Laryngology & Otology

cambridge.org/jlo

Editorial

Cite this article: Nunez DA. The JLO best paper prize - past and present. *J Laryngol Otol* 2020;**134**:283. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022215120000742

The JLO best paper prize - past and present

Desmond A Nunez, Assistant Editor and Chairman of JLO prize committee

The Journal of Laryngology and Otology annual best paper prize award was introduced in 2011 on the initiative of the then senior Editor Mr Guy Kenyon. Five awards were initially made one each under the headings of best review paper, best main article, best laboratorybased research article, best case report and best short communication. A panel of four of the journals' assistant editors review all papers published under the above headings and score them as previously described for importance to the field of Otolaryngology Head and Neck Surgery, the originality and quality of their content. The top ranked papers based on the judges' scores are then shortlisted for consideration at an adjudication meeting where additional editors' views are canvassed. At the adjudication meeting the prize-winning papers are selected by consensus. In the period 2010- 2018 the selection committee took into consideration the relative interest of the paper to a general crosssection of attendees at the annual JLO Spring meeting, the ease with which the paper would lend itself to an audiovisual presentation, and aimed to reflect a range of subspecialties including general otolaryngology and a diverse geographic range of origins of the corresponding authors to reflect the international standing of the journal. One of the authors from each prize-winning paper was required to present their findings at the JLO study day.

The judges moved to awarding only 2 prizes from the review and main article sections of the journal respectively from 2019 partly in response to a refocusing of the journal's content that decreased the number of case reports and short-communications published. A revision in the JLO study day format to focus more on trainee education in 2018 meant that the prize-winning authors were no longer required to present their findings at the study day from 2019 onwards. The best paper prizes in 2019 based on the content of volume 132 (2018) of the JLO were awarded to Tirelli et al for their review on Head and neck immunoglobulin G4 related disease² and to Integrate (the United Kingdom National ENT Trainee Research Network) for their main article paper on Epistaxis related mortality³.

The best paper prize judges in 2020 agreed to allocate the prizes to the best and the runner up paper regardless of subspecialty or if they were published in the review or main article sections of the journal. The prize paper selection changes introduced over the period 2018–2020 mean that the JLO best paper prize is now based primarily on the criteria of importance, originality and content. The likely impact of the paper on future otolaryngology practice is considered in the final selection of the winning papers from those short-listed. The paper titled - Value of patient-reported symptoms in the follow-up of patients potentially cured of laryngeal cancer by Brandstorp-Boesen J et al⁴ was awarded the best JLO paper prize, and "Urgent suspicion of cancer" referrals to a head and neck clinic - what do patients expect? by Montgomery J et al⁵ the runner up prize in 2020. The prize-winning authors are congratulated.

References

- Nunez D. The Journal of Laryngology and Otology best paper prize: 2011 scoring procedures. J Laryngol Otol 2011; 125: 1211–1211
- Tirelli G, Gardenal N, Gatto A, Quatela E, Del Piero GC. Head and neck immunoglobulin G4 related disease. J Laryngol Otol 2018; 132: 1046–1050
- Integrate (The National ENT Trainee Research Network). Epistaxis and mortality. J Laryngol Otol 2018; 132: 1061–106
- Brandstorp-Boesen J, Zatterstrom U, Evensen JF, Boysen M. Value pf patient-reported symptoms in the follow-up of patients potentially cured of laryngeal cancer. J Laryngol Otol 2019; 133: 508–514
- Montgomery J, Doughlas CM, Begbie F, Hitchings A, MacKenzie K. "Urgent suspicion of cancer" referrals to a head and neck clinic - what do patients expect? J Laryngol Otol 2019; 133: 782–7