

Professor Gross replies:

I do not intend to discuss theological points or his dissertation with Bogdan Musiał. As to Musiał's scholarship concerning the July 1941 Jedwabne murder, interested readers should consult the forthcoming issue of *Polin: Studies in Polish Jewry* where his critical remarks about *Neighbors* and my reply will be published.

JAN T. GROSS  
New York University

Professor Naimark replies:

I am surprised that Bogdan Musiał would argue with my brief characterization of his viewpoint. He repeatedly makes the case that Jews were overrepresented in the Soviet administration and in Soviet crimes. "It is beyond argument," he writes, "that relatively many militiamen, NKVD informants, and denouncers, who actively and mostly voluntarily took part in Soviet crimes, were of Jewish background" (Bogdan Musiał [Musiał], "*Konterrevolutionäre Elemente sind zu erschiessen*": *Die Brutalisierung des deutsch-sowjetischen Krieges im Sommer 1941*, 2000, 66). I think that claim, which he makes often and in many different forms, is bloated, especially when appropriate sources to back it up are very limited indeed. Musiał also uncritically cites any number of memoirs and accounts that rationalize Polish hatred of the Jews as a consequence of the Jews' (alleged) widespread participation in the Soviet administration and Soviet crimes. One that is characteristic of many is a report from the underground in Strzy: "The entire Polish population has adopted an anti-Jewish attitude, because the Jews cooperate with the Bolsheviks and are hostilely disposed to non-Jews. . . . The people simply hate the Jews" (71). No serious student of the period would question that Polish anti-Semitism intensified as a consequence of the Soviet occupation and its policies. But the causes are much more complex and deep-rooted than the participation of some Jews in the Soviet administration.

NORMAN M. NAIMARK  
Stanford University