

APRIL 2009 ■ VOLUME 103, NUMBER 2

American Journal of International Law



INSIDE THIS ISSUE

- Representation and Power in International Organization: The Operational Constitution and Its Critics
Jacob Katz Cogan

PUBLISHED BY The American Society of International Law

Top-ranked programs at the intersection
of politics, law, science, and ethics
prepare you for a future of change.

Juris Doctor
LLM in American Legal Studies
LLM in Environmental Law

Dual Degree Programs

JD/MPhil with the University of Cambridge, England
JD/MA II with the University of Cergy-Pontoise, France
JD/LLM with the University of Seville, Spain

VERMONT LAW SCHOOL

for the community and the world | www.vermontlaw.edu



WASHINGTON AND LEE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
TRANSNATIONAL LAW INSTITUTE

W&L's LL.M. in United States Law is a one-year program open to a small, highly selective group of foreign-trained lawyers and other graduates of non-U.S. law schools. The program leads to a Master of Law (LL.M.) in United States Law.

- All students enroll in Introduction to United States Law, a 2-credit course offered exclusively to LL.M. students and taught by full-time members of a law faculty renowned for its teaching prowess.
- All other course work for the LL.M. program is elective. Students take the same classes as those offered to those enrolled in the J.D. program, and they study those areas of law of greatest relevance and interest to them. The Washington and Lee curriculum offers a wealth of beginning and advanced courses in all major areas of study, including business and commercial law, taxation, public and private international law, environmental law, and criminal and civil litigation.
- For students with an interest in international law, comparative law, transnational law and trade law, W&L offers a number of great opportunities. Courses include theoretical research seminars, participation in academic journals (including the peer-reviewed German Law Journal), and experiential courses in Cambodia and Liberia.

Interested students should consult our website for additional information at law.wlu.edu/admissions or contact us at LLMAdm@wlu.edu.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

VOL. 103

April 2009

NO. 2

CONTENTS

PAGE

Representation and Power in International Organization: The Operational Constitution and Its Critics

Jacob Katz Cogan 209

After World War II, representation in international organizations evolved through the use of formal and informal arrangements that reconciled conflicting representational principles and interests. This “operational constitution” sometimes moderated regional tensions but most often rewarded power. After elucidating this regime, the author examines contemporary stresses placed on it by those who assert that it does not reflect current power dynamics and those who repudiate informality and preferences, and considers the operational constitution’s future in light of these challenges.

Notes and Comments

Consistently Inconsistent: The International Court of Justice and the Former Yugoslavia (*Croatia v. Serbia*) *Yehuda Z. Blum* 264

Current Developments

The International Law Commission Adopts Draft Articles on Transboundary Aquifers *Stephen C. McCaffrey* 272

International Decisions

Edited by David J. Bederman

Application of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (Georgia v. Russian Federation) (Cindy Galway Buys) 294

International Court of Justice order on provisional measures and application of CERD as a basis of jurisdiction

United States—Continued Suspension of Obligation in the EC–Hormones Dispute (Sungjoon Cho) 299

World Trade Organization Appellate Body report on the continuation of retaliatory trade measures

Yassin Abdullah Kadi & Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council & Commission (Miša Zgonec-Rožej) 305

European Court of Justice judgment on the European Community’s enforcement of UN Security Council sanctions regulations

Hadijatou Mani Koraou v. Republic of Niger (Jean Allain) 311

ECOWAS Community Court of Justice judgment on protection from slavery

R (on the application of Bancoult) v. Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs (Peter H. Sand) 317

UK House of Lords decision on the right of return for internally displaced persons

Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law

Edited by John R. Crook

President Obama Orders Closure of Guantánamo Detention Facilities; Obstacles Remain	325
President Issues Executive Order Banning Torture and CIA Prisons	331
Department of Justice Releases Superseded Memos on Presidential Authority Regarding Treaties, Detentions, and Other Matters	334
D.C. Circuit Finds Political Questions, Dismisses Sudan Pharmaceutical Plant Bombing Suit	336
Swiss Bank Settles U.S. Tax Charges, Mounting U.S. Pressure on Swiss Bank Secrecy	338
UN Representative Nominee Describes U.S. Interests and Priorities at United Nations	340
Comprehensive New Statement of U.S. Arctic Policy	342
United States Protests Chinese Interference with U.S. Naval Vessel, Vows Continued Operations	349
United States Abandons Detention Based on Designation as Enemy Combatant but Maintains Right to Detain Persons Giving Substantial Support to Terrorism	351
Third Circuit Requires Review in Diplomatic Assurances Cases	353
United States Boycotts Durban Review Conference, Will Seek Election to Human Rights Council	355
Military Justice Proceedings Involving Offenses Against Iraqi and Afghan Civilians	358
Blackwater Guards Indicted for 2007 Baghdad Civilian Killings	360
ICJ Rejects Mexico's Request to Interpret <i>Avena</i> but Finds United States Violated Provisional Measures Order	362
Brief Notes	364

Recent Books on International Law

Edited by Richard B. Bilder

Review Essays

Theorizing International Law: The Move to a Literary Optic Morgan, Ed. <i>The Aesthetics of International Law</i> (Tom J. Farer)	368
Dean's List: Power, Institutions, and Achesonian Diplomacy Beisner, Robert L. <i>Dean Acheson: A Life in the Cold War</i> (Jonathan M. Zasloff)	375

Book Reviews

Doyle, Michael W. <i>Striking First: Preemption and Prevention in International Conflict</i> (Davis R. Robinson)	384
O'Connell, Mary Ellen. <i>The Power and Purpose of International Law</i> (Beth A. Simmons)	388
Farrall, Jeremy Matam. <i>United Nations Sanctions and the Rule of Law</i> (Frederic L. Kirgis)	393
Newton, Michael A., and Michael P. Scharf. <i>Enemy of the State: The Trial and Execution of Saddam Hussein</i> (Eric J. Pelofsky and Eric H. Blinderman)	396

Books Received

402

International Legal Materials. Contents, Vol. XLVIII, No. 1

408

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law was organized in 1906 “to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice.” Society membership is open to all persons of any nationality and profession who are interested in its objectives. Dues are: regular, \$180; special, \$120; new professional, \$95; retired, \$120; student, \$35. Sustaining Memberships—contributing (\$300) and patron (\$10,000)—are also available. Institutional sponsorship programs begin at \$5,000. The Society is incorporated by Act of Congress approved September 20, 1950 (64 Stat. 869).

OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2008–2009

Honorary President THOMAS BUERGENTHAL
President LUCY REED
Vice Presidents DONALD F. DONOVAN, CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT, BERNARD H. OXMAN,
ADRIEN WING
Executive Vice President and Executive Director ELIZABETH ANDERSEN
Secretary FREDERIC L. KIRGIS
Treasurer NANCY L. PERKINS
Past Presidents: JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ, CHARLES N. BROWER, JAMES H. CARTER, THOMAS M. FRANCK,
LOUIS HENKIN, ARTHUR W. ROVINE, ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER, PETER D. TROOBOFF, EDITH
BROWN WEISS

Honorary Vice Presidents: JOSÉ E. ALVAREZ, JAMES H. CARTER, ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER

Council Members: DIANE AMANN, ANTHONY ANGHIE, PIETER BEKKER, NATHANIEL BERMAN, PHILIP BOBBITT, CURTIS A. BRADLEY, ALEJANDRO CARBALLO, JANIE CHUANG, LAURA DICKINSON, STEPHANIE FARRIOR, GREGORY FOX, JAMES GATHII, JAMES GOLDSTON, ANNE JOYCE, MAKAU MUTUA, MONICA PINTO, VIKRAM RAGHAVAN, ANTHEA ROBERTS, DAN SAROOSHI, JEFFREY WALKER, SIEGFRIED WIESSNER, RALPH WILDE, NASSIB ZIADÉ

Counsellors: RICHARD B. BILDER, LAURENCE BOISSON DE CHAZOURNES, HANS CORELL, JOHN R. CROOK, DORINDA G. DALLMEYER, JONATHAN FRIED, CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD, RITA HAUSER, JOHN H. JACKSON, HAROLD HONGJU KOH, CHARLOTTE KU, STEPHEN C. MCCAFFREY, GAY MCDUGALL, NICOLAS MICHEL, DOLLIVER NELSON, SANDRA DAY O'CONNOR, JAN PAULSSON, ELIZABETH RINDSKOPF PARKER, WILLIAM HOWARD TAFT IV, PATRICIA WALD, BURNS WESTON, J. HARVIE WILKINSON III, EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON, RÜDIGER WOLFRUM

PROGRAM OF WORK

In addition to publishing the *American Journal of International Law*, the ASIL offers a variety of information resources and participation opportunities for members as well as nonmembers. These programs, best viewed at www.asil.org, include: publications such as *International Legal Materials* and *Studies in Transnational Legal Policy*; electronic bulletins such as *ASIL Insights*, *International Law In Brief*, and *IL.post*; events such as the Annual Meeting and other gatherings in Washington, D.C. and around the world; outreach programs for the justice sector, the media, and other audiences; an array of resources on the ASIL web site, such as the Electronic Information System for International Law (EISIL) and the Guide to Electronic Resources for International Law (ERG); and opportunities to be part of an active network bridging expert and nonexpert communities associated with the development of international law.

PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The ASIL accomplishes much of its work through charitable support. The Society is grateful to its many members who contribute to the annual fund and the endowment, the foundations whose grants fund special programs, and the law firms, publishers, universities, and others that sponsor ASIL activity. The Society is particularly honored to receive contributions through the Patrons program and to be included in our members' estate plans through the ASIL Heritage Circle. We recognize these contributors below.

PATRONS

Patrons of the Society contribute \$10,000 or more to the ASIL Endowment for International Law. Patrons may also be recognized posthumously upon such a donation being made in their name.

DOMINGO E. ACEVEDO	ALWYN V. FREEMAN*	ANDRE NEWBURG
GERALD AKSEN	JOHN KING GAMBLE	SHIGERU ODA
ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT	RONALD E. M. GOODMAN	BERNARD H. OXMAN
GEORGE H. ALDRICH	CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD	JAN PAULSSON
TEYMOUR A. ALIREZA	JOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE	NANCY L. PERKINS
JOSÉ ALVAREZ AND	VICTORIA M. HARIRI	HERMAN PHELEGER*
SUSAN DAMPLO	RITA E. HAUSER	LUCY REED
JAMES G. APPLE	JOHN N. HAZARD*	W. MICHAEL REISMAN
MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI	ALICE AND LOUIS HENKIN	SANG-MYON RHEE
FRANK A. BAUMAN	ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN	ANDRÉS RIGO
MRS. RICHARD BAXTER*	KEITH HIGHET*	DAVIS R. ROBINSON
DAVID J. BEDERMAN AND	HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN	WILLIAM D. ROGERS*
LORRE B. CUZZE	CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT	ARTHUR W. ROVINE
DANIEL L. BETHLEHEM	JOHN H. JACKSON	SEYMOUR J. RUBIN*
RICHARD B. BILDER	ANDREW J. JACOVIDES	PHILIPPE J. SANDS
JOHN A. BOYD	MARK R. JOELSON	OSCAR SCHACHTER*
CHARLES N. BROWER	RICHARD A. JOHNSON	STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL
IAN BROWNIE	SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN	ANNE-MARIE SLAUGHTER
LEE C. BUCHHEIT	FREDERIC L. KIRGIS	ABBY COHEN SMUTNY
THOMAS BUERGENTHAL	CHARLOTTE KU	EARL A. SNYDER*
WILLIAM J. BUTLER	JENNIFER LAKE AND	BARBARA STARK
SUSANA AND HUGO CAMINOS	DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN	ERIC STEIN
CHARLES H. CAMP	JEFFREY LANG	CHARLES W. T. STEPHENSON
DAVID D. CARON	ELIHU LAUTERPACHT	JOHN R. STEVENSON*
JAMES H. CARTER	ROY S. LEE	LAURENCE STORCH
JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD	JEREMY I. AND CANDACE C. LEVITT	ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA
JOHN R. CROOK	CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN	GENEVIEVE E. TILLAR*
ANTHONY D'AMATO	MRS. RICHARD LILLICH	PETER D. TROOBOFF
LORI FISLER DAMROSCH AND	A. VAUGHAN LOWE	DETLEV F. VAGTS
JEAN BAUER FISLER	ANDREAS F. LOWENFELD	CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR.
ARTHUR H. DEAN*	BRUNSON MACCHESNEY*	JILL MCCLANAHAN WATSON
ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II	ROBERT MACCRATE	RUTH WEDGWOOD
SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*	RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD*	EDITH BROWN WEISS
EDWARD DUMBAULD*	EDWARD WATSON MCWHINNEY	BURNS H. WESTON
RICHARD W. EDWARDS, JR.	ROBERT F. MEAGHER	EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON
ALONA E. EVANS*	THEODOR MERON	BASIL S. YANAKAKIS
BENJAMIN B. FERENCZ	HUSAM MESHAL	BRUCE ZAGARIS
THOMAS M. FRANCK	W. ROBERT MORGAN*	NASSIB G. ZIADÉ
	VED P. NANDA	

* deceased

THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

Members who include the ASIL in their estate plans and so notify the Society may join the ASIL Heritage Circle.

ANONYMOUS (2)	SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD*	OSCAR SCHACHTER*
JAMES G. APPLE	CHRISTIAN A. HERTER, JR.*	JOHN R. STEVENSON*
CHARLES N. BROWER	CHARLOTTE KU	GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR*
JAMES H. CARTER	CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN	RICHARD YOUNG
	H.C.L. MERRILLAT	

* granted posthumously

ALEXANDER FREEMAN
ARTHUR K. KUHN

HENRY C. MORRIS

JAMES BROWN SCOTT
STANLEY P. SMITH

IN MEMORIAM

More information about these and other ASIL philanthropic activities can be found at
www.asil.org/aboutasil/financialsupport.html.

ORDERS AND INQUIRIES

Subscriptions, Back Issues, and Cumulative Indexes: The *American Journal of International Law* (ISSN 0002-9300) is published quarterly, with issues in January, April, July, and October, and is supplied to all members of the American Society of International Law. The annual subscription rate for nonmembers is \$200 (\$240 outside North America). Order forms and other information are available online at www.asil.org. Annual subscription orders should be sent to the American Society of International Law, P.O. Box 79516, Baltimore, MD 21279-0516. Claims for undelivered issues must be made either in writing to the American Society of International Law Service Center, 15000 Commerce Parkway, Suite C, Mt. Laurel, NJ 08054, or by e-mail to services@asil.org within six months of the mailing date specified online at www.asil.org/claims.htm. Volumes 1 (1907) to date are available from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209-1987, USA, toll-free (800) 828-7571, or online at www.wshein.com. Cumulative indexes are also available from Hein: 1907–1920, 1921–1940, 1941–1960, 1961–1970, 1971–1980, 1981–1990, and 1991–2000.

AJIL is also available in nonprint forms:

- Online, through: Hein Online, a service of William S. Hein & Co., Inc., at www.heinonline.org; LexisNexis[®], part of Reed Elsevier, at www.lexisnexis.com, P.O. Box 933, Dayton, OH 45401, USA, toll-free (800) 227-9597; and Westlaw[®], part of Thomson Reuters, at www.westlaw.com, 610 Opperman Drive, Eagan, MN 55123, USA, toll-free (800) 937-8529.
- On the Web in JSTOR, the archive/database of scholarly journals, either through individual subscriptions for ASIL members (www.asil.org/jstor.cfm), or through institutional subscriptions (JSTOR, 149 Fifth Avenue, 8th Floor, New York, NY 10010, (212) 358-6400, or www.jstor.org).
- On microform, from: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209, USA, toll-free (800) 828-7571; and National Archive Publishing Company, 300 North Zeeb Road, P.O. Box 998, Ann Arbor, MI 48106, USA, toll-free (800) 420-6272.

For **permission to reuse** materials from the *American Journal of International Law*, please access www.copyright.com, or contact the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA, (978) 646-2600. CCC is a not-for-profit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of users.

Advertising: Inquiries should be sent to AJIL Advertising, American Society of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008, USA.

* * * * *

Periodicals postage paid at Washington, DC, and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send change of addresses to AJIL Change of Address, American Society of International Law Service Center, 15000 Commerce Parkway, Suite C, Mt. Laurel, NJ 08054, USA.

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the American Society of International Law.

SUBMISSION OF MANUSCRIPTS

Manuscripts may be submitted by e-mail to ajil@asil.org or sent by mail to the American Journal of International Law, at the American Society of International Law, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, USA. The *AJIL* does not require exclusive submissions. Manuscripts submitted as an e-mail attachment are preferred. If the manuscript is unavailable in electronic form, four paper copies should be submitted by mail. Please do not submit manuscripts via facsimile. Manuscripts will not be returned to the author. The *AJIL* will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in the *AJIL*. More information about submissions is available online: www.asil.org/ajilsubmissions.cfm.

The *AJIL* uses both Word and WordPerfect. Please specify the word-processing program used for manuscripts submitted in electronic form.

Book reviews are by invitation; suggestions may be made to the Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864. **Books for review** should be sent to the same office.

Format and style guidelines: All manuscripts should be double-spaced, with double-spaced footnotes. The *AJIL* Author Style Guide is available online at www.asil.org/ajil_style_guide.pdf. Subject to variations noted in that document, the *AJIL* conforms to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005) and the *Chicago Manual of Style* (15th ed. 2003). The *AJIL* style guide can also be obtained via e-mail requests to ajil@asil.org. *The Bluebook* can be obtained from the Harvard Law Review Association, Gannett House, 1511 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02138, (617) 495-4650, or www.legalbluebook.com.

INDEXES AND ABSTRACTS CARRYING *AJIL*

The *American Journal of International Law* is included in: *Current Law Index*; *Dietrich's Index Philosophicus*; EBSCOhost databases; Elsevier databases including SCOPUS; GALE databases including *InfoTrac* and *Legal Trac*; H.W. Wilson databases including *Index to Legal Periodicals & Books*, *Index to Legal Periodicals Full Text*, *Index to Legal Periodicals Retrospective*, and *WilsonWeb*; *IBR—International Bibliography of Book Reviews of Scholarly Literature on the Humanities and Social Sciences*; *IBZ—International Bibliography of Periodical Literature*; *Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals*; *International Bibliography of the Social Sciences*; *International Political Science Abstracts*; ProQuest databases including *ProQuest Central*, *ProQuest Law Module*, *ProQuest Military*, and *C S A Political Science & Governments*; *SwetsWise Online Content*; and Thomson Reuters databases including *Current Contents* and *Social Sciences Citation Index*.

Copyright © 2009 by The American Society of International Law
Printed by Cadmus Professional Communications, Lancaster, PA 17601