European Constitutional Law Review

2011 VOLUME 7 ISSUE 1

Contributions by

Matthias Wendel, Wolfgang Weiß, Stefan Sottiaux, Cesare Pinelli, Christoph Möllers, Sascha Hardt and Mariolina Eliantonio, Ulli Jessurun d'Oliveira, René de Groot

Subjects

Populism and constitutional democracy; Italy: Berlusconi's immunity law in comparative perspective; The 'hate speech' case-law of the European Court of Human Rights; The European Convention of Human Rights in the post-Lisbon European Union; The Lisbon treaty before national constitutional courts; European Court of Justice on nationality law and Union citizenship, contra and pro; German Federal Constitutional Court on the Mangold case-law

EuConst 2011/1



T·M·C·ASSER PRESS

le Mensehen worden Bri



T·M·C·ASSER PRESS

Information Technology and Law Series 20

Innovating government

Normative, Policy and Technological Dimensions of Modern Government

Edited by

S. van der Hof and M.M. Groothuis

Governments radically change under the influence of technology. As a result, our lives in interaction with public sector bodies are easier. But the creation of an electronic government also makes us more vulnerable and dependent. Dependent not just on technology itself, but also on the organizations within government that apply technology, collect and use citizen-related information and often demand the citizens to submit themselves to technological applications.

This book analyzes the legal, ethical, policy and technological dimensions of innovating government. Authors from diverse backgrounds confront the reader with a variety of disciplinary perspectives on persistent themes, like privacy, biometrics, surveillance, e-democracy, electronic government, and identity management.

Clearly, the use of technology by governments demands that choices are made. In the search for guiding principles therein, an in-depth understanding of the developments related to electronic government is necessary. This book contributes to this understanding.

This book is valuable to academics and practitioners in a wide variety of fields such as public administration and ICT, sociology, political science, communications science, ethics and philosophy. It is also a useful tool for policymakers at the national and international level.

Simone van der Hof is Associate Professor at TILT (Tilburg Institute for Law, Technology and Society), Tilburg University, the Netherlands. **Marga Groothuis** is Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law of Leiden University in the Netherlands.

2011, ISBN 9789067047302 467 pages, hardcover Price ca. € 149.00 www.asserpress.nl

Distributed for T-M-C-Asser PRESS by Springer I springer.com



EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm journals.cambridge.org/ECL Recommended citation: EuConst

The journal is edited in the HOGENDORPCENTER for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is affiliated with the Europa Instituut and the Amsterdam Center of International Law (ACIL), University of Amsterdam and with the Faculties of Humanities and Political Sciences. Published three times a year.

Indexed in the following Thomson Reuters products and services: Social Sciences Citation Index; Social Sciences; Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences; Journal Citation Reports/Social Sciences Edition.

Editorial Office

European Constitutional Law Review c/o Hogendorpcentre, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam. Tel. +31 20 5252957/2951. Fax +31 20 5252900. E-mail: EuConst@uva. nl.

Distribution

The European Constitutional Law Review is distributed for T-M-C-Asser Press by Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK. The journal is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service. This service can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/ECL.

Subscription rates and specimen copies

Subscription to the *European Constitutional Law Review*, Volume 7 (2011): Print + online: GBP 129.00 / USD 233.00 / EUR 185.00. Print only: GBP 117.00 / USD 211.00 / EUR 167.00; Online only: GBP 112.00 / USD 201.00 / EUR 153.00; Subscription orders, changes of address and requests for specimen copies should be sent to Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Advertising

To advertise in the journal please contact the relevant Advertising Promoter for your area: in the USA, Canada or Mexico: journals_advertising@cup.org or telephone +1 (212) 337 5053; in the UK, Europe or rest of the world: ad_sales@cambridge.org or telephone +44 (1223) 325083.

Photocopying and permissions

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Permission inquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm; permission inquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm; permission inquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm. Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), http://www.copyright.com, email: info@copyright.com. For republication specific written permission should be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to press@asser.nl.

ISSN 1574-0196

© 2011 T·M·C·Asser PRESS, The Hague, and contributors.

BOARD OF EDITORS

W.T. Eijsbouts, editor-in-chief

Professor of European constitutional law and history, University of Amsterdam and professor of European law, Leiden University

Jan-Herman Reestman, associate editor-in-chief Associate professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

Leonard F.M. Besselink

Professor of European constitutional law, University of Utrecht

Monica Claes

Professor of European and comparative constitutional law, University of Maastricht

John W. Sap

Professor of European Union law, Open University in the Netherlands, Heerlen, and associate professor of European Union law, VU University Amsterdam

Jeremy B. Bierbach, managing editor Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

David Nederlof, associate managing editor Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam **Junior** editors

Thomas Beukers University of Utrecht

Lars Hoffmann

University of Maastricht

Jan Komárek

London School of Economics

Thomas A.J.A. Vandamme University of Amsterdam

Gerhard van der Schyff University of Tilburg

Geerten Boogaard

Ph.D. candidate, University of Amsterdam

Laurens Westendorp, student editor University of Amsterdam

Special language adviser

Russell E.M. Lawson

Oxford

BOARD OF ADVISORS

Andreas Auer

Professor of public law, University of Zurich

Paul Craig

Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca

Professor of law, Harvard Law School

Bruno de Witte

Professor of European Union law, European University Institute, Florence

Olivier Duhamel

University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis

Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerkrath

Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

P.J.G. Kapteyn

Former judge in the ECJ

Tim Koopmans

Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General at the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands), The Hague

Rick Lawson

Kirchheiner Chair, Department of Public Law, Leiden University

Koen Lenaerts

Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law, University of Leuven

Ingolf Pernice

Professor of public law and of international and European law, Humboldt University, Berlin

Iit Peters

Professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

Lucas Prakke

Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal

Judge at the ECJ and Professor of international and European institutional law, University of Utrecht

Hjalte Rasmussen

Professor of European Union law, University of Copenhagen

W.H. Roobol

Professor emeritus of European history, University of Amsterdam

Dominique Rousseau

Professor of public law, University of Montpellier 1

András Sajó

Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

Mirosław Wyrzykowski

Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw University, Poland and judge in the Trybunał Konstytucyjny (Polish Constitutional Court)

Peter G. Xuereb

Professor of European and comparative law, University of Malta

Iiří Zemánek

Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law, Charles University, Prague

EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

2011 VOLUME 7 ISSUE I

Contents

Editorial

Thinking About Elections and About Democratic Representation 1

Articles

Cesare Pinelli – The Populist Challenge to Constitutional Democracy 5

Sascha Hardt and Mariolina Eliantonio – 'Thou Shalt Be Saved' (from Trial)? The Ruling of the Italian Constitutional Court on Berlusconi's Immunity Law in a Comparative Perspective 17

Stefan SOTTIAUX – 'Bad Tendencies' in the ECtHR's 'Hate Speech' Jurisprudence 40

Wolfgang Weiss – Human Rights in the EU: Rethinking the Role of the European Convention on Human Rights After Lisbon 64

Mathias Wendel – Lisbon Before the Courts: Comparative Perspectives 96

Case Notes

H.U. Jessurun d'Oliveira – Decoupling Nationality and Union Citizenship?

G.R. DE GROOT and Anja SELING – The Consequences of the *Rottmann* Judgment on Member State Autonomy – The European Court of Justice's Avant-Gardism in Nationality Matters

European Court of Justice, Decision of 2 March 2010, Janka Rottmann v.

European Court of Justice, Decision of 2 March 2010, *Janko Rottmann* v. *Freistaat Bayern*, Case C-315/08 138

Christoph Möllers – Constitutional *Ultra Vires* Review of European Acts Only Under Exceptional Circumstances, German Federal Constitutional Court, Decision of 6 July 2010, 2 BvR 2661/06, *Honeywell* 161