University

Anson Rabinbach
Princeton University

Philip Scranton
*Rutgers University,
Camden*

Judith Stein
*City College
of New York*

Barbara Weinstein
SUNY, Stony Brook

International Labor and Working-Class History (ISSN 0147-5479) is published twice yearly, in the spring and the fall, by Cambridge University Press for the editors of *ILWCH*. Additional support is provided by the New School for Social Research. Annual subscription rates for Numbers 51 and 52, 1997: Institutional US \$43.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £32.00 in the rest of the world; Individual US \$21.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £17.00 in the rest of the world; Single parts US \$23.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico, UK £17.00 in the rest of the world. Prices include surface postage. Add UK £8.00 for airmail.

International Labor and Working-Class History is indexed in Sociological Abstracts; ABC-CLIO; The Left Index; and Alternative Press Index.

Editorial Office: Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be addressed to Editor, *ILWCH*, Center for Studies of Social Change, New School for Social Research, 80 Fifth Avenue, Fifth Floor, New York, NY 10011. Tel. (212) 229-5921; Fax (212) 229-5929; INTERNET: ILWCH@NEWSCHOOL.EDU.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Offices: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England.

Copyright © 1997 International Labor and Working-Class History, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the USA: The Item-Fee Code for this publication (ISSN 0147-5479/97 \$7.50 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the US Copyright Law is authorized for duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$7.50 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. The Board of Consulting Editors may be found immediately following the contents. See the back of the journal for information concerning submissions to the journal.

Cover photo: J. Howard Miller, *We Can Do It*. National Archives and Record Administration. Rosie the Riveter: War & Conflict #798 (Poster for the War Production Board).

**SCHOLARLY CONTROVERSY: WOMEN, WORK,
AND CITIZENSHIP**

Women, Work, and Citizenship <i>Louise A. Tilly</i>	1
Reply: Citizenship Is Context-Specific <i>Chiara Saraceno</i>	27
Reply: Citizenship, Policy, and the Political Construction of Gender Interests <i>Ann Shola Orloff</i>	35
Reply: More Similar or More Different? <i>Roderick Phillips</i>	51
Reply: Case Studies Enough for a General Model? <i>W. Robert Lee</i>	58

ARTICLES

Workers of the World, Consume: Ira Steward and the Origins of Labor Consumerism <i>Lawrence Glickman</i>	72
The Colonial State and Wage Labor in Postwar Sierra Leone, 1945–1960: Attempts at Remaking the Working Class <i>Ibrahim Abdullah</i>	87
Copper Workers, Organized Labor, and Popular Protest under Military Rule in Chile, 1973–1986 <i>Thomas Miller Klubock</i>	106

REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

Ball and Chain: An International Conference Exploring the Boundaries of Freedom and Coercion <i>Alex Lichtenstein</i>	134
American Historical Association Annual Meeting <i>Dorothy Sue Cobble, Belinda Davis, Teal Rothschild, and Louise A. Tilly</i>	137

North American Labor History Conference <i>Kathleen A. Brown and Gigi Peterson</i>	143
The Fight for America's Future: A Teach-In with the Labor Movement <i>Teal Rothschild, William Milberg, and Danny Rosenberg</i>	146
Between Classes: A Conference on Academic Labor <i>Guy Baldwin</i>	151

BOOK REVIEWS

Robert McC. Adams, <i>Paths of Fire: An Anthropologist's Inquiry into Western Technology</i> Reviewed by Gary Cross	155
Mahmood Mamdani, <i>Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism</i> Reviewed by Frederick Cooper	156
William E. French, <i>A Peaceful and Working People: Manners, Morals, and Class Formation in Northern Mexico</i> Reviewed by Gregory S. Crider	160
Aviva Chomsky, <i>West Indian Workers and the United Fruit Company in Costa Rica, 1870–1940</i> Reviewed by Alejandro de la Fuente	164
Reginald E. Zelnik, <i>Law and Disorder on the Narova River</i> Reviewed by Robert E. Johnson	166
Christopher Read, <i>From Tsar to Soviets: The Russian People and Their Revolution, 1917–21</i> Reviewed by Laura L. Phillips	169
Judy Kutulas, <i>The Long War: The Intellectual People's Front and Anti-Stalinism, 1930–1940</i> Reviewed by Maurice Isserman	171
Alfred Eberlein, <i>Internationale Bibliographie zur deutschsprachigen Presse der Arbeiter- und sozialen Bewegungen von 1830–1982</i> , 2nd ed., 8 vols. Reviewed by Gerd Callesen	173
Gisela Diewald-Kerkmann, <i>Politische Denunziation im NS-Regime: Oder Die kleine Macht der "Volksgenossen"</i> Reviewed by Walter Struve	176
Atina Grossmann, <i>Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform, 1920–1950</i> Reviewed by Jane Caplan	180
Judith G. Coffin, <i>The Politics of Women's Work: The Paris Garment Trades, 1750–1915</i> Reviewed by Deborah Valenze	183

Roger V. Gould, <i>Insurgent Identities: Class, Community, and Protest from 1848 to the Commune</i> Reviewed by Kim Voss	186
François Furet, <i>Le passé d'une illusion. Essai sur l'idée communiste au xxe siècle</i> Reviewed by Charles Tilly	188
Mary Nash, <i>Defying Male Civilization: Women in the Spanish Civil War</i> Reviewed by Pamela Radcliff	190
Roberto Franzosi, <i>The Puzzle of Strikes: Class and State Strategies in Postwar Italy</i> Reviewed by Salvador Sandoval	193
Neville Kirk, <i>Labour and Society in Britain and the USA</i> , vol. 1: <i>Capitalism, Custom and Protest, 1780–1850</i> ; vol. 2, <i>Challenge and Accommodation, 1850–1939</i> Reviewed by Chris Wrigley	196
Pamela Sharpe, <i>Adapting to Capitalism: Working Women in the English Economy, 1700–1850</i> Reviewed by John Smal	199
Patrick Joyce, <i>Democratic Subjects: The Self and the Social in Nineteenth-Century England</i> Reviewed by Seth Koven	201
Owen Ashton, Robert Fyson, and Stephen Roberts, eds. <i>The Duty of Discontent: Essays for Dorothy Thompson</i> Reviewed by Walter L. Arnstein	205
Martin Hewitt, <i>The Emergence of Stability in the Industrial City: Manchester, 1832–67</i> Reviewed by Margot Finn	208
Alan Campbell, Nina Fishman, and David Howell, eds. <i>Miners, Unions and Politics, 1910–47</i> Reviewed by Edward May	210
Steven Fielding, Peter Thompson, and Nick Tiratsoo, “ <i>England Arise!</i> ”: <i>The Labour Party and Popular Politics in 1940s Britain</i> , and Sam Davies, <i>Liverpool Labour: Social and Political Influences on the Development of the Labour Party in Liverpool, 1900–1939</i> Reviewed by Kathleen Paul	213
David Frank and Gregory S. Kealey, eds., <i>Labour and Working-Class History in Atlantic Canada: A Reader</i> , and Gregory S. Kealey, <i>Workers and Canadian History</i> Reviewed by Laurel Sefton Macdowell	217

Paul A. Gilje, <i>Rioting in America</i> Reviewed by Janet L. Abu-Lughod	220
Howard B. Rock, Paul A. Gilje, and Robert Asher, eds., <i>American Artisans: Crafting Social Identity, 1750–1850</i> Reviewed by Stanley Nadel	222
Robert E. Weir, <i>Beyond Labor's Veil: The Culture of the Knights of Labor</i> Reviewed by David Montgomery	224
Stephanie J. Shaw, <i>What a Woman Ought to Be and Do: Black Professional Women Workers during the Jim Crow Era</i> Reviewed by Tera Hunter	227
William F. Hartford, <i>Where Is Our Responsibility? Unions and Economic Change in the New England Textile Industry, 1870–1960</i> Reviewed by Thomas Dublin	229
Dana Frank, <i>Purchasing Power: Consumer Organizing, Gender, and the Seattle Labor Movement, 1919–1929</i> Reviewed by Meg Jacobs	232
Gloria Garrett Samson, <i>The American Fund for Public Service: Charles Garland and Radical Philanthropy, 1922–1941</i> Reviewed by Gerald Zahavi	236
Mike Nielson and Gene Mailes, <i>Hollywood's Other Blacklist: Union Struggles in the Studio System</i> Reviewed by Steven Ross	239
Nelson Lichtenstein, <i>The Most Dangerous Man in Detroit: Walter P. Reuther and the Fate of American Labor</i> , Kevin Boyle, <i>The UAW and the Heyday of American Liberalism, 1945–1968</i> , and Stephen Amberg, <i>The Union Inspiration in American Politics: The Autoworkers and the Making of a Liberal Industrial Order</i> Reviewed by Thomas J. Sugrue	243
Peter B. Levy, <i>The New Left and Labor in the 1960s</i> Reviewed by David Plotke	248
Laurie Graham, <i>On the Line at Subaru-Isuzu: The Japanese Model and the American Worker</i> , Bruce Nissen, <i>Fighting for Jobs: Case Studies of Labor-Community Coalitions Confronting Plant Closings</i> , and Glenn Perusek and Kent Worcester, eds., <i>Trade Union Politics: American Unions and Economic Change, 1960s–1990s</i> Reviewed by Dexter Arnold	251
CURRENT RESEARCH	256
NEWS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS	268

BOARD OF CONSULTING EDITORS

Kathryn Amdur
Emory University

Gerd Callesen
*Arbejderbevaegelsens Bibliotek
og Arkiv, Copenhagen*

Frederick Cooper
University of Michigan

Patrizia Dogliani
University of Bologna

Geoff Eley
University of Michigan

Elizabeth Faue
Wayne State University

Patrick Fridenson
*Ecole des Hautes Etudes
en Sciences Sociales*

Andrew Gordon
Harvard University

Pat Hudson
University of Liverpool

Linda Kerber
University of Iowa

Alex Keyssar
Duke University

Nelson Lichtenstein
University of Virginia

Mary Jo Maynes
University of Minnesota

Louis Menashe
Polytechnic University

Ruth Milkman
University of California, Los Angeles

Lutz Niethammer
Kulturwissenschaftliches Institut, Essen

Pamela Radcliff
University of California, San Diego

Dilip Simeon
Independent scholar, Delhi

Ronald G. Suny
University of Michigan

Marcel van der Linden
*International Review of Social History,
Amsterdam*

Adelheid von Saldern
Universität Hannover

Sean Wilentz
Princeton University

J. M. Winter
*Pembroke College, Cambridge
University*

Sergei Zhuravlev
Institut Rossiiskoi Istorii, Moscow