# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

### VOLUME XXI NUMBER 4 1995

### ARTICLES

BARRIERS TO FORGOING NUTRITION AND Alan Meisel Hydration in Nursing Homes

IMPLICATIONS OF NEGLIGENT SELECTION AND RETENTION OF PHYSICIANS IN THE AGE OF ERISA

Torin A. Dorros T. Howard Stone

### NOTES AND COMMENTS

HOME HIV TESTING AND CONFLICTS. William O. Fabbri With State HIV Testing Regulations

STATUTES AIDING STATES' RECOVERY Eli of Medicaid Costs from Tobacco Companies: A Better Strategy for Redressing an Identifiable Harm?

Elizabeth A. Frohlich

Published by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics and the Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer & Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint ASLME/Boston University School of Law editorial policy committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, ASLME, or the law school.

The editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see the inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Common-wealth Avenue, Suite 1672, Boston, MA 02215. Telephone: (617) 353-2912.

Subscription or membership correspondence should be addressed to the Membership Director, ASLME, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston, MA 02215. Business telephone: (617) 262-4990. Requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material should be addressed to the Director of Publications, at the preceding address.

Subscription rates are \$170.00 per year for institutions; and \$90.00 per year for individuals (payment for individual subscriptions must be on a personal check) who are not members of ASLME. Foreign subscribers should remit an additional \$30.00 per year for foreign postage. Members of ASLME receive the JOURNAL as part of their annual dues (please see details in the back matter).

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of ASLME provided that notice of such a claim is received at ASLME's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single-issue price of \$25.00 (members) and \$35.00 (nonmembers) and the regular double-issue price of \$40.00 (members) and \$50.00 (nonmembers).

Articles published in the JOURNAL are indexed in LEXIS, WESTLAW, Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588. U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (nonprofit organization).

### ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., LL.D. (hon.), L.H.D. (hon.), President, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

RONALD A. CASS, B.A., J.D., Dean and Professor of Law JOSEPH F. BRODLEY, B.A., LL.B., Senior Associate Dean for Research and Professor of Law JACK BEERMANN, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean and Professor of Law DANIEL J. FREEHLING, B.S., J.D., Associate Dean and Professor of Law CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs

### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW, MEDICINE & ETHICS**

SANDRA H. JOHNSON, J.D., LL.M., President ELLEN WRIGHT CLAYTON, M.D., J.D., President-Elect RUTH B. PURTILO, M.D., Secretary CINDY HYLTON RUSHTON, R.N., Treasurer ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., Immediate Past President MICHAEL VASKO, M.A. Managing Director ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., Founder and First President

## AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

#### **BOARD OF EDITORS**

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Frances H. Miller, J.D. Boston University School of Law

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A. DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS Michael Vasko, M.A. American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

CIRCULATION MANAGER T. Patrick Rewalt American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

MANAGING DIRECTOR Michael Vasko, M.A. American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics

#### EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D. Boston University School of Law

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D. Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D. Boston University School of Law

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M.Hyg. Harvard University School of Public Health

Lee J. Dunn Jr., J.D., LL.M. Dunn & Auton Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D. Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. Wisconsin Peer Review Organization

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D. Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D. University of Pittsburgh Grad. School of Public Health

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D. Hollowell & Silverstein Raleigh, North Carolina

Sheila Jasanoff, J.D., Ph.D. Comell University Prog. on Science Technology & Society

Timothy S. Jost, J.D. Ohio State University College of Law

Jay Katz, M.D. Yale University Law School

Renée M. Landers, J.D. Boston College Law School Sylvia A. Law, J.D. New York University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H. Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H. Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida Jacksonville, Florida

Marc A. Rodwin, J.D., Ph.D. Indiana University

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. Founder, American Society of Law & Medicine

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D. New York Law School

Sidney Shindell, M.D., LL.B. Medical College of Wisconsin

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S. Tufts University

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A. University of Michigan Grad. School of Business Admin.

Paul R. Tremblay Boston College Law School

David G. Warren, J.D. Duke University Medical Center

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D. St. Francis Central Hospital Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

James G. Zimmerly, M.D., J.D., M.P.H. Monumental Life Insurance Co. of AGON

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

#### INTERNATIONAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Professor Koichi Bai Director, Institute of Medical Humanities Kitasato University School of Medicine Japan

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch Faculty of Law University of Göttingen Germany

Professor Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D. Faculties of Law and Medicine University of Toronto Canada

Dr. S.S. Fluss Chief, Health Legislation World Health Organization Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Dieter Giesen Inst. for International, Foreign and Comparative Law Freie Universität Berlin Germany Honorable Justice Michael D. Kirby President, Court of Appeal Supreme Court of New South Wales Australia

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde Universiteit van Amsterdam The Netherlands

Professor Amos Shapira Faculty of Law Tel Aviv University Israel

Professor P.D.G. Skegg Faculty of Law University of Otago New Zealand

**Dr. M.A.M. Wachter** Director, Institute of Bioethics The Netherlands

## AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

#### AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS FOR 1995–1996

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Elizabeth A. Frohlich

EXECUTIVE EDITOR Nina M. Sas

MANAGING EDITORS Katy C. Li Guido S. Weber

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR Lorraine E. Jones

ARTICLES EDITORS William O. Fabbri Jessica Miller Thomas M. Rodrigues J. Page Turney

Jeannie M. Atwood Ira A. Azulay Jeffrey W. Barringer Regina A. Bigay Mia S. Blackler Brenda A. Buan

Mark B. Adler Harris T. Berenson Randi C. Berger Sara C. Bienkowski Cathleen Cachero Simon M. Canick Jenny H. Cho SuJin Cho Sara B. Davis Jeffrey P. Donohue Amir Dotan

### THIRD-YEAR EDITORS

William D. DeVaul Katherine E. Ellsworth Angelo Evangelou J. Vladimir Galiano Daniel J. Levy John J. Limb

### STAFF MEMBERS

Tammie C. Garner Cecelia A. Gassner John J. Goss Antonino G. Hernandez Matthew N. Kane Sarah C. Kellogg Cori LaCasa Carl B. Massey, Jr. Dianne McCarthy Brian P. McDonough Adam Michael PROJECTS EDITOR Victoria T. Ayer

CASE & NOTE EDITORS Joel J. Garris Katherine W. Ho Urvashi R. Paul Joseph Salama Ashley C. Stanley

> Michael M.J. Lin Sharon Miller Mark K. Molloy Christina L. Paradiso Sandra D. Strassner David B. Summer

Ashley E. Moller Nicole L. Patterson Ari B. Pollack Joan E. Reed L. Edward Ríos Tamara E. Russell Wayne M. Serra Thomas M. Simpson William H. Tobin Traci L. Vanek Charles Wachsstock

# **AMERICAN** JOURNAL OF LAW **& MEDICINE**

**VOLUME XXI NUMBER 4 1995** 

### ARTICLES

BARRIERS TO FORGOING NUTRITION AND HYDRATION IN NURSING HOMES	335	Alan Meisel
Implications of Negligent Selection and Retention of Physicians in the Age of ERISA	383	Torin A. Dorros T. Howard Stone
NOTES AND COMMENTS		
Home HIV Testing and Conflicts with State HIV Testing Regulations	419	William O. Fabbri
STATUTES AIDING STATES' RECOVERY OF MEDICAID COSTS FROM TOBACCO COMPANIES: A BETTER STRATEGY FOR REDRESSING AN IDENTIFIABLE HARM?	445	Elizabeth A. Frohli

### MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS	473
Selected Book Releases	485
Index	488
Announcements	489

Copyright 1995 by the American Society of Law, Medicine & Ethics, Inc. (ASLME) and the Boston University School of Law. Unless otherwise noted, the materials appearing herein may be copied for classroom use, provided that (1) the user notifies the Director of Publications of ASLME; (2) the author(s) and the American Journal of Law & Medicine are identified; and (3) the proper notice of copyrights is affixed to each copy.

Frohlich