

The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era

Volume 5

Number 3

July 2006



Published by the Society for
Historians of the Gilded Age
and Progressive Era

Additional sponsors: Illinois
State University, the College
of William and Mary,
Santa Clara University, and
the Rutherford B. Hayes
Presidential Center

FORUM

Thoughts on Periodizing the Gilded Age:
Capital Accumulation, Society, and Politics,
1873-1898

Richard Schneirov

Responses by *James L. Huston* and
Rebecca Edwards, with a rejoinder by
Richard Schneirov

ESSAY

The Crusade for Honest Weight: The Origins
of an Overlooked Progressive Movement
Timothy Messer-Kruse

BOOK REVIEWS

www.jgape.org



Editor: Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University
Associate Editor: Scott Nelson, College of William and Mary
Associate Editor for Public History: Karen Cox, University of North Carolina at Charlotte
Book Review Editor: Nancy C. Unger, Santa Clara University
Founding Editor, 2000-2003: Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University
Editorial Assistant: JoAnne Geigner

Editorial Board

William Becker
George Washington University

Michael Les Benedict
Ohio State University

Jack S. Blocker, Jr.
University of Western Ontario

Charles W. Calhoun
East Carolina University

John Enyeart
Bucknell University

Ellen Fitzpatrick
University of New Hampshire

Joseph A. Fry
University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Murney Gerlach
San Diego, California

Julie Greene
University of Colorado

Nina Mjagkij
Ball State University

Robyn Muncy
University of Maryland

Katherine Osburn
Tennessee Tech University

Harold Platt
Loyola University of Chicago

Judith Raftery
California State University, Chico

Eric Rauchway
University of California, Davis

Axel R. Schäfer
University of Keele

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *AMERICA: HISTORY AND LIFE* and *HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS*.

A member of the History Cooperative, the journal is available online to individual and institutional subscribers at <www.historycooperative.org>. Instructions for accessing the online edition appear towards the back of this issue.

Change of Address: Contact <sdarr@rbhayes.org>.

Copyright permission: SHGAPE has contracted with Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., such that copyright permission requests for use of content owned by SHGAPE should be processed through CCC. Such requests may be submitted via their website at <www.copyright.com>. Requests may also be emailed to CCC at <info@copyright.com>.

ISSN: 1537-7814 **Publications Agreement No.** 40639038
© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era

CONTENTS

Editor's Note 187

FORUM

Thoughts on Periodizing the Gilded Age: Capital
Accumulation, Society, and Politics, 1873-1898 189

Richard Schneirov

Response 1: "For We Had Hugged the Delusion..." 225

James L. Huston

Response 2: An Age of Incorporation? 232

Rebecca Edwards

Rejoinder: Richard Schneirov 237

ESSAY

The Crusade for Honest Weight: The Origins of an
Overlooked Progressive Movement 241

Timothy Messer-Kruse

BOOK REVIEWS

See reverse

[On the back cover: An honest weight demonstrator in Hamilton, Ontario, 1913. Courtesy the Toledo Scale Collection, Ward M. Canady Center for Special Collections, University of Toledo.]

BOOK REVIEWS

Ulysses S. Grant by Josiah Bunting; *Ulysses S. Grant: The Unlikely Hero* by Michael Korda; and *Touched With Fire: Five Presidents and the Civil War Battles that Made Them* by James M. Perry 287

reviewed by Stephen K. Tootle

Party Games: Getting, Keeping, and Using Power in Gilded Age Politics by Mark Wahlgren Summers 293

reviewed by Lewie Reece

The Freedom of the Streets: Work, Citizenship, and Sexuality in a Gilded Age City by Sharon E. Wood 296

reviewed by Sharon Ullman

The Battle over Hetch Hetchy: America's Most Controversial Dam and the Birth of Modern Environmentalism by Robert W. Righter 299

reviewed by Char Miller

The *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly by the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE), with assistance from the Rutherford B. Hayes Presidential Center, Illinois State University, the College of William and Mary, and Santa Clara University. It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

Subscription rates are \$40 for individuals, \$80 for institutions, \$15 for graduate students with proof of enrollment, \$50 for joint membership (one Journal subscription and two memberships to the Society). There is an additional charge of \$5 for subscriptions from outside of the United States, including Canada and Mexico. For subscriptions or single issues please contact Suzanne Darr, Executive Assistant, Rutherford B. Hayes Presidential Center, Spiegel Grove, Fremont, OH 43420, or <sdarr@rbhayes.org>. Subscriptions includes SHGAPE membership, which also brings a semi-annual *Newsletter* and notices of SHGAPE sessions at annual conferences of the American Historical Association and the Organization of American Historians.

Manuscripts should be sent in triplicate to the editor, Alan Lessoff, Department of History, Illinois State University, Normal, IL 61790-4420. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult the website <www.jgape.org> for details on correct format and citation style. Also consult the website concerning electronic submission. Information may also be obtained at the email address <ahlesso@ilstu.edu>.