# INTERNATIONAL & COMPARATIVE LAW QUARTERLY

### **VOLUME 58**

### PART 1

## JANUARY 2009

#### ARTICLES

Equivocal Helpers – Complicit States, Mixed Messages and International Law Georg Nolte and Helmut Philipp Aust

From Horizontal and Vertical to Lateral: Extending the Effect of Human Rights in Post Colonial Legal Systems of the South Pacific Jennifer Corrin

Transitional Justice: A Future Truth Commission for Zimbabwe? Max du Plessis and Jolyon Ford

The British Bank Nationalizations: An International Law Perspective

N Jansen Calamita

#### SHORTER ARTICLES, COMMENTS AND NOTES

The Recommendations Made by the International Court of Justice: A Sceptical View Hugh Thirlway

Fluctuating Evidentiary Standards for Self-Defence in the International Court of Justice James A Green

Palm Tree Justice? The Role of Comparative Law in the South Pacific Sue Farran

Current Developments and Book Reviews-see back cover



British Institute of International and Comparative Law

# British Institute of International and Comparative Law

*President:* THE RT HON LORD GOFF OF CHIEVELEY DCL FBA Vice Presidents: SIR DAVID EDWARD KCMG QC LLD FRSE, LADY FOX QC, and HE JUDGE ROSALYN HIGGINS DBE QC

Chairman of the Institute: THE RT HON LORD BINGHAM OF CORNHILL KG

#### DIRECTOR

PROFESSOR ROBERT MCCORQUODALE

#### **BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

Chairman of the Board of Trustees: ALEXANDER LAYTON QC

DAVID ANDERSON OC PETER BARTON DL SIR FRANKLIN BERMAN KCMG OC THE RT HON LORD BINGHAM OF CORNHILL KG JEREMY CARVER CBE PROFESSOR CHRISTINE CHINKIN DIANA GOOD MICHAEL HUTCHINGS OBE THE RT HON SIR FRANCIS JACOBS KCMG OC PROFESSOR VAUGHAN LOWE JOHN MERRETT MARTIN PAISNER CBE LORD JUSTICE RIX PETER ROTH OC PROFESSOR PHILIPPE SANDS OC SIR MICHAEL WOOD KCMG

#### ADVISERS TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

LADY JUSTICE ARDEN DBE PROFESSOR STEPHEN WEATHERILL

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

2009

#### **BOARD OF EDITORS**

General Editors PROFESSOR CATHERINE REDGWELL, University College London PROFESSOR ROBERT McCORQUODALE, Director of BIICL

PROFESSOR JOHN BELL, University of Cambridge LORD JUSTICE LAWRENCE COLLINS PROFESSOR MALCOLM EVANS, University of Bristol PROFESSOR JAMES FAWCETT, University of Nottingham PROFESSOR JOHN A USHER, University of Exeter

#### Assistant Editor Orla Fee

**EDITORS OF CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS SECTION** 

#### **Public International Law**

Professor Dominic McGoldrick, University of Liverpool Professor Colin Warbrick, University of Birmingham

#### European Union Law

Professor Joe McMahon, University College Dublin

**Decisions of International Courts and Tribunals** Professor Craig Barker, University of Sussex

**Private International Law** Professor Peter McEleavy, University of Dundee

#### **BOOK REVIEW EDITORS**

Dr Chanaka Wickremasinghe, Foreign and Commonwealth Office Dr Ralph Wilde, University College London

#### INSTRUCTIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The *ICLQ* welcomes the submission of contributions for consideration by the editors with a view to publication. They should be sent to:

The General Editors International and Comparative Law Quarterly British Institute of International and Comparative Law 17 Russell Square London WCIB 5JP

as should all correspondence, books for review, and other communications.

The Board of Editors will only consider material which complies with the following:

- The submission should be an original, unpublished work not currently under consideration for publication elsewhere.
- 2. The ICLQ publishes articles that deal with public international law, private international law, comparative law and European Union Law. It particularly encourages the submission of innovative and original articles whose theme or content illuminate several of these subject areas. Articles which do no more than rehearse familiar and well-known material, or which are concerned only with national law in a non-comparative way, should not be submitted.
- Long articles should not exceed 12,000 words, excluding footnotes. A submission of less than 6,000 words may be considered for the 'Shorter Articles, Comments and Notes' section, which may secure earlier publication.
- 4. Footnotes should be numbered consecutively through the article and be in the form normally used by the ICLQ. *Footnoting should not be excessive*.
- A short (50–100 words) abstract of the article should be supplied. We reserve the right to edit abstracts for length and style.
- 6. Authors should state their present academic or professional affiliation and indicate any professional or personal involvement in the subject matter of the article.
- 7. It is preferred that submissions are sent as email attachments in a recognized software to ICLQ@biicl.org. Alternatively, the manuscript, typed, double-spaced, on one side only of A4 paper, should be accompanied by the text on floppy disk in a recognized software.

Authors are asked to refer to past issues of the *ICLQ* for style. More detailed guidance will be sent on request.

#### SUBSCRIPTIONS

Subscriptions, orders, and enquiries should be sent to the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, Charles Clore House, 17 Russell Square, London WCIB 5JP, telephone 020 7862 5151. The subscription to the *ICLQ* for 2009 is £175, \$350, air mail postage extra. There may be other subscription rates available; for a complete listing please visit journals.cambridge. org/ICLQ. Back issues of all volumes are now available at the current cover price (casebound extra).

The views expressed in the contributions to this journal are those of their author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views either of the board of editors of the journal or of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law (BIICL). BIICL is a registered charity and an independent research institute committed to supporting high standards of scholarship in all aspects of international and comparative law.

#### PERMISSIONS

For all matters concerning rights and permissions please contact Linda Nicol, Cambridge University Press, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8RU

© 2009

British Institute of International and Comparative Law

Printed in the United Kingdom by Bell and Bain Ltd, Glasgow

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

Volume	58
--------	----

January 2009

Part 1

### ARTICLES

Equivocal Helpers—Complie International Law	CIT STATES, MIXED MESSAGES AND Georg Nolte and Helmut Philipp Aust	1
	CAL TO LATERAL: EXTENDING THE EFFECT OF ONIAL LEGAL SYSTEMS OF THE SOUTH PACIFIC Jennifer Corrin	31
TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE: A FUTU	JRE TRUTH COMMISSION FOR ZIMBABWE Max du Plessis and Jolyon Ford	73
The British Bank Nationaliz Perspective	zations: An International Law <i>N Jansen Calamita</i>	119
SHORTER ARTIC	CLES, COMMENTS AND NOTES	5
The Recommendations Made A Sceptical View	BY THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE: Hugh Thirlway	151
Fluctuating Evidentiary Sta International Court of Ju	ANDARDS FOR SELF-DEFENCE IN THE JSTICE James A Green	163
Palm Tree Justice? The Rold South Pacific	e of Comparative Law in the <i>Sue Farran</i>	181
	DEVELOPMENTS: PUBLIC RNATIONAL LAW	
I. THE ASEAN CHARTER	Daniel Seah	197
II. The Arrest and Impendi	ng Trial of Radovan Karadžić	
	Marko Milanović	212

	111		212
III.	THE 2008 CLUSTER MUNITIONS CONVENTION: STEPPIN	g Outside the	
	CCW FRAMEWORK (AGAIN)	Karen Hulme	219

#### CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS: DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

I. EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE, Yassin Abdullah Kadi and Al Barakaat International Foundation v Council and Commission (JOINED CASES C-402/05 P AND C-415/05 P) JUDGMENT OF 3 SEPTEMBER 2008 Paul James Cardwell, Duncan French and Nigel White 229
II. INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA, HOSHINMARU (Japan v Russian Federation) AND TOMIMARU (Japan v Russian Federation), PROMPT RELEASE JUDGMENTS OF 6 AUGUST 2007

Vincent P Cogliati-Bantz 241

#### **BOOK REVIEWS**

MAKING TREATIES WORK: HUMAN RIGHTS, ENVIRONMENT AND	
ARMS CONTROL by Geir Ulfstein with Thilo Marauhn	
and Andreas Zimmerman Thilo (Eileen Denza CMG)	259
Food and Human Rights in Development: Evolving Issues	
AND EMERGING APPLICATIONS, VOLUME II by Wenche Barth Eide	
and Uwe Kracht (Margot E Salomon)	260
MULTIPLE NATIONALITY AND INTERNATIONAL LAW by Alfred M Boll	
(Ruth Donner)	262
BOOKS RECEIVED	265