

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

ISSN 1479-4098



Volume 16 • Issue 2 • August 2019

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Nineteenth-Century Music Review locates music within all aspects of culture in the long nineteenth century, covering the widest possible range of methods, topics and concepts. Articles provide both depth and breadth in their contribution to this expanding field. A rich supply of book, CD, DVD and score reviews reflects the journal's commitment to stimulate and advance critical discussion.

General Editor

BENNETT ZON, *Durham University, UK*

Editorial Board

ANDREAS GIGER
Louisiana State University, USA
BLAKE HOWE (CD/DVD Review Editor)
Louisiana State University, USA
BENJAMIN M. KORSTVEDT (Score Review Editor)
Clark University, USA
HEATHER PLATT (Digital Review Editor)
Ball State University, USA

JAMES WILLIAM SOBASKIE (Book Review Editor)
Mississippi State University, USA
KATHERINE PRESTON
William & Mary, USA
NANCY NOVEMBER
University of Auckland, New Zealand
WILLIAM WEBER
California State University, Long Beach, USA

Advisory Board

PHILIP V. BOHLMAN
University of Chicago, USA
ANDREW BOWIE
Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
SUZANNAH CLARK
Harvard University, USA
NICHOLAS COOK
University of Cambridge, UK
JOHN DEATHRIDGE
King's College, University of London, UK
JAMES DEAVILLE
Carleton University, Canada
JEREMY DIBBLE
Durham University, UK
STEPHEN DOWNES
Royal Holloway, University of London, UK
KATHARINE ELLIS
University of Cambridge, UK
ANNEGRET FAUSER
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA
PETER FRANKLIN
University of Oxford, UK
SOPHIE FULLER
Trinity College of Music, UK
LYDIA GOEHR
Columbia University, USA

THOMAS GREY
Stanford University, USA
SARAH HIBBERD
University of Bristol, UK
JULIAN HORTON
Durham University, UK
LINDA HUTCHEON
University of Toronto, Canada
ALICIA LEVIN
University of Kansas, USA
RALPH LOCKE
Eastman School of Music, USA
ROBERTA MARVIN
University of Massachusetts, USA
SIMON McVEIGH
Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK
JULIAN RUSHTON
University of Leeds, UK
DOUGLASS SEATON
Florida State University, USA
NICHOLAS TEMPERLEY
University of Illinois, USA
SUSAN WOLLENBERG
University of Oxford, UK
SUSAN YOUNGS
University of Notre Dame, USA

SUBSCRIPTIONS *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (ISSN 1479-4098) is published three times a year in April, August and December. Three parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 16 (2019), which includes print and electronic access, is £237 net (US\$375 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions; and £48 net (US\$77 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals, ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts are £91 (US\$144 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT-registered customers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd., P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfilment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA.

COPYING This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$12. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1479-4098/2019. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or from the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at cambridge.org/core.

© Cambridge University Press 2019

Contents

VOLUME 16, ISSUE 2

Notes on Article Contributors	175
-------------------------------	-----

ARTICLES

Erik Stenstadvold Mariano Castro de Gistau (d 1856) and the Vogue for the Spanish Guitar in Nineteenth-Century Britain	177
Sarah Kirby 'The Worst Oratorio Ever!': Colonialist Condescension in the Critical Reception of George Tolhurst's <i>Ruth</i> (1864)	199
Marie Jorritsma The Significance of Small Journeys: Travel and the Congregational Music of Kroonvale, South Africa	229
Kasper van Kooten 'Ein dürftiger Stoff': Hermann and the Failure of German Liberation Opera (1815–1848)	249

BOOK REVIEWS

David Wyn Jones <i>Music in Vienna: 1700, 1800, 1900</i> by Janet K. Page	273
Arman Schwartz and Emanuele Senici, eds. <i>Giacomo Puccini and his World</i> by Ditlev Rindom	277
Bruce P. Gleason <i>Sound the Trumpet, Beat the Drums: Horse-Mounted Bands of the U.S. Army, 1820–1940</i> by Patrick Warfield	282
Christina Bashford and Roberta Montemorra Marvin, eds., <i>The Idea of Art Music in a Commercial World, 1800–1930</i> by Marian Wilson Kimber	286
Charles Youmans <i>Mahler and Strauss: In Dialogue</i> by Thomas Peattie	291

CD REVIEWS

Majella Boland John Field, <i>Complete Nocturnes</i> , Elizabeth Joy Roe pf, Decca 4789672, 2016 (1 CD: 86 minutes)	297
--	-----

Damien Mahiet		
Piotr Il'yich Tchaikovsky, <i>The Nutcracker: Complete Ballet Arranged for Solo Piano</i> , Stewart Goodyear <i>pf</i> , Steinway and Sons 30040, 2015 (1 CD: 82 minutes)	300	
Ingrid E. Pearson		
Franz Danzi, <i>Music for Piano and Winds</i> , Ensemble f2: Steven Devine <i>pf</i> , Katy Bircher <i>fl</i> , James Eastaway <i>ob</i> , Jane Booth <i>cl and bassoon</i> , Anneke Scott <i>hn</i> , Ursula Leveaux <i>bn</i> , Devine Music 2, 2013 (1 CD: 80 minutes); and Devine Music 4, 2015 (1 CD: 70 minutes)	303	
Angela Willoughby		
Ernő Dohnányi, <i>Piano Quintets Op. 1 & 26</i> , Shmuel Ashkenasi <i>vln</i> , Nobuko Imai <i>vla</i> , Trio Nota Bene: Julien Zufferey <i>vln</i> , Xavier Pignat <i>vc</i> , Lionel Monnet <i>pf</i> , Claves 50-1505, 2015 (1 CD: 52 minutes)	306	
Nick Strimple		
Josef Gabriel Rheinberger, <i>Musica sacra</i> , Carus 83.336, 2015 (10 CDs: 585 minutes); Josef Gabriel Rheinberger, <i>Die Wasserfee; Weltliche Lieder und Quartette</i> , Lydia Teuscher <i>sop</i> , Christine Müller <i>mezzo</i> , Andreas Weller <i>ten</i> , Klaus Häger <i>bar</i> , Götz Payer <i>pf</i> , Carus 83.376, 2013 (1 CD: 76 minutes)	308	

DVD REVIEW

James Parsons		
Franz Schubert, <i>Winterreise</i> , Matthias Goerne <i>bar</i> , Markus Hinterhäuser <i>pf</i> , William Kentridge <i>visualizations and stage direction</i> , C Major 738008, 2017 (1 DVD: 85 minutes [concert] +53 minutes [bonus])	311	

SCORE REVIEW

Cecilia Kang		
Johannes Brahms, <i>Sonatas in F minor and E-flat major for Clarinet and Piano, op. 120</i> , edited by Clive Brown and Neal Peres Da Costa, Bärenreiter-Verlag Urtext (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2015)	315	

MULTIMEDIA REVIEW

Elaine Sisman		
<i>Inside the Hearing Machine: Beethoven on His Broadwood; Piano Sonatas Opus 109, 110 and 111</i> , Tom Beghin <i>pf</i> , Evil Penguin Records Classic EPRC 0025, 2017 (1 CD: 63 minutes); <i>Inside the Hearing Machine</i> , Steven Maes <i>director</i> , Evil Penguin Productions and the Orpheus Institut, 2017 (online film: 54 minutes)	317	

DIGITAL RESOURCE REVIEW

F Javier Albo		
Music in Gotham: The New York Scene, 1862–1875	323	

REVIEW ESSAY

- Nicholas Marston
The Analyst's Voice 333