

# BBBS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory  
with open peer commentary  
Volume 36 | Issue 1 | February 2013 | ISSN: 0140-525X

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editors

Paul Bloom  
Barbara L. Finlay

**URL:** <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

## E-mail: [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Journals Department  
Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of The Americas  
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

## Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

## Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

## Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin  
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## Editorial Board

### *Affective Neuroscience*

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

### *Atypical Neurodevelopment*

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

### *Behavioral Neurogenetics*

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

### *Cognitive and Decision Sciences*

Nick Chater/University College London

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

### *Cognitive Neuroscience*

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

### *Evolution of Brain and Cognition*

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

### *Evolution of Cognition*

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

### *Philosophy of Science*

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

### *Primate Cognition*

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

### *Social Cognition*

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

### *Social Cognitive Neuroscience*

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

### *Vision, Language and Computation*

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

## FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2013. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 36 (2013) for *institutions* is US \$1288.00 for print and online and US \$1055.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £759.00 for print and online and UK £624.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$374.00 for print and online and US \$337.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £219.00 for print and online and UK £199 for online only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$250.00 (UK £124.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.org](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org); in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk). *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

**Institutional subscribers:** Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

---

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 36:1 February 2013

<b>McCullough, M. E., Kurzban, R. &amp; Tabak, B. A.</b> Cognitive systems for revenge and forgiveness	1
<b>Open Peer Commentary:</b>	
<b>Aureli, F. &amp; Schaffner, C. M.</b> Why so complex? Emotional mediation of revenge, forgiveness, and reconciliation	15
<b>Balliet, D. &amp; Pronk, T. M.</b> Personality, self-control, and welfare-tradeoff ratios in revenge and forgiveness	16
<b>Barclay, P.</b> Pathways to abnormal revenge and forgiveness	17
<b>Beckerman, S.</b> The cultural shaping of revenge	18
<b>Crisp, R. J. &amp; Meleady, R.</b> On the evolutionary origins of revenge and forgiveness: A converging systems hypothesis	19
<b>Dellis, A. &amp; Spurrett, D.</b> An eye for an eye: Reciprocity and the calibration of redress	20
<b>Fatfouta, R., Jacobs, A. &amp; Merkl, A.</b> Towards a multifaceted understanding of revenge and forgiveness	21
<b>Gintis, H.</b> An implausible model and evolutionary explanation of the revenge motive	21
<b>Holbrook, C., Fessler, D. M. T. &amp; Gervais, M. M.</b> Revenge without redundancy: Functional outcomes do not require discrete adaptations for vengeance or forgiveness	22
<b>Johnson-Freyd, S. &amp; Freyd, J. J.</b> Revenge and forgiveness or betrayal blindness?	23
<b>Karremans, J. C. &amp; van der Wal, R. C.</b> It takes more to forgive: The role of executive control	25
<b>Konečni, V. J.</b> Revenge: Behavioral and emotional consequences	25
<b>Konrath, S. &amp; Cheung, I.</b> The fuzzy reality of perceived harms	26
<b>Leiser, D. &amp; Joskowicz-Jablonek, L.</b> On the differential mediating role of emotions in revenge and reconciliation	27
<b>McCoy, M. G. &amp; Shackelford, T. K.</b> No such thing as genuine forgiveness?	28
<b>O'Connor, K. &amp; Adams, G. S.</b> Affective antecedents of revenge	29
<b>Pahlavan, F.</b> Third parties belief in a just world and secondary victimization	30
<b>Petersen, M. B.</b> Adaptationism and intuitions about modern criminal justice	31
<b>Pietraszewski, D.</b> The elementary dynamics of intergroup conflict and revenge	32
<b>Potegal, M.</b> Revenge: An adaptive system for maximizing fitness, or a proximate calculation arising from personality and social-psychological processes?	33
<b>Roberts, S. C. &amp; Murray, J.</b> Applying the revenge system to the criminal justice system and jury decision-making	34
<b>Ross, D.</b> Forgiveness is institutionally mediated, not an isolable modular output	35
<b>Sell, A. N.</b> Revenge can be more fully understood by making distinctions between anger and hatred	36
<b>Stein, D. J., van Honk, J. &amp; Ellis, G.</b> Revenge and forgiveness in the New South Africa	37
<b>Uhlmann, E. L.</b> The logic of moral outrage	38
<b>Wereha, T. J. &amp; Racine, T. P.</b> A systems view on revenge and forgiveness systems	39
<b>Yu, R.</b> Revenge, even though it is not your fault	40
<b>Authors' Response:</b>	
<b>McCullough, M. E., Kurzban, R. &amp; Tabak, B. A.</b> Putting revenge and forgiveness in an evolutionary context	41

<b>Baumard, N., André, J.-B. &amp; Sperber, D.</b> A mutualistic approach to morality: The evolution of fairness by partner choice	59
<b>Open Peer Commentary</b>	
<b>Ainslie, G.</b> Intertemporal bargaining predicts moral behavior, even in anonymous, one-shot economic games	78
<b>Ainsworth, S. E. &amp; Baumeister, R. F.</b> Cooperation and fairness depend on self-regulation	79
<b>Alvard, M. S.</b> Partner selection, coordination games, and group selection	80
<b>Atran, S.</b> From mutualism to moral transcendence	81
<b>Binmore, K.</b> Modeling justice as a natural phenomenon	82
<b>Bonnefon, J.-F., Giroto, V., Heimann, M. &amp; Legrenzi, P.</b> Can mutualistic morality predict how individuals deal with benefits they did not deserve?	83
<b>Bshary, R. &amp; Raihani, N.</b> “Fair” outcomes without morality in cleaner wrasse mutualism	83
<b>Cappelen, A. W. &amp; Tungodden, B.</b> Heterogeneity in fairness views: A challenge to the mutualistic approach?	84
<b>Clark, M. S. &amp; Boothby, E.</b> A strange(r) analysis of morality: A consideration of relational context and the broader literature is needed	85
<b>Cova, F., Deonna, J. &amp; Sander, D.</b> The emotional shape of our moral life: Anger-related emotions and mutualistic anthropology	86
<b>DeScioli, P.</b> Does market competition explain fairness?	87
<b>Dunfield, K. A. &amp; Kuhlmeier, V. A.</b> Evidence for partner choice in toddlers: Considering the breadth of other-oriented behaviours	88
<b>Fessler, D. M. T. &amp; Holbrook, C.</b> Baumard et al.’s moral markets lack market dynamics	89
<b>Gill, M. J., Packer, D. J. &amp; Van Bavel, J.</b> More to morality than mutualism: Consistent contributors exist and they can inspire costly generosity in others	90
<b>Gintis, H.</b> Mutualism is only a part of human morality	91
<b>Graham, J.</b> Beyond economic games: A mutualistic approach to the rest of moral life	91
<b>Guala, F.</b> Bargaining power and the evolution of un-fair, non-mutualistic moral norms	92
<b>Iran-Nejad, A. &amp; Bordbar, F.</b> The paradox of the missing function: How similar is moral mutualism to biofunctional understanding?	93
<b>Kirkby, D., Hinzen, W. &amp; Mikhail, J.</b> Your theory of the evolution of morality depends upon your theory of morality	94
<b>Machery, E. &amp; Stich, S.</b> You can’t have it both ways: What is the relation between morality and fairness?	95
<b>Rachlin, H., Locey, M. L. &amp; Safin, V.</b> Biological evolution and behavioral evolution: Two approaches to altruism	96
<b>Ramlakhan, N. &amp; Brook, A.</b> Sense of fairness: Not by itself a moral sense and not a foundation of a lot of morality	96
<b>Roberts, G.</b> Competitive morality	97
<b>Rochat, P. &amp; Robbins, E.</b> Ego function of morality and developing tensions that are “within”	98
<b>Sachdeva, S., Iliev, R. &amp; Medin, D. L.</b> Non-mutualistic morality	99
<b>Shaw, A. &amp; Knobe, J.</b> Not all mutualism is fair, and not all fairness is mutualistic	100
<b>Tummolini, L., Scorolli, C. &amp; Borghi, A. M.</b> Disentangling the sense of ownership from the sense of fairness	101
<b>Warneken, F.</b> From partner choice to equity – and beyond?	102
<b>Authors’ Response</b>	
<b>Baumard, N., André, J.-B. &amp; Sperber, D.</b> Partner choice, fairness, and the extension of morality	102