# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

### **VOLUME 9 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1984**

### ARTICLES

Biological Monitoring: The Employer's Dilemma

the Read and the second line

Frances H. Miller

Limits of Guardian Treatment Refusal: A Reasonableness Standard Robert M. Veatch

### **NOTES & COMMENTS**

The Insanity Defense: Effects of Abolition Unsupported by a Moral Consensus

*Heckler v. Campbell* and the Grid: Are Disability Claimants Entitled to Examples of Suitable Jobs?

### MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

Selected Recent Court Decisions Selected Book Releases

Published by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law



### BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF [ack Berman

EXECUTIVE EDITOR A. Kaiper Wilson MANAGING EDITOR Kathryn E. Sandstrom

PROJECTS EDITOR

Kathryn K. Flood

### **CASE & NOTE EDITORS**

Sara Adler William Contente Howard M. Cooper Lisa J. Freedman Margaret Ann Stick David S. Zimble

### **ASSOCIATE EDITORS**

Doug K. Butler Edith F. Canter Lynette Cobun Martha A. Curran

Kirk Burns Thomas A. Cohn Kelly Copeland Steven Curwin Edward M. Fox Jay S. Geller Nathan Gibson Jeffrey Herz Judith H. Itkin Michael E. Katzenstein Mitchell Katzman Barbara Gruenthal Jeffrey A. Knishkowy Michael S. Kraft Jorge Martinez Mark Mason

### MEMBERS

Peter Kenyon David R. Kraus Laura D. Kreel Tina Liebling Steven V. Napolitano Deborah Novick Mark Ollman Robyn Reiken Helen A. Salichs Harry Packman, Jr. Gregory G. Peters Suzan R. Shapiro Mark S. Smith

**ARTICLES EDITOR** 

Eric R. Dannenmaier

Bonnie G. Ross

Stephen L. Sepinuck

Thomas E. Scribner Carin Sigel Richard Sobel Paul Thomas Michael Trager Chet Waldman Alice Warner Theodore Winokur Elaine R. Wohlmuth Jeri Zeder Melissa Zelen

### PUBLICATIONS ASSISTANT J. Jehane Robb

FACULTY ADVISOR Frances H. Miller The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$75.00 for 1984). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in Index to Legal Periodicals, Legal Contents, Index Medicus, Social Sciences Citation Index, Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Worcester, Massachusetts, in accordance with Permit No. 5 (Nonprofit Org.).

### ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), President, University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

WILLIAM SCHWARTZ, M.A., J.D., Dean and Professor of Law

BARBARA ROBINSON-COSTAS, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs

VIRGINIA J. WISE, B.G.S., A.M.L.S., J.D., Director, Law Library; Associate Professor of Law

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., Executive Assistant to the Dean

### **OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE**

THOMAS E. CARGILL, JR., J.D., President AUBREY MILUNSKY, M.D., President-Elect LEE J. DUNN, JR., J.D., LL.M., Vice-President ANGELA R. HOLDER, J.D., LL.M., Secretary GARY R. EPLER, M.D., Treasurer ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., Founder and First President SIDNEY SCHERLIS, M.D., Immediate Past President A. EDWARD DOUDERA, J.D., Executive Director

## AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

### **BOARD of EDITORS**

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Austin Stickells, J.D., LL.M., M.B.A.

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF EMERITUS AND FOUNDER John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR A. Edward Doudera, J.D.

#### **EDITORS**

Michael Baram, J.D. Boston University Schools of Law and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D. Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D. Boston University School of Law

Patrick R. Carroll, J.D. Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel, Massachusetts Hospital Association

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg. Harvard University School of Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M. Shagory & Shagory Boston, Massachusetts Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D. Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H. Texas A&M University College Station, Texas

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D. Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D. University of Pittsburgh Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D. General Counsel American Medical Association

**Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.** Hollowell & Silverstein Raleigh, North Carolina Richard G. Huber, J.D. Dean, Boston College Law School

Jay Katz, M.D. Yale Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D. New York University School of Law

Peter Martin, J.D. Dean, Cornell Law School

Frances H. Miller, J.D. Boston University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., F.R.C.P., D.C.H., D.Sc. Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H. Gardner, Carton & Douglas Washington, D.C.

Honorable Max Rosenn United States Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D. Founder, American Society of Law & Medicine Harvard Medical School

William Schwartz, J.D., M.A. Dean, Boston University School of Law

**E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.** New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D. Director, Medical Genetics Center University of Texas at Houston

**Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.** Dean, Tufts University School of Dental Medicine

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A. Grad. Sch. of Business Administration University of Michigan

David G. Warren, J.D. Duke University

**Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.** Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal Medicine

# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW (P) & MEDICINE

VOLUME 9 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1984

### ARTICLES

Biological Monitoring: The		Frances H. Miller
Employer's Dilemma	387	×.
Limits of Guardian Treatment Refusal: A Reasonableness		Robert M. Veatch
Standard	427	

### NOTES AND COMMENTS

The Insanity Defense: Effects of Abolition Unsupported by a Moral Consensus 471

Heckler v. Campbell and the Grid: Are Disability Claimants Entitled to Examples of Suitable Jobs? 501

### MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

Selected Recent Court	
Decisions	517
Selected Book Releases	527

Copyright 1984 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.