

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBER 1 1987

ARTICLES

FROM *Rogers* TO *Rivers*: THE RIGHTS OF
THE MENTALLY ILL TO REFUSE
MEDICATION Ellen Wright Clayton

JUDICIAL DETERMINATION OF THE SEXUAL
IDENTITY OF POST-OPERATIVE
TRANSSEXUALS: A NEW FORM OF SEX
DISCRIMINATION Jerold Taitz

NOTES AND COMMENTS

PARENTAL LEAVE:
THE NEED FOR A NATIONAL POLICY TO
FOSTER SEXUAL EQUALITY

PATIENT CONFIDENTIALITY STATUTES IN
MEDICARE & MEDICAID FRAUD
INVESTIGATIONS

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$20.00 for air mail postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10 (plus \$3 for postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$85.00 for 1987). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445).
ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Worcester, Massachusetts, in accordance with Permit No. 5 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law*

WILLIAM SCHWARTZ, M.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*

COLIN S. DIVER, B.A., LL.B., *Associate Dean*

BARBARA LAUREN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Dean*

LOIS H. KNIGHT, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

ANGELA R. HOLDER, LL.M., *President*

RONALD E. CRANFORD, M.D., *President-Elect*

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *Secretary*

JANE L. GREENLAW, R.N., M.S., J.D., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

AUBREY MILUNSKY, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc., F.R.C.P., D.C.H., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

**STAY
ON THE
CUTTING
EDGE
OF YOUR
PROFESSION**



The American Society of Law & Medicine

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

The Medicolegal Tradition

Since its inception fifteen years ago, the American Society of Law and Medicine (ASLM) has grown from a small group of Massachusetts physicians and attorneys with a vision to one of the largest and most prestigious professional societies in America.

ASLM brings together professionals — attorneys, physicians, health care administrators, educators, nurses, judges, insurers — who are concerned with the interrelationships of law, medicine and health care. Members are bound by their desire to learn, to better serve their clients or patients and to progress in their careers.

ASLM promotes the finest in continuing education and professional recognition in the fields of law and medicine. It continues to accomplish this by tackling the major issues of the day — malpractice, risk management, AIDS, drug testing and drug dependency, health care financing, death and dying and new medical technologies. ASLM provides leadership in these critical societal issues and needs your support to fulfill its vision.

Through the initiation of projects, sponsorship of conferences, and the publication of two major journals, ASLM can keep you on the cutting edge of your profession.

Law, Medicine and Health Care and the *American Journal of Law and Medicine* are the journals published by the Society. *LMHC* is edited by prestigious board members, including Larry Gostin (editor-in-chief, Harvard), Jay Katz (medical editor, Yale), and Bernard Dickens (legal editor, University of Toronto).

Forthcoming in the *American Journal of Law and Medicine* is a commemorative edition for Harry Blackmun, U.S. Supreme Court Justice.

BENEFITS OF ASLM MEMBERSHIP

- Become a part of the largest and most prestigious medicolegal society in America.
- Stay at the top of your profession by receiving up-to-date information about today's vital legal and medical issues.
- Annual subscription to *Law, Medicine and Health Care* (four issues).
- Annual subscription to the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* (four issues).
- Periodic editions of ASLM's newsletter, *ASLM Briefings*.
- Invitations to Society sponsored conferences including:
 - registration fee discounts.
 - continuing education credit.
- Price discounts on Society Books.
- ASLM Book Purchase Service.
- ASLM Photocopy Service.
- Participate in ASLM Speakers' Bureau.
- Receive an elegant Membership Certificate suitable for framing. This certificate exemplifies your stature as a member of the law and medical profession.
- And much, much more . . .



ASLM MEMBERSHIP FORM

Yes, I wish to become a member of the American Society of Law & Medicine.

- Regular member: \$85. _____
- Full-time health law or bioethics teacher: \$65. _____
- Graduate student without a doctorate level degree (enclosed is a copy of my full-time student I.D.): \$40. _____
- Foreign postage: \$20. _____

TOTAL US\$ _____

- Check enclosed.
Please charge my:

- VISA  MasterCard 

- Card No. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Signature _____

Exp. Date _____

Please print your name as you would like it to appear on your membership certificate:

Mailing Address Home Business
Name _____
Profession _____
Institution _____
Street _____
City _____
State _____ Zip _____
Country _____

Please remit in full to:

American Society of Law and Medicine
765 Commonwealth Ave., 16th Floor
Boston, MA 02215
(617) 262-4990

The American Society of Law & Medicine is a non-profit, educational association organized under Section 501 (c) (3) of the States Internal Revenue Code. Contributions are deductible to the extent provided by law.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF
Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

EXECUTIVE EDITOR
Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS
American Society of Law & Medicine
Joyce Coleman

CIRCULATION MANAGER
Sharin Paaso

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.
Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.
Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,
Massachusetts Hospital Association

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.
Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.
Powers & Hall
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.
Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.
Department of Preventive Medicine
Medical College of Wisconsin

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.
Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.
University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.
General Counsel
American Medical Association

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.
Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.
Boston College Law School

Jay Katz, M.D.
Yale Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.
New York University School of Law

Peter Martin, J.D.
Dean, Cornell Law School

**Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,
F.R.C.P., D.C.H.**
Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.
University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.
Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Honorable Max Rosenn
United States Court of Appeals for the
Third Circuit

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine
Harvard Medical School

William Schwartz, J.D., M.A.
Dean, Boston University School of Law

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.
New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.
Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.
Dean, Tufts University School of
Dental Medicine

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.
Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

David G. Warren, J.D.
Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.
Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBER 1 1987

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute for Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael J. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeals
Supreme Court
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Faculty of Law
Tokyo Metropolitan University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBER 1 1987

BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1987-1988

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Beth Margolis

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Lisa A. Sheeler

MANAGING EDITOR

D. Mark Leonard

PROJECTS EDITOR

Michael D. Povman

ARTICLES EDITORS

Steven Reske
Thomas K. Schulte
Bruce Shapiro
Susan E. Stenger

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Duncan Anthony Maio

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Susan Clement
Lori Goldstein
Lori B. Krauss
Peter R. Lash

David Rosen
Cheryl B. Schreiber
Ilene Taback
Robert Whalen

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

Scott Baker
Donald Bollella
Laurence Cote
Paul E. Dwyer
Christine Fedas
Denise George
Gail K. Gordon

Brian Kehoe
Ann T. Lamport
David L. McEvoy
Wendy Ravitz
Debra Rosen
Amy Spitofsky
Pamela Worstell
Jean Zoubek

STAFF MEMBERS

David Babner
Diane M. Crawford
Tracy Croft
Steven DeLuca
Aileen C. Denne Bolton
Michael DeVito
Jeffrey Dollinger
James R. Eddy
Joel Freedman
Mary L. Gallant
Margaret Graham
Steven Hamel
Steven N. Jacobs

Joseph P. Kelly
Todd Kirsch
Sara Lander
Karen Laufer
Frances Lynch
Maureen A. MacFarlane
Michael D. Mann
Steven H. Meyer
Kathleen Norton
Donna M. Praiss
Elizabeth A. Reingold
Sheppy A. Rosenman
Todd L. Safon

Stacey H. Snyder
Joseph C. Stanko, Jr.
Constance N. Stratton
Edward Tumavicus
Ann M. VanDeventer
Richard I. Shakter
David Van Speybroeck
Karl S. Vasiloff
Robert D. Webb
Jonathan C. Wilk
Eric E. Wolf
Michelle S. Wolf
Ellen Wright

Special thanks to Nancy E. Johnson, Publications Assistant

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIII NUMBER 1 1987

ARTICLES

FROM *Rogers* TO *Rivers*: THE RIGHTS OF THE MENTALLY ILL TO REFUSE MEDICATION 7
Ellen Wright Clayton

JUDICIAL DETERMINATION OF THE SEXUAL IDENTITY OF POST-OPERATIVE TRANSSEXUALS: A NEW FORM OF SEX DISCRIMINATION 53
Jerold Taitz

NOTES AND COMMENTS

PARENTAL LEAVE: THE NEED FOR A NATIONAL POLICY TO FOSTER SEXUAL EQUALITY 71

PATIENT CONFIDENTIALITY STATUTES IN MEDICARE & MEDICAID FRAUD INVESTIGATIONS 105

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS 139

SELECTED BOOK RELEASES 149

Copyright 1987 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.