

The authors draw only careful conclusions. The lesson I learned, however, was that diagnoses in at least some of the cases concerned had in fact the predictive value claimed by those in favour of classification. The prognosis of e.g. an autistic child is indeed poorer than the outlook for a child of the same sex, age, IQ, Behaviour Screening Questionnaire (BSQ) score and social background but with no more than an unspecific behaviour disturbance; and even the best of day centres has less of an impact on the natural history of autism than we would wish (Rutter, 1967). A correct diagnosis should indeed tell us which treatment to choose and what success to expect of it. For example, drug trials of antidepressants match experimental and control patients not only for their scores on depression scales, age, sex, etc. but also and most importantly for diagnosis, e.g. primary depression rather than schizophrenia complicated by depressive symptoms. Perhaps a fairer picture of the day centre's long term achievements would have been painted if the children could have been matched for diagnosis as well.

C. THIELS

*The Maudsley Hospital,  
London S.E.5*

#### References

- RUTTER, M. (1977) Classification. In *Child Psychiatry: Modern Approaches*. (eds. M. Rutter and L. Hersov). Oxford: Blackwell.
- RICHMAN, N., GRAHAM, P. & STEVENSON, J. (1983) Long-term effects of treatment in a pre-school day centre: A controlled study. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **142**, 71–7.
- RUTTER, M. *et al* (1967) A 5 to 15 years follow-up study of infantile psychoses. II. Social and behavioural outcome. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **113**, 1183–99.

#### JASPERS: GENERAL PSYCHOPATHOLOGY

DEAR SIR,

The article by Professor Michael Shepherd (*Journal*, 1982, **141**, 310–12) quotes “the verdict of one influential British textbook” but does not give reference to this volume or to its author. The textbook referred to is that of Myre Sim's *Guide to Psychiatry*, 4th Edition (Churchill-Livingstone, London and Edinburgh 1981).

Professor Shepherd described my verdict on Jaspers' *General Psychopathology* as an “egregious assessment”. As he was highly critical of it I assume that he did not use the word ‘egregious’ in the archaic sense when it meant ‘outstanding’ but in its modern sense of being ‘uncommonly bad’. To criticize an author severely on his textbook and not mention the author or text by name is in egregious taste.

I do not see how he “can testify” to the impact of this “egregious assessment” on candidates for the M.R.C.

Psych. for neither I nor he raised this issue of Jaspers in our examinations and neither did the candidates.

MYRE SIM

*Forensic Psychiatric Clinic,  
320, 1175 Cook Street,  
Victoria, British Columbia V8V 4A1*

#### ARE EATING DISORDERS FORMS OF AFFECTIVE DISORDER?

DEAR SIR,

Hudson and colleagues (*Journal*, February 1983, **142**, 133–38) have recently described a study in which a high prevalence of affective disorder was found amongst the relatives of patients with eating disorders. They concluded that this added to ‘the evidence from studies of phenomenology, course of illness, response to biological tests, and treatment response, that the eating disorders may be forms of affective disorder’. In our opinion none of these lines of evidence stands up to close scrutiny.

With regard to *phenomenology*, depressive symptoms are indeed common in both anorexia nervosa and bulimia nervosa. However, clinical evaluation of these symptoms is complicated by the direct effect of the eating disorder on appetite, weight, energy, interests and concentration. Furthermore, since in anorexia nervosa it is well recognised that restoration of body weight is associated with a decrease in depressive symptoms, it is possible that the depression is a non-specific product of the malnutrition (Eckert *et al*, 1982). In bulimia nervosa, since the depression lifts in response to measures which enhance control over eating, the mood disturbance is likely to be a secondary phenomenon (Fairburn, 1982).

The findings of most studies on the *course* of anorexia nervosa have failed to support the contention that the condition is a form of affective disorder. Although many patients do exhibit depressive and anxiety symptoms at follow-up, the most striking observation is that the characteristic psychopathological features of the disorder (the pursuit of thinness and a morbid fear of fatness) tend to persist (Hsu, 1980). With one exception, the outcome studies have found that the eating disorder does not evolve into an affective disorder: instead, as Russell (1970) has noted, the illness ‘breeds true’. As yet, there have been no studies of the course of bulimia nervosa.

The *biological tests* Hudson and colleagues refer to, relate to dexamethasone suppression. Several studies have found that a proportion of patients with anorexia nervosa or bulimia (DSMIII) have responses to dexamethasone similar to those found amongst patients with affective disorder (Gerner and Gwirtsman, 1981; Hudson *et al*, 1982). However, it is possible that this abnormality represents a secondary

physiological response to these patients' abnormal eating habits or their low body weight.

The data on *treatment* are also highly equivocal. Whilst several reports have described the benefits of antidepressant medication in the treatment of patients with anorexia nervosa, no study has even met the minimal requirements of proper evaluation (Szmukler, 1982). There have also been claims that antidepressant medication helps patients with bulimia (DSMIII). However, the only controlled outcome study found that adequate dosages of mianserin had no specific effect on eating habits or attitudes, or indeed on mental state (Sabine *et al.*, 1983). It must be added that it is questionable whether response to antidepressant medication is a legitimate basis for assigning patients to a particular diagnostic category (Murray and Murphy, 1978).

With regard to *family history* of affective disorder, the study of Hudson and colleagues certainly substantiates earlier findings of a high prevalence of affective disorder amongst the relatives of patients with eating disorders. However, the only conclusion that can be drawn from this observation is that a family history of affective disorder predisposes individuals to develop an eating disorder.

In conclusion, an association between eating disorders and disturbances of mood is incontrovertible. However, the balance of evidence weighs against the suggestion that eating disorders are forms of affective disorder.

PETER J. COOPER  
CHRISTOPHER G. FAIRBURN

Warneford Hospital,  
Oxford OX3 7JX

#### References

- ECKERT, E. D., GOLDBERG, S. C., HALMI, K. A., CASPER, R. C. & DAVIS, J. M. (1982) Depression in anorexia nervosa. *Psychological Medicine*, **12**, 115–22.
- FAIRBURN, C. G. (1982) Binge eating and its management. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **141**, 631–3.
- GERNER, R. H. & GWIRTSMAN H. E. (1981) Abnormalities of dexamethasone suppression test and urinary MHPG in anorexia nervosa. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, **138**, 650–3.
- Hsu, L. K. G. (1980) Outcome of anorexia nervosa: a review of the literature. *Archives of General Psychiatry*, **37**, 1014–6.
- HUDSON, J. I., LAFFER, P. S. & POPE, H. G. (1982) Bulimia related to affective disorder by family history and response to dexamethasone suppression test. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, **139**, 685–7.
- MURRAY, R. M. & MURPHY, D. L. (1978) Drug response and psychiatric nosology. *Psychological Medicine*, **8**, 667–81.
- RUSSELL, G. F. M. (1970) Anorexia nervosa: its identity as an illness and its treatment. In *Modern Trends in Psychological Medicine*, Volume 2 (ed. J. H. Price), pp 131–64. London: Butterworth.

SABINE, E. J., YONACE, A., FARRINGTON, A. J., BARRATT, K. H. & WAKELING, A. (1983) Bulimia nervosa: a placebo controlled double-blind therapeutic trial of mianserin. *British Journal of Clinical Pharmacology*, **5**, 195S–202S.

SZMUKLER, G. I. (1982) Drug treatment and anorexic states. In *Drugs and Appetite* (ed. T. Silverstone), pp. 159–81. London: Academic Press.

#### PHONEME DISCRIMINATION IN SCHIZOPHRENIA

DEAR SIR,

I read with interest the paper by Drs Kugler and Caudrey (*Journal*, January 1983, **142**, 53–59).

I have, however, found one point puzzling. It was reported in the article that all the patients met Feighner's diagnostic criteria of schizophrenia but, at the same time, the duration of their illness ranged from two months to 27 years. This seems to be contradictory since Feighner's criteria of schizophrenia requires the duration of at least six months.

T. KITAMURA

School of Medicine,  
Keio Gijuku University,  
Tokyo, Japan

#### Dr Kugler replies:

All patients in this study were initially tested on the basis of hospital diagnoses. Case-note summaries were made at the time of testing and were subsequently examined, using the syndrome checklist of the Present State Examination and Feighner's diagnostic criteria, to confirm diagnoses before the data were analysed. The mental state of the patients in the time between testing and data analysis was also referred to and the minimum duration of illness for any schizophrenic patient at the time of analysis was 18 months. Age, duration of illness, age at onset of the illness and medication data *at the time of testing* are reported in our paper.

I hope this answers Dr Kitamura's query and apologise for the lack of clarity on this point.

Harperbury Hospital, Herts

#### WEEKLY PIMOZIDE VERSUS FLUPHENAZINE DECANOATE IN SCHIZOPHRENIC OUT- AND DAY-PATIENTS

DEAR SIR,

Pimozide has been found to be effective as maintenance treatment in schizophrenics when given four days weekly to in- and day-patients (McCreadie *et al.*, 1980) and once weekly to in-patients (McCreadie *et al.*, 1982). A preliminary investigation has now been carried out in schizophrenics living in the community.

In a double-blind study, 27 male and female chronic