

# PMLA

PUBLICATIONS OF  
THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION  
OF AMERICA

*Edited by*  
JOHN HURT FISHER  
*Secretary of the Association*

December • 1967

VOLUME LXXXII • NUMBER 7

# The Modern Language Association of America

ORGANIZED 1883

INCORPORATED 1900

## OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1967

*President:* GEORGE WINCHESTER STONE, JR., *New York University*  
*First Vice President:* OTIS HOWARD GREEN, *University of Pennsylvania*  
*Second Vice President:* HENRY NASH SMITH, *University of California, Berkeley*  
*Executive Secretary:* JOHN HURT FISHER, *New York University*  
*Treasurer and Director of Programs:* KENNETH W. MILDENBERGER, *Modern Language Association*

## EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

For the term ending 31 December 1967

MADELEINE DORAN, *Univ. of Wisconsin*  
VICTOR ERLICH, *Yale Univ.*  
GEORGE J. METCALE, *Univ. of Chicago*

For the term ending 31 December 1968

CHANDLER B. BEALL, *Univ. of Oregon*  
CLAUDE M. SIMPSON, JR., *Stanford Univ.*  
CARL WOODRING, *Columbia Univ.*

For the term ending 31 December 1969

MORTON BLOOMFIELD, *Harvard Univ.*  
ROBERT B. HEILMAN, *Univ. of Washington*  
JOHN W. KNELLER, *Oberlin Coll.*

For the term ending 31 December 1970

WILLIAM T. BANDY, *Univ. of Wisconsin*  
C. LOMBARDI BARBER, *Univ. of Buffalo*  
LISELOTTE DIECKMANN, *Washington Univ.*

## TRUSTEES OF INVESTED FUNDS

F. B. ADAMS, JR., *Pierpont Morgan Library,*  
*Managing Trustee*

C. WALLER BARRETT, *Charlottesville, Va.*  
GORDON N. RAY, *Guggenheim Foundation*

Annual dues for membership in the Association, which includes subscription to *PMLA*, are \$15 except for the following special categories: a) student membership at \$7, open for a maximum of four years to those who are engaged primarily in a course of study leading to a degree and who do not hold full-time teaching appointments; b) joint husband-and-wife membership at \$22 with only one subscription to *PMLA*; c) foreign membership at \$10, open to resident citizens of countries other than the United States and Canada.

The subscription price of *PMLA* for libraries and other institutions is \$20 in the United States and Canada and \$18 in other countries. Agents deduct \$2 of these sums as their fee; institutions which subscribe directly may retain the same amount and remit \$18 or \$16. Prior to 1966 there were six issues a year: March, May Bibliography, June, September (Parts 1 and 2), and December. Single copies of the March, June, September (Part 1), and December issues may be obtained for \$3 each; the May Bibliography and September Directory (Part 2) issues for \$4. Beginning with 1966 there are seven issues a year: March, May, June Bibliography, September Directory, October, November Program, and December. Copies of the March, May, October, November Program, and December issues may be obtained for \$3 each; the June Bibliography and September Directory issues for \$4. Issues for the current and preceding year are available from the MLA Materials Center. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within one year of the publication date; thereafter the single issue price will be charged.

For information about the availability of back issues, inquire of the MLA Materials Center, 62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011. Early and current volumes may be obtained on microfilm from University Microfilms, 313 N. 1st St., Ann Arbor, Mich. Purchase of current volumes on film is restricted to subscribers of the journal.

OFFICE OF PUBLICATION  
Curtis Reed Plaza, Menasha, Wisconsin

EDITORIAL OFFICES  
62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011

All communications including notice of changes of address should be sent NOT TO MENASHA but to the Membership Office of the Association at 62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011. If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation, the Membership Office should be informed of this fact at the same time.

Entered as second class matter at the post office at Menasha, Wis., under act of March 3, 1879. Subject to the provisions of §§ 7 and 8, Sec. 10, P. L. and R.

Acceptance for mailing at the special rate of postage provided for in the Act of February 28, 1925, embodied in paragraph 4, section 538, P. L. and R., authorized October 2, 1935.

©1967 by The Modern Language Association of America.

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BY THE GEORGE BANTA COMPANY, INC., MENASHA, WISCONSIN

## CONTENTS · DECEMBER

LIV. Eugenio Montale's "Motets": The Occasions of Epiphany. By GLAUCO CAMBON.....	471
LV. Real Life or Spectacle? A Conflict in Eighteenth-Century German Drama. By ROBERT R. HEITNER.....	485
LVI. The Pardoner's Ale and Cake. By ROBERT E. NICHOLS, JR.....	498
LVII. Theoretics or Polemics? Milton Criticism and the "Dramatic Axiom." By ROGER B. WILKENFELD.....	505
LVIII. Swift's Use of Literalization as a Rhetorical Device. By MAURICE J. QUINLAN.....	516
LIX. Mrs. Elizabeth Rowe: The Novel as Polemic. By JOHN J. RICHETTI... ..	522
LX. The Discipline and Significance of Form in <i>Vanity Fair</i> . By EDGAR F. HARDEN.....	530
LXI. Politics, Comedy, Character, and Dialectic: The Shavian World of <i>John Bull's Other Island</i> . By FREDERICK P. W. MCDOWELL.....	542
LXII. The Discovery of Reality in Iris Murdoch's <i>The Bell</i> . By SHARON KAEHELE and HOWARD GERMAN.....	554
LXIII. Conservation in Cooper's <i>The Pioneers</i> . By E. ARTHUR ROBINSON..	564
LXIV. <i>The House of the Seven Gables</i> : New Light on Old Problems. By FRANCIS JOSEPH BATTAGLIA.....	579
LXV. "My voice is still for Setchell": A Background Study of "Jim Smiley and His Jumping Frog." By EDGAR M. BRANCH.....	591
LXVI. The Definitive <i>Billy Budd</i> : "But aren't it all sham?" By PAUL BRODTKORB, JR.....	602
LXVII. Whitman and the Early Development of William Carlos Williams. By JAMES E. BRESLIN.....	613
LXVIII. The Structure of Villon's <i>Testament</i> . By RICHARD TERDIMAN.....	622
LXIX. Fromentin's <i>Dominique</i> : The Confession of a Man Who Judges Himself. By RENÉE RIESE HUBERT.....	634
LXX. A New Reading of Gide's <i>La Porte étroite</i> . By LORING D. KNECHT... ..	640
<i>Notes, Documents, and Critical Comment</i> : 1. Antonio in <i>The Merchant of Venice</i> (by LAWRENCE W. HYMAN and THOMAS H. FUJIMURA).....	649
"For Members Only": News and Comment.....	A-2

# PMLA

Issued seven times a year during the months of March, May, June,  
September, October, November, and December by the Modern  
Language Association of America

(Indices: Vols. I-L, 1935, LI-LX, 1945, LI-LXXIX, 1964)

## EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

EDWARD E. BOSTETTER, 1971  
*University of Washington*  
JEROME H. BUCKLEY, 1968  
*Harvard University*  
J MILTON COWAN, 1970  
*Cornell University*  
E. TALBOT DONALDSON, 1971  
*Columbia University*  
LEON EDEL, 1968  
*New York University*  
G. BLAKEMORE EVANS, 1969  
*Harvard University*  
ZBIGNIEW FOLEJEWSKI, 1969  
*University of Illinois*  
DONALD FRAME, 1968  
*Columbia University*  
GORDON S. HAIGHT, 1969  
*Yale University*

FREDERICK J. HOFFMAN, 1969  
*University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee*  
LOUIS A. LANDA, 1968  
*Princeton University*  
JEAN MISRAHI, 1972  
*Fordham University*  
GEORGE NORDMEYER, 1972  
*Hunter College*  
HENRY H. H. REMAK, 1971  
*Indiana University*  
HALLETT D. SMITH, 1971  
*California Institute of Technology*  
WILLARD THORP, 1970  
*Princeton University*  
BRUCE W. WARDROPPER, 1969  
*Duke University*

*Editor:* JOHN HURT FISHER

*Assistant Editor:* WILLIAM PELL

*Advertising Manager:* RICHARD HANSINK

## A STATEMENT OF EDITORIAL POLICY

*PMLA* endeavors to represent the most distinguished contemporary scholarship and criticism in the modern languages and literatures. It welcomes either new or traditional approaches by either young or established scholars, providing only that whatever it publishes is well written and likely to be of permanent value. The distribution of papers in *PMLA* should reflect work of distinction actually being done from year to year, regardless of periods or languages. Members who feel their interests neglected by this policy are urged to write and to encourage others to write articles good enough to be published.

Since its audience is the total membership of the Association, *PMLA* is reluctant to publish minor articles or highly technical studies addressed to specialists in limited fields. Nor does it encourage brief notes or unduly long papers. *PMLA* does not review books. Articles should be written in a clear, concise, and attractive style, with documentation held to a necessary minimum.

Any member of the Association has the privilege of submitting papers for publication in *PMLA*. Each paper submitted will be read by at least one consultant with special competence in the field concerned and, if in any way recommended, it will also be read by at least one member of the Editorial Committee. Attempt is made to publish papers within nine months of acceptance. If a decision to accept or reject a paper seems unduly delayed, contributors are reminded that the consultant readers and the Editorial Committee are distinguished men and women who generously contribute their scant leisure to the advancement of scholarship in humane letters.

Manuscripts must be prepared in conformity with the *MLA Style Sheet*, published in the April 1951 *PMLA* and on sale as a pamphlet in the MLA offices. Authors are urged to read also the advice of R. B. McKerrow and H. M. Silver on scholarly publication, published in the April 1950 *PMLA*, and "The Publication of Academic Writing," by Oscar Cargill, William Charvat, and Donald D. Walsh, in the Sept. 1966 *PMLA*, both also on sale as pamphlets. Manuscripts should be addressed to the Editor of *PMLA*, 62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011. *Carbon copies are not needed, but should be made and retained by the author.*