

Philosophy and Museums: Essays on the Philosophy of Museums

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplement: 79



Edited by Victoria S. Harrison, Anna Bergqvist and Gary Kemp

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements

The Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements are published twice a year. Institutional subscribers to the journal *Philosophy* receive the supplements as part of their subscription. The following supplements are available to purchase as books.

Volume 39	1995	Karl Popper: Philosophy and Problems	(ISBN 0521558158)
40	1996	Philosophy and Pluralism	(ISBN 0521567505)
41	1996	<i>Verstehen and Human Understanding</i>	(ISBN 0521587425)
42	1997	Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521587417)
43	1998	Current Issues in Philosophy of Mind	(ISBN 0521639271)
44	1999	German Philosophy since Kant	(ISBN 0521667828)
45	1999	Philosophy and Public Affairs	(ISBN 0521667844)
46	2000	Logic, Cause & Action	(ISBN 0521785103)
47	2000	Philosophy, the Good, the True and the Beautiful	(ISBN 0521785111)
48	2001	Philosophy at the New Millennium	(ISBN 0521005086)
49	2001	Naturalism, Evolution and Mind	(ISBN 0521003733)
50	2002	Time, Reality & Experience	(ISBN 0521529670)
51	2002	Logic, Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521529662)
52	2003	Philosophy and the Emotions	(ISBN 0521537347)
53	2003	Minds and Persons	(ISBN 0521537339)
54	2004	Modern Moral Philosophy	(ISBN 0521603269)
55	2004	Agency and Action	(ISBN 0521603560)
56	2005	Philosophy, Biology and Life	(ISBN 0521678455)
57	2005	The Philosophy of Need	(ISBN 0521678447)
58	2006	Political Philosophy	(ISBN 0521695597)
59	2006	Preferences and Well-Being	(ISBN 0521695589)
60	2007	Narrative and Understanding Persons	(ISBN 9780521714099)
61	2007	Philosophy of Science	(ISBN 9780521718967)
62	2008	Being: Developments in Contemporary Metaphysics	(ISBN 9780521735445)
63	2008	Kant and Philosophy of Science Today	(ISBN 9780521748513)
64	2009	Epistemology	(ISBN 9780521138581)
65	2009	Conceptions of Philosophy	(ISBN 9780521138574)
66	2010	Philosophy as Therapeia	(ISBN 9780521165150)
67	2010	The Metaphysics of Consciousness	(ISBN 9780521173919)
68	2011	Philosophy and Religion	(ISBN 9781107615984)
69	2011	Philosophy and the Environment	(ISBN 9781107696075)
70	2012	Human Nature	(ISBN 9781107651975)
71	2012	Philosophy and the Arts	(ISBN 9781107661745)
72	2013	Phenomenology and Naturalism	(ISBN 9781107699052)
73	2013	Philosophy and Sport	(ISBN 9781107647695)
74	2014	Philosophical Traditions	(ISBN 9781107434486)
75	2014	Philosophical Aesthetics and the Sciences of Art	(ISBN 9781107654587)
76	2015	Mind, Self and Person	(ISBN 9781107545663)
77	2015	Supererogation	(ISBN 9781107545731)
78	2016	History of Philosophy	(ISBN 9781316626269)

From Volume 13 onwards the Series is published by Cambridge University Press and some earlier titles are also available.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see www.fsc.org for information.

Philosophy and Museums: Essays in the Philosophy of Museums

ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY SUPPLEMENT: 79

EDITED BY

Victoria S. Harrison, Anna
Bergqvist and Gary Kemp

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, CB2 1RP,
United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013–2473, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
C/Orense, 4, planta 13, 28020 Madrid, Spain
Lower Ground Floor, Nautica Building, The Water Club, Beach Road,
Granger Bay, 8005 Cape Town, South Africa

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy and the contributors 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom at Bell and Bain Ltd.
Typeset by Techset Composition Ltd, Salisbury, UK

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 9781316626269

ISSN 1358-2461

Contents

List of Illustrations	v
Notes on Contributors	vii
Introduction	1
VICTORIA S. HARRISON, ANNA BERGQVIST AND GARY KEMP	
Museums and their Paradoxes	13
MARK O'NEILL	
The Open Museum and its Enemies: An Essay in the Philosophy of Museums	35
CHARLES TALIAFERRO	
The Museum of Big Ideas	55
IVAN GASKELL	
Museums and the Nostalgic Self	77
MICHAEL P. LEVINE	
'A Sudden Surprise of the Soul': Wonder in Museums and Early Modern Philosophy	95
BETH LORD	
Context and Experiencing the Sacred	117
DAVID BROWN	
Are Holocaust Museums Unique?	133
PAUL MORROW	
Museums, Ethics and Truth: Why Museums' Collecting Policies Must Face up to the Problem of Testimony	159
PHILIP TONNER	
The Ethics of Trusteeship and the Biography of Objects	179
ANDREAS PANTAZATOS	
People and Things: Questions Museums Make us Ask and Answer	199
ALDA RODRIGUES	
What Do we See in Museums?	217
GRAHAM ODDIE	
An Honest Display of Fakery: Replicas and the Role of Museums	241
CONSTANTINE SANDIS	

Word and Object: Museums and the Matter of Meaning GARRY L. HAGBERG	261
Framing Effects in Museum Narratives: Objectivity in Interpretation Revisited ANNA BERGQVIST	295
The Participatory Art Museum: Approached from a Philosophical Perspective SARAH HEGENBART	319
Appendix	
The Hutchesons' Grammar School Project LEON ROBINSON	341
Foucault, Madness and Museums GLEN MELVILLE, SCOTT ADAMS AND LUCY McCracken	342
The Identity of Museum Objects JESSICA PALMER AND CLAIRE RICHMOND	351
Bibliography	361

List of Illustrations

1. Floor Plan of Permanent Exhibition, Illinois Holocaust Museum and Education Center (Photo: David Seide)
2. The Document Room at the Nuremberg Trials (Photo: Office of the United States Chief of Counsel, Courtesy of Harry S. Truman Library)
3. The Museum's Duty of Care
4. Constantin Brancusi, *Bird in Space*, 1928
5. Robert Rauschenberg, *Canyon*, 1959
6. Josef Albers, *Homage to the Square: Started*, 1969
7. Rembrandt van Rijn, *Self-Portrait*, 1629
8. Rembrandt van Rijn, *Portrait of Rembrandt with a gorget*, c. 1629
9. Rembrandt van Rijn, *Large Self-Portrait*, 1652
10. Rembrandt van Rijn, *Self-Portrait with Two Circles*, c. 1665–1669
11. Gerrit Rietveld, *Armchair Red and Blue*, 1918
12. Gerrit Rietveld, *“Berlin” Chair*, c. 1974 (designed 1923)
13. Gerrit Rietveld, *Steltman Chair*, 1963
14. Le Corbusier, *Armchair with adjustable back*, 1929
15. Paul Cezanne, *Mont Sainte-Victoire*, c. 1887–1890
16. Paul Cezanne, *Mont Sainte-Victoire, seen from the Bibemus Quarry*, 1897
17. Pablo Picasso, *Factory at Horta del Ebro*, 1909
18. Ceremony in the *Opera Village* on the Inauguration of the School, 8 October 2011. (Photo: Michael Bogar)
19. Photoworkshop in the *Opera Village*, 2013. (Photo: Marie Köhler)
20. Christoph Schlingensief, *Animatograph in Rotation*. Reykjavik, 2005. (Photo: Aino Laberenz)
21. Christoph Schlingensief, *The Opera Village Africa. Vacances Artistiques*, 2012. (Photo: Aino Laberenz)
22. Anton Raphael Mengs, *The School of Athens (after Raphael)*, 1752–1755. (Photo: Victoria & Albert Museum)
23. Christoph Schlingensief, *Via Intolleranza II. Uraufführung, Kunstenfestivaldesarts*, Brüssel, 2010. (Photo: Aino Laberenz)

Notes on Contributors

VICTORIA S. HARRISON

Victoria S. Harrison is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Macau, China. She was formerly Reader in Philosophy at the University of Glasgow, where she directed the Forum for Philosophy and Religion. She is the author of numerous books and articles on the philosophy of religion, and has published on Asian and intercultural philosophy. With Charles Taliaferro and Stewart Goetz, she edited *The Routledge Companion to Theism* (Routledge, 2013).

GARY KEMP

Gary Kemp is a Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Glasgow, he has published extensively in aesthetics and the philosophy of language. His recent publications include *Quine versus Davidson: Truth, Reference and Meaning* (Oxford University Press, 2012).

MARK O'NEILL

Mark O'Neill worked in museums in Glasgow from 1985 to 2009, latterly as Head of Arts and Museums in the city. He was responsible for the St Mungo Museum of Religious Life and Art (one of only four in the world), the refurbishment of the Kelvingrove Art Gallery and Museum and master-planning the Zaha Hadid designed Riverside Museum. He is currently Director of Policy & Research for Glasgow Life, the charity that runs Arts, Libraries, Museums and Sports in the city.

CHARLES TALIAFERRO

Charles Taliaferro is professor of philosophy at St. Olaf College, Minnesota. He is the author or editor of numerous books, including *The Image in Mind* (Continuum, 2013) co-authored with Jil Evans, *A Brief History of the Soul* (Blackwell, 2011), co-authored with Stewart Goetz and *The Routledge Companion to Theism* (Routledge, 2013) co-edited with Victoria S. Harrison and Stewart Goetz.

Notes on Contributors

IVAN GASKELL

Ivan Gaskell is Professor of Cultural History and Museum Studies at the Bard Graduate Center, New York City. His work on material culture, addressing intersections among history, art history, anthropology, and philosophy, has appeared in his books, and in his numerous contributions to edited volumes, and journal articles.

MICHAEL P. LEVINE

Michael P. Levine is Professor of Philosophy at The University of Western Australia where he teaches aesthetics, ethics, social and political philosophy and philosophical psychology. Recent publications include *Integrity and the Fragile Self* (co-authored); *The Analytic Freud* (ed); *Politics Most Unusual* (co-authored); *Thinking Through Film* (co-authored); and *Prospects for an Ethics of Architecture* (co-authored).

BETH LORD

Beth Lord is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen. She is the author of *Kant and Spinozism: Transcendental Idealism and Immanence from Jacobi to Deleuze* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), *Spinoza's Ethics: An Edinburgh Philosophical Guide* (Edinburgh University Press, 2010), and a number of articles about philosophy and museums.

DAVID BROWN

David Brown is Emeritus Professor at the University of St. Andrews, where he was formerly Wardlaw Professor of Theology, Aesthetics and Culture. He is also a Fellow of the British Academy. His two most recent books are *God and Mystery in Words* (OUP, 2008) and *La tradition kénotique dans la théologie britannique* (Mame-Desclée, 2010).

PAUL MORROW

Paul Morrow is a Postdoctoral Fellow in the Program in Political Philosophy, Policy and Law at the University of Virginia. He is the editor, with Larry May, of *Procedural Justice* (Ashgate Publishing, 2012).

PHILIP TONNER

Philip Tonner is Head of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Hutchesons' Grammar School in Glasgow. His current research explores the relationships between philosophy, archaeology, museology and education. He is the author of *Heidegger, Metaphysics and the Univocity of Being* (Continuum, 2010) and of a number of papers in the theoretical humanities.

ANDREAS PANTAZATOS

Andreas Pantazatos is Co-Director of the Centre for the Ethics of Cultural Heritage and teaches and researches normative and professional ethics at the Philosophy Department of Durham University. His interests are philosophy of cultural heritage and archaeology, ethics of stewardship and trusteeship, and epistemic injustice and museums, and ethics of heritage and immigration.

ALDA RODRIGUES

Alda Rodrigues has a PhD in Literary Theory (University of Lisbon, 2015). The title of her PhD dissertation is 'A Theory of Collecting'. She has worked as a lexicographer (1996–2006), and as a translator and proof reader. She now works in publishing.

GRAHAM ODDIE

Graham Oddie is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado, Boulder. His interests lie in metaphysics, value theory and epistemology, but especially at the intersection of those. He is the author of *Likeness to Truth* (Reidel, 1986) and *Value, Reality and Desire* (OUP, 2005) as well as over seventy articles in a wide range of journals.

CONSTANTINE SANDIS

Constantine Sandis is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Hertfordshire, and a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts. He has published numerous articles and several edited books. His recent publications include *The Things We Do and Why We Do Them* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2012). He is currently working on a monograph on understanding others.

Notes on Contributors

GARRY L. HAGBERG

Garry L. Hagberg is the James H. Ottaway Jr. Professor of Philosophy and Aesthetics at Bard College, former Professor of Philosophy at the University of East Anglia, and Editor of the journal *Philosophy and Literature*. His most recent book is *Describing Ourselves: Wittgenstein and Autobiographical Consciousness* (Oxford, 2008); he is presently writing on the role of literary experience in self-composition.

ANNA BERGQVIST

Anna Bergqvist is Lecturer of Philosophy at Manchester Metropolitan University. Her principal research interests are aesthetics and moral philosophy, with special emphasis on meta-ethics and moral psychology. She is co-editor of *Evaluative Perception* (forthcoming with Oxford University Press). She has also published on narrative understanding, perspectivalism, aesthetic and moral particularism, thick evaluative concepts and selected issues in philosophy of language. She also works at the intersection between value philosophy and philosophy of medicine, and is currently preparing a monograph on particularism in medical epistemology.

SARAH HEGENBART

Sarah Hegenbart is a PhD Candidate at the Courtauld Institute of Art and College Curator of Art at Pembroke, University of Oxford. She is currently researching Christoph Schlingensiefel's participatory art project *The Opera Village Africa* in Burkina Faso, which brings together the longer narratives emerging from Germany's ambivalent fascination with Richard Wagner and represents the culmination of Schlingensiefel's critical exploration of post-war German history that he carried out in his diverse artistic practice as filmmaker, theatre and opera director and performance artist.