

## Book Notices

**Nancy Tomes**, *The art of asylum-keeping: Thomas Story Kirkbride and the origins of American psychiatry*, Studies in Health, Illness, and Caregiving, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994, pp. xxxv, 387, illus., £13.95 (paperback 0-8122-1539-7).

Since its publication in 1984, Nancy Tomes's *A generous confidence: Thomas Story Kirkbride and the art of asylum-keeping, 1840–1883* has served as a model for historical monographs on psychiatric institutions, and the present volume is its paperback edition, with a new introduction. Tomes presents her meticulous scholarship and sensitive readings of primary sources in lucid and highly readable prose. Although written as a monograph on an individual institution, Tomes's argument goes far beyond that, showing sound grasp of the resonance between shifting practice within the asylum and the rapidly changing American society of the nineteenth century. She is often aware of the international dimension of psychiatry and of fruitful use of comparative approach to the history of psychiatry, providing a warning against the tendency of some social historians of psychiatry to lose sight of the national and international woods for the local trees. Probably most importantly, she has pioneered a particularly resourceful and important field of research, i.e., the families of hospitalized patients, and has shown that the families' anxiety and concern played a key role—both positive and negative—in the development of nineteenth-century theory and practice of asylum medicine to console and control the patients. Not least for its now affordable price (about one-third of the original hard cover edition), this stimulating and resourceful book should be on the shelf of every student of the history of psychiatry, regardless of the country of his or her special interest.

**Paola Giacomoni** (ed.), *Immagini del corpo in età moderna*, Labirinti 8, University of Trento, 1994, pp. 282, no price given (88-86135-33-5).

This book collects the proceedings of a seminar held at the University of Trento in spring 1992. By unravelling the intellectual roots of the mechanistic approach to the body and the controversies it engendered up to the beginning of Romantic *Naturphilosophie*, it aims to provide a historical framework for recent philosophical and political discussion of the body—and more generally the living nature.

The key words of the title, “images of the body”, suggest that a history of ideas approach provides the common ground for the eight papers, whose authors belong to the Italian tradition of philosophical studies. Accordingly, in tackling early modern images of the body, they do not even mention related social or political practices. The contents of the book are indeed of uneven quality: I shall point out the best articles.

The debate on mechanism is at the core of the book. Renato Mazzolini argues that the lexicon of crafts had shaped representations of the body well before seventeenth-century mechanism, as the Renaissance notion of the body as a *fabrica* shows. René Descartes' investigations into body–soul links, particularly from the point of view of the passions, are the topic of Guido Canziani's lucid discussion, while mechanism's controversial legacy in eighteenth-century philosophical and medical debates is analysed by Mariafranca Spallanzani. Paola Giacomoni's comment on Goethe's organicist understanding of nature shifts the focus to the end of the eighteenth century and concludes the book.

**Jole Agrimi and Chiara Crisciani**, *Les Consilia médicaux*, transl. Caroline Viola, *Typologie des Sources du Moyen Age Occidental* vol. 69, Turnhout, Brepols, 1994, pp. 106, Belgian Francs 1100.00.

This volume appears in a series dedicated to establishing a typology of sources used by medieval historians. Each volume in the series promises to define a particular genre, describe its characteristics, trace its origins and evolution, and establish the special rules of historical interpretation that reveal how the genre can best be used to reconstruct the past. This approach is closely followed by Agrimi and Crisciani in their examination of the genre of medieval medical *consilia*. As the authors explain, a *consilium* was a text written by a physician at the request of somebody else that treated of a particular illness as it presents itself in a particular patient. In this text the physician gives his definition of the illness and his prescription of the appropriate treatment. The authors explain that *consilia* come in many different forms, each with its own distinct structure and set of characteristics. Moreover, they point out the difficulties in distinguishing *consilia* from other similar literary genres of medical practice such as *receptae*, *experimenta* and *regimina sanitatis*. The authors then chart the evolution of the *consilium*. They trace the development of its structure from its early manifestations in the late thirteenth century to its final form in the second half of the fifteenth century. They also examine the changing nature of collections of *consilia*, showing how different principles of selection and ordering were incorporated into these collections by their authors, scribes and editors. In light of the diversity of its forms the authors admit that no hard and fast rules of interpretation can be laid down for this genre. They do, however, suggest useful ways of approaching *consilia* according to the specific characteristics of each text. The significance of *consilia* as sources for the study of late medieval medical history has already been pointed out in the works of Lockwood and Siraisi. What is new here is the emphasis on the epistemological structure of the

*consilium*, its doctrinal characteristics and its canonical form. The work also underlines the great diversity of forms represented by this genre. This is a valuable analysis of *consilia* and a timely reminder for the need for further research upon these valuable texts.

**Wolfgang U Eckart, Robert Jütte** (eds), *Das europäische Gesundheitssystem: Gemeinsamkeiten und Unterschiede in historischer Perspektive*, Medizin, Gesellschaft und Geschichte, Beiheft 3, Stuttgart, Franz Steiner, 1994, pp. 211, DM 66.00 (3-515-06485-0).

The interrelationship between medicine and national contexts, as the title suggests, is what this volume seeks to address. Scrutinizing the concept of medical science as being international and border-less, the various contributions explore differences and similarities in European medical cultures, as well as the role and influence of European or western medical models in African countries.

The result is a collection of articles which cover an enormous breadth of topics and centuries. The first of them compares plague-control in Italy, Germany and England. This is followed by 'The theory and practice of cholera-control in the 19th century. Germany and Italy in comparison'. The next contribution looks at the border-crossing of scientific knowledge via the "learned letter" in the seventeenth century. Next comes an examination of the concept of "medicalization" for the period from 1750 to 1850 in French, German, and British scholarship. This is followed by an article on European medicine in colonial Africa during the Second German Empire. Finally, the volume concludes with 'AIDS in Africa: socio-cultural factors and epidemiological dynamics as exemplified in Uganda'.

The reader might be left a bit dizzy after this journey in time, space and subject-matter and might wonder if the question of how medicine is or is not bound to national contexts is enough to hold these articles together.

However, the contributions are generally interesting in themselves. Moreover, as it is pointed out in the introduction, comparative studies in the history of medicine are rare and this volume is a welcome reminder of the need and fruitfulness of this analytical approach.

**Wolfram Fischer, Klaus Hierholzer, Michael Hubenstorf, Peter Th Walther, Rolf Winau** (eds), *Exodus von Wissenschaften aus Berlin: Fragestellungen—Ergebnisse—Desiderate. Entwicklungen vor und nach 1933*, Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin, Forschungsbericht 7, Berlin and New York, Walter de Gruyter, 1993, pp. x, 673, DM 276.00 (3-11-013945-6).

Studies of modern refugees have to date examined the points for departure rather than the receiving contexts. Although only one chapter (by Daniel Nadav on public health in Palestine) deals with a point of arrival, this work is nevertheless an important contribution to the genre because of Berlin's key role as an academic centre. The volume (published by the now defunct Academy of Sciences in Berlin) presents the results of a research project on emigration in which Michael Hubenstorf had responsibility for the medical emigration. He has fulfilled his brief excellently in an introductory essay (co-authored with Peter Walther) on the structural changes in Berlin science, and he has embellished this and other chapters with rich footnotes. As medicine lost the highest proportion of all sciences as a result of the dismissals, Hubenstorf has had a key role in shaping the volume. The numerous chapters cover a range of academic disciplines, but are uneven in quality ranging from some excellent case studies of a range of disciplines to the apologetic and quirky sketch by Kristie Mackrakis, defending the record of the Kaiser Wilhelm Gesellschaft. Medical contributions are dominated by the magisterial analysis by Hubenstorf on the emigration and scientific developments under Nazism. Rolf Winau discusses a range of specialisms in which 3,000 out of 6,800 doctors lost their jobs, and

there are case studies of such specialisms as haematology (by Peter Voswinckel), surgery (by Hans-Uwe Lamel) and paediatrics (by Thomas Lennert). Well constructed biographical tables conclude the volume: that these remain incomplete indicates the importance of further studies of forced emigration of academics and the professions.

**Susan E Lederer**, *Subjected to science: human experimentation in America before the Second World War*, Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995, pp. xvi, 192, £27.50 (0-8018-4820-2).

Chronicling and explaining how and why physicians in twentieth-century America conducted experiments on human beings without their approval and for non-therapeutic ends might seem a daunting research project. After all, physicians were hardly likely to report such practices in detail. Some did, however, and their admissions (only sometimes confessions) form the basis of Susan Lederer's study. Lederer has put together what evidence there seems to be of human experimentation of this sort and also much of that done with consent and for therapeutic ends although she has concentrated on areas where "consent" seems distinctly grey. Judging from the rich variety of sources she has trawled it seems unlikely there is much more to find. She takes the story as far as the Second World War, after which the ethics of human experimentation became a public and well documented issue. It is an engrossing tale with episodes spanning the most flagrant violations of rights (the Tuskegee Syphilis Study being the best known) to the virtually suicidal self-experimentation of some scientists. As she shows, the whole history of human experimentation is closely woven into the animal vivisection question. Before the Second World War antivivisectionists depicted human experimentation as the next step researchers would take after their intervention into the physiology of beasts. Interestingly, as Lederer observes, since the Second World War this

## Book Notices

argument has gradually disappeared, as a paternalistic protectionism towards animals has been replaced by a more strident language of animal rights. Lederer charts very neatly the extremely volatile history of human experimentation with the antivivisectionists at one extreme, reckless physicians at the other, and diplomats, but committed experimenters, such as Walter Bradford Cannon, in the middle. This is a useful book which by its very nature has to leave open the question of whether there was far more human experimentation done than recorded. By the nature of the evidence too, the book deals mainly with larger scale studies and hardly begins to address the question of whether the myriad deviations from routine procedure which went on, and go on every day, in medicine constitute "experiments". Nevertheless, what Lederer shows is that the human experimentation debate which became so heated in America after the war has a significant history. Issues such as the meaning of "informed consent" were inheritances, not newly found problems.

**J T M van der Heyden**, *Het ziekenhuis door de eeuwen. Over geld, macht en mensen* [The hospital through the ages: on money, power and people], Rotterdam, Erasmus, 1994, pp. 128, illus., Hfl 35.00 (90-5235-068-X).

This book deals with the genesis of the modern hospital in relation to money, power and people. On the basis of secondary literature, the author sketches the development of the hospital, nursing, finances and hospital architecture over a period of twenty centuries. The most interesting chapter is concerned with the financial aspects and accessibility of health care, in which particular attention is paid to recent developments. Indeed, it is the current controversy between the state, medical specialists and health insurance companies which has inspired van der Heyden, a practising internist with an interest in history, to write this historical survey. In this context the author is not afraid of giving his own opinions of present developments (pp. 99–105).

It will be evident that, in view of the period the book covers, the subjects are not dealt with in any depth. Thus the author's observations lack nuances or the integration of comparatively new medico-historical interpretations. For example, he works on the outdated assumption that the spectacular medical discoveries of the nineteenth century were exclusively responsible for the development of the modern hospital. This takes no account of the studies by Morris Vogel and others.

In this compilation the author often makes very literal use of existing literature, both as regards choice of words and also in the arrangement of his material. This book, though smoothly written and very well illustrated, offers no fresh insight into the history of the genesis of the Dutch hospital. That study has yet to be written.

**Michael Hagner, Hans-Jörg Rheinberger and Bettina Wahrig-Schmidt** (eds), *Objekte, Differenzen und Konjunkturen: Experimentalsysteme im historischen Kontext*, Berlin, Akademie Verlag, 1994, pp. 317, illus., DM 78.00 (3-05-002585-9).

This is the second volume in a series of publications which resulted from the Lübeck conferences dedicated to the historical context of "experimental systems in bio-medical science". It contains papers in German by twelve authors, mainly German historians but there are also Dutch, English and French contributions.

The first part of the volume centres around known nineteenth-century experimental practices, i.e., Virchow's cell theory and the subsequent use of the cell as a microscopical object, F C Donder's experiments on the ophthalmological problems of visual accommodation; and Kraepelin's experiments on mental capacities such as memory, to name but a few. The remainder of the work embraces twentieth-century history, focusing mainly on experimental research in neurophysiology and molecular biology, for the editors regard these

two domains of modern life sciences as generators of future scientific activity and scientific knowledge. Lily Kay examines conceptual changes in molecular biology and genetics which occurred during the 1940s and 1950s. She suggests that the observed epistemological conversion in life sciences is linked to the emergence of cybernetics rather than a direct result of molecular biological research itself. Soraya de Chadarevian examines the development of the 'Laboratory for molecular biology' in Cambridge between 1958 and 1962. All the authors assume that "experimental systems" are not mere complex configurations of instruments but involve a perplexing multiplicity of tacit knowledge. This volume itself is of an experimental nature in that it attempts to expand traditional systems of historiography (institutional history, social history, history of ideas, biography) beyond their present boundaries. Hagner, Rheinberger and Wahrig-Schmidt hope to initiate with this volume an exchange between established modes of representation and unexplored methods used in, for example, the history of arts, literature, media and cultural anthropology.

**Joel D Howell** (ed.), *Medical lives and scientific medicine at Michigan, 1891–1969*, Ann Arbor, University of Michigan Press, 1993, pp. vii, 199, illus., £37.50 (0-472-10465-9).

The clinical research undertaken at the University of Michigan at Ann Arbor in the twentieth century has been overshadowed by the studies carried out at Johns Hopkins or the Rockefeller Institute Hospital. But, for example, the work of Frank Wilson on electrocardiography or Thomas Francis Jr, on the design of the trial for the Salk Polio vaccine stand second to none. Through a series of medical lives this work goes about setting the record straight. After an editorial introduction and a useful survey of medical education and research at Michigan by Kenneth Ludmerer seven biographies follow.

The study of Louis Harry Newburgh also has a "Remembrance" appended by a former colleague, Alexander Leaf. Remarkably even in tone, the biographies are appreciative without slipping into eulogy. Besides Newburgh, Wilson and Francis, there are biographies of George Dock, Albion Walter Hewlett and Cyrus Cressey Sturgis. Most of the authors acknowledge the wider contexts of their subject's work but this is not an element that is strongly developed. Naomi Rogers, for example, points to the significance of Newburgh's studies of nutrition in relation to interest in industrial fatigue but the exact nature of the relationship, presumably space not permitting, is never developed. The wider historiographical issues that follow from such things are not pursued anywhere either. The significance of capitalist philanthropic funding for medicine, for example, a subject which has been widely debated, is not addressed. Well researched and adequately footnoted, however, these essays will prove a useful guidebook for those interested in exploring higher ground. But at this price, most readers will only have it on loan.

**Jennifer Burton and John Bland**, *Nuneaton hospitals: the first hundred years*, Arley, Warwickshire, Springhill Publications, 1994, pp. 114, illus., £5.95 (1-873405-02-2).

An understandable sense of radical change and of eras ending currently pervades the NHS in the wake of the post-1989 health service reforms. This sensibility is generally reflected in recent local hospital histories. *Nuneaton Hospitals* is no exception, its story focusing on a 1943 remark by Dr Edward Nason, "the people of Nuneaton have always supported the hospital in all ways they could, the hospital has returned this support by its service to the people. Long may this partnership flourish". The book's authors conclude that the people of North Warwickshire must ensure that current radical changes do not interfere with this special relationship. The clear political message lends interest to an otherwise standard

## Book Notices

amateur account of the hospitals' personnel and facilities. Generously illustrated.

**Bernhard Naunyn**, *Memories, thoughts and convictions*, ed. David L Cowan, Resources in Medical History, Canton, MA, Science History Publications, 1994, pp. xiii, 371, illus., \$30.00 (0-88135-059-1).

Bernhard Naunyn (1839–1925) is one of the eminent figures in the development of German scientific medicine during the second half of the nineteenth century. His personal recollections published originally in German in 1925 draw a vivid picture of medical activity and the pursuit of academic careers in the German States of the time. The book gives an interesting account of medical education in Berlin during the 1860s as the author worked as a student with Carl Reichert, Johann Lucas Schönlein, Theodor Frerichs and Bernhard von Langenbeck. Together with other young *Assistenten*, amongst them H Quincke and E Hitzig, Naunyn founded the *Clinicians Thursday Club* as a meeting point for clinically oriented young medical men. The struggle to integrate clinical practice and scientific laboratory work has to be seen as the focal point of his scientific work and his conception of medicine. The commitment to advance this major and, even today, difficult task, appears steadily along the pages of the memoirs. Naunyn's scientific work lies not surprisingly in the field of diseases related to metabolic disorders such as diabetes and cholelithiasis.

His academic career included two-year stays in Dorpat (1869–71) and Bern (1871–1872) followed by two lasting appointments in Königsberg (1872–1888) and finally Strasbourg from 1888 to his retirement in 1904, due to ill health. Beyond the "major medical autobiography" Naunyn relates an interesting and broad view of the interference of scientific and political issues in Germany's rise as a leading country for medical education and research. The name and subject indexes added to the translation are very helpful. This is particularly true since chronological order is

not always followed in the presentation. This English translation of Naunyn's recollections is of interest to anyone concerned about nineteenth-century academic Germany, scientific medicine, or medical practice during that time.

**Patrick Dignan**, *A doctor's experiences of life*, Bishop Auckland, Durham, The Pentland Press, 1994, pp. xii, 129, illus., £10.50 (1-85821-136-0).

This short but endearing book surveys the life and distinguished career of Major General Patrick Dignan, CB, MBE—one of the last in a long line of British Army doctors to have graduated from Trinity College Dublin.

Despite coming from a family which had close associations with the army, Dignan's military career was far from preordained. At the age of thirty he found that he had been living in England long enough to be eligible for National Service, despite being an Irish citizen. Most of his National Service was spent in Malaya, and he received an MBE for his part in counter-insurgency operations there. After a brief spell in "civvie-street", Dignan was persuaded to rejoin the army on a regular commission, and he afterwards served with distinction in the UK, Germany, Hong Kong, Nepal and Singapore, among other places. This long and varied career was capped in 1973 by his promotion to Director of Army Surgery and Consulting Surgeon to the Army; a post which he held until retirement from the army in 1978. Dignan worked afterwards as a consultant in surgery in the NHS, but maintained links with the army as President of the Army Medical Boards.

Patrick Dignan tells his story with warmth and humour, and the book is rich in amusing and insightful anecdote. But his life is informative as well as entertaining and the student of military medicine will find much of interest here, particularly in Dignan's accounts of the medical aspects of counter-insurgency operations in Malaya, and of U.S. Army medical services in Vietnam, which he experienced first-hand as an official observer.

## Book Notices

**Jerry Bryan Lincecum and Edward Hake Phillips** (eds), *Adventures of a frontier naturalist: the life and times of Dr. Gideon Lincecum*, College Station, Texas A&M University Press, 1994, pp. xxxvii, 321, illus., \$35.00 (hardback 0-89096-592-7), \$14.95 (paperback 0-89096-603-6).

Four overlapping autobiographical texts have been stitched together and supplied with a lengthy introduction to rescue from oblivion this salty, self-taught Southern frontiersman, cousin to Jim Bowie of the famous knife. With no previous training and only what he had learned from books to go on, Lincecum took to practising medicine in early middle age after many years of aimless wandering; but two years of the standard system of bleeding and strong drugs undermined his belief in its efficacy and turned him into a Thomsonian. Convinced that "Northern" treatments were ill-suited to "Southern" complaints, he sought out a Choctaw versed in Indian herbal lore and, armed with a battery of remedies gained from that source, proceeded to build up a prosperous practice in Columbus, Mississippi. Retirement to Texas in 1848 allowed him a final quarter of a century in which to devote himself to natural history, collecting specimens by the thousand for leading museums in Europe as well as America and corresponding internationally—including with Darwin on the subject of ants. Much of the book is essentially hunting reminiscences, but historians of botanic medicine should find it a useful, and very readable, first-hand account.

### BOOKS ALSO RECEIVED

(The inclusion of a title does not preclude the possibility of subsequent review. Items received, other than those assigned for review,

are ultimately incorporated into the collection of the Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine.)

**Josep L Barona** (ed.), *Trobades: Malaltia i cultura*, Valencia, Seminari d'Estudis sobre la Ciència, 1995, pp. 273, no price given (84-920303-1-3).

**Sarah Key**, *Body in Action*, London, Penguin Books, BBC Books, 1995, pp. 184, £5.99 (0-14-024678-9).

**Roy MacLeod and Philip F Rehbock** (eds), *Darwin's laboratory: evolutionary theory and the natural history of the Pacific*, Honolulu, University of Hawai'i Press, 1995, pp. x, 540, illus., \$45.00 (0-8248-1613).

**Juan Antonio Micó Navarro**, *Catálogo del Fondo Sánchez-Quintanar*, Cuadernos Valencianos de Historia de la Medicina y de la Ciencia 43, Serie C, Valencia, Instituto de Estudios Documentales e Históricos sobre la Ciencia, Universitat de València - CSIC, 1994, pp. 385, no price given (84-370-1466-2).

**Suzanne Porter**, *Conquering arthritis: a positive program for a healthier life*, London, Penguin, 1995, pp. 124, Aust. \$19.95 (0-14-023890-5).

**María José Ruiz Somavilla**, "El cuerpo limpio". *Análisis de las prácticas higiénicas en la España del mundo moderno*, Universidad de Málaga, 1994, pp. 146, no price given (84-7496-248-X).

**Michael Smith and Alex Sakula**, *Hospital names*, London, Royal Society of Medicine Press, 1994, pp. 108, illus., £10.00 (1-85315-241-2).