

## The Pennsylvania State University Press

Vol. 9, No. 3 1997



EDITOR Donald T. Critchlow

ASSOCIATE EDITOR/BOOK REVIEW EDITOR David B. Robertson University of Missouri, St. Louis

> MANAGING EDITOR Thomas F. Curran

#### COPYEDITOR Cherene Holland

EDITORIAL ASSOCIATE Patricia E. Powers

#### EDITORIAL BOARD

Brian Balogh (History) University of Virginia

Amy Bridges (Political Science) University of California, San Diego

Jane S. De Hart (History) University of California, Santa Barbara

Martha Derthick (Government) University of Virginia

Mary O. Furner (History) University of California, Santa Barbara

Daniel M. Fox (Medicine) Milbank Memorial Fund

David Garrow (Law) Emory University

Hugh Graham (History) Vanderbilt University

Otis Graham (History) University of North Carolina, Wilmington Ira Katznelson (Political Science) Columbia University

K. Austin Kerr (History) The Ohio State University

James Morone (Political Science) Brown University

Ann S. Orloff (Sociology) University of Wisconsin, Madison

James T. Patterson (History) Brown University

Byron E. Shafer (American Goverment) Nuffield College, Oxford University

Theda Skocpol (Sociology) Harvard University

Jeffrey K. Tulis (Government) University of Texas, Austin

David Vogel (Business) University of California, Berkeley



# Contents Vol. 9, No. 3 1997

### Articles

COLIN GORDON	277
Why No National Health Insurance in the U.S.? The	
Limits of Social Provision in War and Peace, 1941–1948	
HELENE SILVERBERG	311
State Building, Health Policy, and the Persistence	
of the American Abortion Debate	
JEAN-PIERRE COLLIN	339
City Management and the Emerging Welfare State:	
Evolution of City Budgets and Civic Responsibilities	
in Montreal, 1931–1951	
Critical Parstractions	

#### Critical Perspectives

GUY ALCHON	358
Policy History and the Sublime Immodesty	
of the Middle-Aged Professor	

#### **Book Reviews**

<ul> <li>KENNETH FINEGOLD/Party Strategy and Public Policy</li> <li>William E. Connelly, Jr. and John J. Pitney, Jr., Congress' Permanent Majority? Republicans in the U.S. House</li> <li>Douglas B. Craig, After Wilson: The Struggle for the Democratic Party, 1920–1934</li> <li>Thomas Ferguson, Golden Rule: The Investment Theory of Party Competition and the Logic of Money-Driven Political Systems</li> <li>Stanley B. Greenberg, Middle Class Dreams: The Politics and Power of the New American Majority</li> <li>Philip A. Klinkner, The Losing Parties: Out-Party National Committees, 1956–1993</li> <li>David Sarasohn, The Party of Reform: Democrats in the Progressive Era</li> <li>Clyde P. Weed, The Nemesis of Reform: The Republican Party During the New Deal</li> </ul>	375
STEVEN A. SHULL/Civil Rights in Employment John D. Skrentny, The Ironies of Affirmative Action Desmond King, Separate and Unequal	381
CLARENCE E. WUNDERLIN, JR./Redefining Profes- sionals and Remaking Public Servants Bruce A. Kimball, The "True Professional Ideal" in America: A History Patricia Wallace Ingraham, The Foundations of Merit: Public Service in American Democracy	387
RICHARD GREENWALD/Present at the Creation: Labor and the Making of the New Deal Order Melvin Dubofsky, The State and Labor in Modern America Robert H. Zieger, The CIO: 1935–1955 Colin Gordon, New Deals: Business, Labor, and Politics in America, 1920–1935 Stephen Amberg, The Union Inspiration in American Poli- tics: The Auto Workers and the Making of a Liberal Indus- trial Order	392

## Journal of Policy History

The Journal of Policy History provides an interdisciplinary forum for scholars concerned with the application of historical perspectives to public policy studies. The journal aims to encourage research into the formation and development of public policy while encouraging the application of diverse methods and theories to public policy and their politics within a historical perspective. In addition to social scientists and historians, the journal seeks to inform policy makers through a historical approach to public policy.

The Journal of Policy History is intended to give voice to scholars interested in understanding public policies and their development through historical inquiry and interpretation. The journal publishes historical studies of specific policy areas and policy institutions, and explores continuities and shifts in policy over time. The journal encourages interdisciplinary research into the origins and development of public policy in the United States and other countries. Comparative historical approaches to the development of public policies are also welcomed.

Manuscripts should be typed double-spaced with end notes following the text and generally should not exceed 30 typewritten pages. Manuscripts accepted for publication will be reviewed anonymously, and authors' names, including positions, addresses, and phone numbers, should appear only on the title page. Four copies of a manuscript, and a biographical sketch of no more than 50 words, should be sent to the Editor, *Journal of Policy History*, 221 N. Grand Blvd., Saint Louis University, St. Louis, MO 63108.

The Journal of Policy History (ISSN 0898-0306) is published quarterly by The Pennsylvania State University Press, USB 1, Suite C, University Park, PA 16802. Annual subscription rates: U.S.A.: Individuals \$29.50/yr.; Institutions \$43./yr. Outside U.S.A.: Individuals, \$35./yr.; Institutions \$50./yr. All correspondence of a business nature, including subscriptions, permissions, advertisements, and changes of address, should be addressed to The Penn State Press. Subscribers are requested to notify the Press and their local postmaster immediately of change of address. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to The Penn State Press, USB 1, Suite C, University Park, PA 16802. E-mail Address: PSPjournals@psu.edu

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Libraries and other users registered with the CCC may photocopy any article in the journal provided that a base fee of \$1.00 per copy is paid directly to the CCC. This authorization does not extend to copies made for duplicating an entire issue, for creating anthologies, for advertising, or for reselling. For information about multiple copying for classroom use, write to the Permissions Manager, The Penn State Press, at the address above.

The journal is submitted to the following for indexing: P.A.I.S. International, Humanities Abstracts, Institute for Scientific Information, University Microfilms Inc., Sage Publications, Sociological Abstracts, Historical Abstracts, and IBZ-International Bibliography of Periodical Literature.

Copyright © 1997 by The Pennsylvania State University. All rights reserved. No copies may be made without written permission of the publisher.