

THE
JOURNAL
OF
LAW
AND
RELIGION



Volume X

1993-94

Number 2

Sponsored by:

Hamline University School of Law

Published by:

**Hamline University School of Law
ISSN: 0748-0814**

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME X

1993-94

NUMBER 2

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editors

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University, School of Law

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary

Managing Editor & Book Editor

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University, School of Law

Production Manager

JO ANNE MATSON

Editorial Assistants

ANDREA ATHERTON

ANDREW BERGER

LORI FERRIS

BRIAN HALL

SANDRA HILLER

MICHAEL HUBBARD

KRISTINE ISLE

JANE JACOBSON

EDITORIAL BOARD

THOMAS PORTER, Attorney at Law, Boston, Chair

FRANK ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law

AZIZAH Y. AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law

STEPHEN CARTER, Yale Law School

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law

EMILY FOWLER HARTIGAN, St. Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

CATHLEEN KAVENY, Attorney at Law, Boston

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary, St. Paul

RAYMOND R. KRAUSE, Hamline University School of Law

ROBIN LOVIN, Southern Methodist University

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee

MICHAEL J. PERRY, Northwestern University School of Law

MICHAEL SCHERSCHLIGT, Hamline University School of Law

DOUGLAS STURM, Bucknell University

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

RICHARD BAEPLER, Valparaiso University

HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law

JAMES BRESNAHAN, Northwestern University Medical School

LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law

FRED CARNEY, Southern Methodist University

ROGER CRAMTON, Cornell University School of Law

CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law

ALAN FREEMAN, State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law

MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University School of Law

LEIGH LERNER, Rabbi, Montreal

DAVID LITTLE, U.S. Institute of Peace

MARTIN MARTY, University of Chicago Divinity School

ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo School of Law

NOOR MOHAMMAD, University of Baltimore School of Law

ELIZABETH SCHUESSLER-FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School

THOMAS SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School

PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law

ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Minnesota Supreme Court

STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, St. Paul

The Journal of Law and Religion is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a nonprofit, nonpartisan publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$15 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$25 for institutions and \$10 for students. Add \$10 for foreign airmail service. Subscription requests, manuscripts and general correspondence should be addressed to:

Jo Anne Matson
Production Manager
The Journal of Law and Religion
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Book review manuscripts and books to be reviewed should be sent to:

Howard J. Vogel
Book Review Editor
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104

Commencing with Volume X, citations will conform to: *The University of Chicago Manual of Legal Citation* (1989) copyright by the University of Chicago. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on line on a variety of computer data base services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available online through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 10 J LAW & RELIG



A Subscription to the
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

- \$15.00 individual (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$25.00 individual (foreign air mail)
- \$25.00 institution (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$35.00 institution (foreign air mail)
- \$10.00 student

Production Manager
Journal of Law and Religion
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, Minnesota 55104

- Payment enclosed.
- Please bill me.
- Begin my subscription with vol. _____, number _____.

Name: _____

Street Address: _____

City & State: _____ Zip code: _____

ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire
back stock, reprint and
microform rights to the

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Complete sets to date
are now available. We
can also furnish single
volumes and issues.

WILLIAM S. HEIN & CO., INC.
1285 Main Street
Buffalo, New York 14209

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME X

1993-94

NUMBER 2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface vii

First Annual *Journal of Law and Religion* Award Ceremony

October 14, 1993

Thomas W. Porter, Jr.	First Annual <i>Journal of Law and Religion</i> Award to Thomas L. Shaffer	277
Edward McGlynn Gaffney, Jr.	In Praise of a Gentle Soul	279
Thomas L. Shaffer	How I Changed My Mind	291

Commentary on the Work of Thomas L. Shaffer

Marie A. Failinger	Gentleman as Hero: Atticus Finch and the Lonely Path.....	303
Emily Fowler Hartigan	The Gentleman Who Was Thursday.....	311
Howard Lesnick	Religious Particularity, Religious Metaphor, and Religious Truth: Listening to Tom Shaffer	317
John Howard Yoder	The Scholarship of Thomas L. Shaffer: A Retrospective and Response	331
Milner S. Ball	Out of the West Rides an Unmasked Stranger	339
Leslie E. Gerber	Can Lawyers Be Saved? The Theological Legal Ethics of Thomas Shaffer	347

Articles

Ellis M. West The Right to Religion-Based Exemptions in Early America: The Case of Conscientious Objectors to Conscription 367

Peter Mostow “Like Building on Top of Auschwitz”: On the Symbolic Meaning of Using Data from the Nazi Experiments, and on Non-Use as a Form of Memorial 403

John E. Witte, Jr. and Thomas C. Arthur The Three Uses of the Law: A Protestant Source of the Purposes of Criminal Punishment? 433

Hugh J. Breyer Laycock’s Substantive Neutrality and Nuechterlein’s Free Exercise Test: Implications of Their Convergence for the Religion Clauses . 467

Robert J. Araujo Contemporary Interpretation of the Religion Clauses: The Church and Caesar Engaged in Conversation 493

Robert F. Drinan, S.J. and Jennifer I. Huffman The Religious Freedom Restoration Act: A Legislative History 531

Carl H. Esbeck 1993 Survey of Trends and Developments on Religious Liberty in the Courts 543

Carl H. Esbeck Table of United States Supreme Court Decisions Relating to Religious Liberty 1789-1994 573

Book Review Essay

Keith J. Pavlischek *John Courtney Murray and the American Civil Conversation*, Robert P. Hunt and Kenneth L. Grasso, eds..... 589

Cumulative Index—Volumes 1-10—1983-1994 601