American Journal of International Law

January 2001 Vol. 95 No. 1



Published by

The American Society of International Law

International Documents and Analysis

A Major New Series in International Relations

General Editor: Marc Weller, Centre of International Studies, University of Cambridge

This Series presents the key materials necessary for an understanding of significant episodes or issues in international relations. The documents are carefully selected and accompanied by original and critical expert analysis. Each volume opens with a chronology of events and a general introduction highlighting the major issues raised by the materials. The developments covered in each chapter are also subjected to substantive analysis, identifying the actors involved, the relevance and impact of their actions, and placing the individual documents in context.



Volume 1: The Crisis in Kosovo 1989-1999: From the Dissolution of Yugoslavia to Rambouillet and the Outbreak of Hostilities. History of the region and perspectives of the parties, constitutional developments 1989-1999, early attempts to address the crisis, first round of hostilities, displacement of 1998, OSCE Verification Mission, the Hill negotiation process and the Rambouillet conference, commencement of NATO armed action. 504 pp. soft cover, £ 29,90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 00 4.

Volume 2: The Kosovo Conflict: Conduct and Termination of Hostilities and the Renewed Search for a Settlement. Ethnic cleansing, NATO armed action, humanitarian efforts, Security Council action, International Court of Justice pleadings and its interim ruling, war crimes indictment, peace initiatives, establishment of a security presence, refugee return, international civil administration. 504 pp, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 01 2. The following additional titles have been commissioned:

Volume 3: Coercive Disarmament: Iraq, UNSCOM and the Use of Force. Iraq's reduced sovereignty, the UNSCOM and IAEA regime, US and UK air-strikes, 504 pp, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1-903033 02 0.

Volume 4: Armed Samaritans: Humanitarian Intervention Cases. An analysis of some 15 instances of humanitarian intervention with key documents. 504 pages, soft cover, £39.90/\$65 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 03 9, Jan 2000.

Volume 5: No Place to Hide: New Developments in the Exercise of International Criminal Justice. International Criminal Court, draft code on international crimes, Yugoslav and Rwanda Tribunals and their Practice, the Pinochet and other cases, national legislation. 504 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 04 7, December 1999. Volume 6: Of Angels and Warlords: International Peaceenforcement in Somalia, 504 pages, soft cover, £39.90/\$65 plus p & p 1 903033 05 5.

Volume 7: The Genie and the Bottle: International Attempts to Regulate Biotechnology. 504 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 06-3. Volume 8: Regulating Statehood: Innovative Attempts to Solve Self-determination Conflicts. 504 pages, soft cover, £39.90/\$65 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 07 1

Volume 9: Anatomy of Genocide: The Case of Bosnia and Herzegovina. 504 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p, ISBN 1 903033 08 X.

Volume 10: The New European Security Architecture. 504 pages, soft cover, £39.90/\$65 plus p & p 1,

ISBN 1 903033 09 8.

Volume 11: Rwanda, Genocide and the Crisis in the Great Lakes Region. 504 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p Volume 12 New Security Structures for Africa. 504 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p Volume 14: Resolving the Palestine Question. 352 pages,

soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p 1

Volume 15: The Kashmir Conflict in the Nuclear Age. 352 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p

Volume 16: Fostering Good Governance: The Emerging International Democratic Standard. 352 pages, soft cover, £29.90/\$49 plus p & p

Order the Series and Save Money: A subscription to the series, consisting of a minimum of 1.500 pages in up to five volumes per year, is available at £125/\$195 plus postage and packing. The series will also be available in due course by way of an internet subscription, at a substantially reduced rate for those subscribing to the hard copy edition.

How to order (credit card, dollar or sterling cheques or money orders): Book Systems Plus, Tel: 44-[0]1223-894870, Fax 44-[0]1223-894871, e-mail: BSP2B@aol.com; BSP House, Station Road, Linton, Cambs., CB1 6NW, UK. P & p of £3.75 for Europe or £5/\$7.80 for surface mail or £9.80/\$15 for air-mail for the rest of the world will be added per volume. Prices and order of publication subject to change without notice and titles may be substituted if contemporary

Published by Documents & Analysis Publishing Ltd., PO Box 813, Great Eversden, Cambridge CB3 7GH, UK

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF

INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 95

January 2001

NO. 1

PAGE

124

CONTENTS

Symposium: State Reconstruction After Civil Conflict

Edited by Ruth Wedgwood and Harold K. Jacobson Ending the fighting in Bosnia, Kosovo, Rwanda, and East Timor has not solved the problem of social reconstruction. This multidisciplinary symposium asks how the international community can contribute to the process of reconciliation after civil conflict-by restoring courts and accountability, addressing the memory of violence and atrocity, and opening economies to investmentbased growth. Foreword Ruth Wedgwood and Harold K. Jacobson 1 Beyond Impunity: Can International Criminal Justice Prevent Future Atrocities? Payam Akhavan 7 Individual Accountability in South Africa: Cultural Optimum or Political Facade? Lorna McGregor 32 Collapse and Reconstruction of a Judicial System: The United Nations Missions in Kosovo and East Timor Hansjörg Strohmeyer 46 Courts and Democracy in Postconflict Transitions: A Social Scientist's Perspective on the African Case 64 Jennifer Widner United Nations Governance of Postconflict Societies Michael J. Matheson 76 The Contribution of Democracy to Rebuilding Postconflict Societies Samuel H. Barnes 86 Peace Building: The Private Sector's Role Allan Gerson 102 **Editorial Comments** International Criminal Law and the Role of Domestic Courts Jonathan I. Charney 120

The United States and the Statute of Rome Monroe Leigh

non-Duration of the Their defense Deletion to Tetrangetic of Tetra

Edited by Sean D. M	ſurphy
Treaty Obligations as Evidence of Federal Preemption	132
U.S. Judgments Against Terrorist States	134
World War II Era Claims Against Japanese Companies	139
Award of Damages Against Bosnian Serb Leader Radovan Karadžić	144
District Court Rejection of Burmese Claims Against Unocal Corporation	145
U.S. Enacts Law on Normalizing Trade Relations with China	14
WTO Decision Striking Down U.S. Revenue Act of 1916	14
U.S. Sanctions Against Japan for Whaling	150
Conservation of Fish in the Western and Central Pacific Ocean	153
U.S. Funding to Combat AIDS	15
U.SEU "Safe Harbor" Data Privacy Arrangement	150
Middle East Peace Process: Violent Clashes	16

International Decisions	Edited by Bernard H. Oxman	
Southern Bluefin Tuna (Barbara Kwiatkows	ka)	162
Arbitral award on compulsory jurisdiction where dispute also arises under regional a sent to arbitrate		
<i>Castillo Petruzzi</i> (Jeanine Bucherer)		171
Inter-American Court of Human Rights ju of civilians by military tribunals, and ri pendent tribunal, and judicial review in t	ghts to counsel, public trial, inde- ime of emergency	
Ivcher Bronstein & Constitutional Tribunal (Inter-American Court of Human Rights j		178
draw its acceptance of compulsory jurisdi Waste Management, Inc. v. Mexico (William	ction S. Dodge)	186
Arbitral award on jurisdiction under NAJ remedies reserves, and applicant pursues Local Authority of Västerås v. Republic of Icelo	, municipal law claims in other fora	192
Swedish Supreme Court decision on sover costs of educating foreign nationals in pu		
Prefecture of Voiotia v. Federal Republic of Germa	any (Maria Gavouneli & Ilias Bantekas)	198
Greek Supreme Court decision on sovere caused by humanitarian law violations du	ring military occupation	904
Gonzalez ex rel. Gonzalez v. Reno (David Ab Eleventh Circuit review of attorney gene	,	204
cation to prevent child's return to his fat		
Current Developments		
The Fifty-sixth Session of the UN Commission		213
The Fifty-second Session of the Internation	nal Law Commission Robert Rosenstock	221
Book Reviews and Notes Review Essay: Baehr, Peter R. Human Rig Burns H., and Stephen P. Marks (eds.) Rights; Evans, Tony (ed.). Human Rights Thomas, Stephen C. Ropp, and Kathrym	. The Future of International Human 5 Fifty Years On: A Reappraisal; Risse,	
Rights: International Norms and Domestic (Review Essay: Butler, Richard. The Greatest	Change (David P. Stewart)	227
tion, and the Crisis of Global Security (Davi	· · ·	235
Tuck, Richard. The Rights of War and Peace		235 245
Watson, Geoffrey R. The Oslo Accords: Intern	•	245
Peace Agreements (Robbie Sabel)		248
Grant, Thomas D. The Recognition of States: tion (Valerie Epps)	Law and Practice in Debate and Evolu-	252
Watson, J. Shand. Theory and Reality in the	he International Protection of Human	
Rights (Makau Mutua) Shelton, Dinah. Remedies in International H	Juman Rights Lagu (Beth Stephens)	255 957
Cohen, Cynthia Price (ed.). Human Rights		257 260
Juda, Lawrence. International Law and O		
Nordquist)		265
Briefer Notice: Schwartz, Herman. The Str Communist Europe (Eric Stein), 267.	ruggie for Constitutional Justice in Post-	
Collected Essays: German Yearbook of Inte Chinese Yearbook of International Law and		
Books Received		269
International Legal Materials. Contents, Vol.	XXXIX, No. 6 (November 2000); Vol.	074
XL, No. 1 (January 2001)		274

BOARD OF EDITORS

Editors in Chief JONATHAN I. CHARNEY Vanderbilt University School of Law JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ Columbia University School of Law DAVID J. BEDERMAN Emory University School of Law CHARLES N. BROWER Washington, D.C. THOMAS BUERGENTHAL The George Washington University Law School DAVID D. CARON University of California, Berkeley School of Law HILARY CHARLESWORTH Australian National University CHRISTINE M. CHINKIN London School of Economics JOHN R. CROOK Washington, D.C. LORI FISLER DAMROSCH Columbia University School of Law JOAN FITZPATRICK University of Washington School of Law ROBERT E. HUDEC University of Minnesota Law School

W. MICHAEL REISMAN Yale Law School BENEDICT KINGSBURY New York University School of Law FREDERIC L. KIRGIS Washington and Lee University School of Law HAROLD HONGJU KOH Yale Law School MICHAEL J. MATHESON Washington, D.C. SEAN D. MURPHY The George Washington University Law School BERNARD H. OXMAN University of Miami School of Law STEVEN R. RATNER University of Texas School of Law BETH A. SIMMONS University of California, Berkeley ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER Harvard Law School PETER D. TROOBOFF Washington, D.C. **RUTH WEDGWOOD** Yale Law School

CHARLOTTE KU, ex officio

Honorary Editors

GEORGE H. ALDRICH The Hague, Netherlands RICHARD B. BILDER University of Wisconsin Law School RICHARD A. FALK Princeton University THOMAS M. FRANCK New York University School of Law LOUIS HENKIN Columbia University School of Law JOHN H. JACKSON Georgetown University Law Center HAROLD K. JACOBSON University of Michigan MONROE LEIGH Washington, D.C. ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD New York University School of Law THEODOR MERON New York University School of Law

> Associate Editor Anna Ascher

Managing Editor MIEKE J. CLINCY COVEY T. OLIVER Easton, Md. SEYMOUR J. RUBIN Washington College of Law The American University OSCAR SCHACHTER Columbia University School of Law STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL Washington, D.C. LOUIS B. SOHN The George Washington University Law School ERIC STEIN University of Michigan Law School DETLEV F. VAGTS Harvard Law School BURNS H. WESTON University of Iowa College of Law **RICHARD YOUNG** Van Hornesville, N.Y.

Assistant Editor Stephen Scher

Assistant Editor Emerita ELEANOR H. FINCH

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law was organized in 1906 "to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice." Society membership is open to all persons of whatever nationality and profession who are interested in its objectives. Dues are: regular, \$150; special category, \$100; new professional, \$75; retired, \$100; student, \$25. Sustaining Memberships—contributing (\$250) and patrons (\$10,000)—are also available. Corporations may join ASIL as institutional members (\$2,000).

OFFICERS OF THE SOCIETY, 1999–2000

Honorary President	STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL	
President	ARTHUR W. ROVINE	
Vice Presidents	JAMES H. CARTER, DIANE P. WOOD	
Executive Vice President and Executive Director	CHARLOTTE KU	
Past Presidents: Charles N. Brower, Thomas M. Franck, Louis Henkin, Monroe Leigh, Covey T. Oliver, William D. Rogers, Oscar Schachter, Louis B. Sohn, Peter D. Trooboff, Edith Brown Weiss		
Honorary Vice Presidents: CHARLES N. BROWER, THOMAS M. FRANCK, EDITH BROWN WEISS		
Counsellors: JUDITH N. BELLO, RICHARD B. BILDER, JAN BROWNL	IE. THOMAS BUERGENTHAL, HILARY	

Courseums: JUDITH N. BELLO, RICHARD B. BILDER, IAN BROWNLIE, THOMAS BUERGENTHAL, HILARY CHARLESWORTH, CONRAD HARPER, RITA E. HAUSER, ROSALYN HIGGINS, JOHN H. JACKSON, MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI, VIRGINA A. LEARY, LEONARD LEGAULT, CYNTHIA C. LICHTENSTEIN, ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD, VED P. NANDA, W. MICHAEL REISMAN, ELLIOT L. RICHARDSON, HENRY J. RICHARDSON III, SEYMOUR J. RUBIN, JEROME SHESTACK, ERIC STEIN, PAUL C. SZASZ, PHILLIP R. TRIMBLE, CHRISTOPHER WEERAMANTRY

Secretary	FREDERIC L. KIRGIS
Treasurer	OSEPH GUTTENTAG
Assistant Treasurer	NANCY PERKINS

PATRONS OF THE SOCIETY

JOHN KING GAMBLE

Gerald Aksen
ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT
TEYMOUR A. ALIREZA
Frank A. Bauman
MRS. RICHARD BAXTER
JOHN A. BOYD
CHARLES N. BROWER
JAMES H. CARTER
ANTHONY D'AMATO
ARTHUR H. DEAN [*]
SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*
EDWARD DUMBAULD*
RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR.
ALONA E. EVANS*
THOMAS M. FRANCK
ALWYN V. FREEMAN*
* deceased

ALEXANDER FREEMAN

ARTHUR K. KUHN

KEIT WER HOW TO CHAI TO RICH I' SUSA I' SUSA I' SUSA CHAI JLD' MRS. VARDS, JR. BRUY HUSA ICK W. R AN' HER

JOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE VICTORIA M. HARIRI RITA E. HAUSER JOHN N. HAZARD^{*} KEITH HIGHET^{*} HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT RICHARD A. JOHNSON SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN CHARLOTTE KU MRS. RICHARD LILLICH BRUNSON MACCHESNEY^{*} HUSAM MESHAL W. ROBERT MORGAN^{*} HERMAN PHLEGER^{*} WILLIAM D. ROGERS ARTHUR W. ROVINE SEYMOUR J. RUBIN OSCAR SCHACHTER STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL EARL A. SNYDER JOHN R. STEVENSON* ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA GENEVIEVE E. TILLAR* PETER D. TROOBOFF DETLEV F. VAGTS JILL MCCLANAHAN WATSON BURNS H. WESTON EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON BASIL S. YANAKAKIS

IN MEMORIAM

HENRY C. MORRIS

DR. JAMES BROWN SCOTT STANLEY P. SMITH

PATRONAGE, GIFTS AND BEQUESTS

Upon donation to the Society of \$10,000 or more by gift or bequest, any member of the Society or individual eligible for membership may be elected a Patron of the Society. Upon donation of at least \$10,000 in the name of a deceased person, such person may be elected a Patron posthumously. Gifts and bequests may be made in the name of The American Society of International Law, Washington, D.C. Such contributions are deductible from federal returns for income, estate, and gift tax purposes. The Society is incorporated by Act of Congress approved September 20, 1950 (64 Stat. 869).

MANLEY O. HUDSON MEDAL

The American Society of International Law bestows from time to time without regard to nationality a medal to commemorate the life work of Manley O. Hudson. Such awards are made for preeminent scholarship and achievement in international law and in the promotion of the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice. Medals have been awarded to Manley O. Hudson (1956), Lord McNair (1959), Philip C. Jessup (1964), Charles De Visscher (1966), Paul Guggenheim (1970), Myres S. McDougal (1976), Eduardo Jiménez de Aréchaga (1978), Richard Reeve Baxter (1981), Oscar Schachter (1981), Hardy Cross Dillard (1982), Suzanne Bastid (1984), Marjorie M. Whiteman (1985), Leo Gross (1986), Robert Y. Jennings (1993), Louis Henkin (1995), Louis B. Sohn (1996), John R. Stevenson (1997), Rosalyn Higgins (1998), Shabtai Rosenne (1999), and Stephen M. Schwebel (2000).

ORDERS AND INQUIRIES

Subscriptions, Back Issues, and Cumulative Indexes: Orders and inquiries should be sent to the American Journal of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Washington, DC 20008-2864. Fax: (202) 797-7133. Online at <http://www.asil.org>. The American Journal of International Law (ISSN 0002-9300) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and is supplied to all members of The American Society of International Law. The annual subscription rate to nonmembers is \$140 (\$175 outside U.S.). Claims for undelivered issues must be made in writing within six months of the mailing date. Volumes 92 (1998) to date are available from the AJIL at \$160 per volume (\$134 for members), \$45 per single issue (\$38 for members). Volumes 1–91 (1907–1997) are available from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209-1987, U.S.A., toll-free (800) 828-7571. Cumulative indexes are also available from the AJIL: 1941–1960, 1961–1970, and 1971–1980 at \$40; 1981–1990 is out of print.

Shipping/Handling: For back issues and indexes, add 20 percent for shipping and handling.

A[IL is also available in nonprint forms:

- Online through: Mead Data Central, Inc., provider of the LEXIS[®]/NEXIS[®] services,
 P.O. Box 933, Dayton, OH 45401, U.S.A., toll-free (800) 227-9597; and West
 Publishing Company, provider of WESTLAW[®], P.O. Box 64526, St. Paul, MN 55164-0526, U.S.A., toll-free (800) 937-8529.
- On the Web in JSTOR, the archive/database of scholarly journals, either through individual subscriptions by ASIL members only ((202) 939-6000), or through institutional subscriptions (JSTOR, 188 Madison Ave., New York, NY 10016; (212) 592-7345). See http://www.jstor.org for a current list of institutional subscribers.
- On microform, from: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209, U.S.A., toll-free 800-828-7571; and University Microfilms, 300 North Zeeb Road, Dept. P.R., Ann Arbor, MI 48106, U.S.A., toll-free 800-521-0600; or 30–32 Mortimer Street, Dept. P.R., London WIN 7RA, England.
- On CD-ROM format, from: University Microfilms.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use (beyond that permitted by sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law), or for the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by The American Society of International Law for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the base fee of \$5 per copy, plus 25¢ per page, is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. For organizations that have been granted a photocopy license by CCC, a separate system of payment has been arranged. The fee code for users of the Transactional Reporting Service is: 0002-9300/01 \$5.00 + .25. Educational copying is permitted. Please address requests to CCC Academic Permission Service: (978) 750-8400; fax (978) 750-4744.

Advertising: Inquiries should be sent to the Marketing Coordinator, ASIL, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864. Phone: (202) 939-6019; fax (202) 797-7133.

* * * *

Periodicals postage paid at Washington, DC, and at additional mailing office. POST-MASTER: Send change of addresses to American Journal of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Washington, DC 20008-2864.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews and notes, and all other contributions to the $A \Pi L$ are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or The American Society of International Law.

SUBMISSION OF ARTICLES AND BOOK REVIEWS

Manuscripts may be sent to the American Journal of International Law, Vanderbilt University School of Law, 131 21st Avenue South, Suite 207, Nashville, TN 37203-1181, USA, or by E-mail to AJIL@law.vanderbilt.edu. Authors are invited to submit their manuscripts on computer disc or by E-mail attachment. If the manuscript is unavailable in electronic form, four paper copies should be submitted. Manuscripts and discs submitted will not be returned to the author. Please do not submit manuscripts via facsimile. The *AJIL* will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this *Journal*.

The AJIL uses WordPerfect 9.0 and can convert manuscripts created in other word-processing programs into that program. Please specify the word-processing program used for manuscripts submitted in electronic form.

Book reviews are by invitation: suggestions may be made to the Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Washington, DC 20008-2864. **Books for review** should be sent to the same office.

Format and style guidelines: All manuscripts should be double-spaced, with double-spaced footnotes. Our full Author Style Sheet is available online at <http://www.asil.org/styledoc.htm>. Subject to variations noted in that document, the *AJIL* conforms to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000) and the *Chicago Manual of Style* (14th ed. 1993). The style document can also be obtained via e-mail. Please send e-mail requests to mclincy@asil.org. *The Bluebook* can be obtained from the Harvard Law Review Association, Gannett House, 1511 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138.

INDEXES CARRYING AJIL

The American Journal of International Law is included in: ABC POL SCI: A Bibliography of Contents: Political Science and Government; Current Law Index; IBR—International Bibliography of Book Reviews of Scholarly Literature; IBZ—International Bibliography of Periodical Literature; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals; International Political Science Abstracts; Public International Law: A Current Bibliography of Books and Articles; Social Sciences Index.

> Copyright @ 2001 by The American Society of International Law Printed by IPC Communication Services, St. Joseph, MI 49085