

# Nineteenth- Century Music Review

**a**  
ASHGATE

Volume 1, Issue 2



# NINETEENTH-CENTURY MUSIC REVIEW

VOLUME 1, ISSUE 2  
2004

**ASHGATE**

Published in association with the Centre for  
Nineteenth-Century Music, University of Durham, UK

*Letters to the Editor* We hope to include letters to the editor in future issues of the journal. Please send letters to the General Editor:

Dr Bennett Zon  
School of Music  
University of Durham  
Palace Green  
Durham DH1 3RL  
England

Email: [bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk](mailto:bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk)

*Subscriptions* For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Nicky Staszkievicz  
Ashgate Publishing Limited  
Gower House  
Croft Road  
Aldershot  
Hants GU11 3HR  
England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 351804

Fax: +44 (0)1252 351839

Email: [journals@ashgatepublishing.com](mailto:journals@ashgatepublishing.com)

### *Themed Issues*

The General Editor of *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* encourages proposals from individuals with ideas for themed issues, involving the commissioning of up to six main articles per issue, as well as one or more review articles for coverage of books, CDs and scores. Those applying to the journal for this purpose should initially provide the General Editor with a statement of no more than 500 words, outlining the thematic nature of the proposed issue, the names of contributing authors along with a working title for their papers, and a timetable for submission of work.

Proposers of themed issues work alongside the General Editor, and are designated Guest Editors. They are responsible for commissioning, organizing and preparing articles for publication, as well as working closely with review editors to locate suitable material and authors for relevant sections of the journal. Review sections of themed issues are not exclusively thematicized, and tend towards a balance of half themed, and half general material.

Articles commissioned for themed issues follow the same process of peer-review as general issues. No guarantee of publication can be given to specially commissioned authors.

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review

*Editor of this Issue*

Barbara Kelly

*General Editor*

Bennett Zon

*Book Reviews Editor*

Anna Celenza

*Music Reviews Editor*

Jeremy Dibble

## Editorial Board

**Dr Bennett Zon**, University of Durham, UK (General Editor)

**Professor Anna Celenza**, Michigan State University, USA (Book Reviews Editor)

**Dr Jeremy Dibble**, University of Durham (Music Reviews Editor)

**Dr Stephen Downes**, University of Surrey, UK

**Professor William Weber**, California State University, Long Beach, USA

**Dr Phyllis Weliver**, Wilkes University, USA

## Advisory Board

**Dr Rosamund Bartlett**, University of Durham, UK

**Professor Andrew Bowie**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Dr Geoffrey Chew**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor John Deathridge**, King's College, University of London, UK

**Professor Annegret Fauser**, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

**Dr Peter Franklin**, University of Oxford, UK

**Dr Sophie Fuller**, University of Reading, UK

**Professor Lydia Goehr**, Columbia University, USA

**Professor Thomas Grey**, Stanford University, USA

**Professor Hervé Lacombe**, Université Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France

**Professor Roberta Marvin**, University of Iowa, USA

**Professor Simon McVeigh**, Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

**Professor Julian Rushton**, University of Leeds, UK

**Professor Jim Samson**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor Manuela Schwartz**, Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

**Professor Nicholas Temperley**, University of Illinois, USA

© Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2004

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by  
Ashgate Publishing Limited  
Gower House  
Croft Road  
Aldershot  
Hants GU11 3HR  
England

Ashgate Publishing Company  
Suite 420  
101 Cherry Street  
Burlington, VT 05401-4405  
USA

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A. F. Leighton-Thomas.

Ashgate website: <http://www.ashgate.com>

ISSN: 1479-4098

Typeset by Manton Typesetters, Louth, Lincolnshire

Printed by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

# Contents

VOLUME 1, ISSUE 2

## ARTICLES

- Steven Huebner  
'Striptease' as Ideology 3
- Kerry Murphy  
Race and Identity: Appraisals in France of Meyerbeer on his 1891  
Centenary 27
- Catrina Flint de Médicis  
Nationalism and Early Music at the French *Fin de Siècle*: Three Case  
Studies 43
- Sylvie Douche  
Music in France in the Years 1911–1913 According to Jean  
Chantavoine: Independent Thinking and Political Constraints 67

## REVIEWS

### *Review Article*

- Nigel Simeone  
Gallic Musings: English Writing on French Music 93

### *Book Reviews*

- Francesco Izzo  
*Music Drama at the Paris Odéon, 1824–1828* by Mark Everist 102
- James William Sobaskie  
*Debussy and His World* edited by Jane F. Fulcher 105
- Julian Rushton  
*The Keys to French Opera in the Nineteenth Century* by Hervé Lacombe,  
translated by Edward Schneider 109
- Clair Rowden  
*The Music of Berlioz* by Julian Rushton 112
- Ingrid Sykes  
*The Cambridge Companion to Debussy* edited by Simon Trezise 115
- Philip Young  
*Salons, Singers and Songs: A Background to Romantic French Song  
1830–1870* by David Tunley 118
- Alexandra Wilson  
*Opera's Second Death* by Slavoj Žižek and Mladen Dolar 120

Books Received	124
<i>CD Reviews</i>	
Michael Spitzer	
Beethoven: The Complete Music for Piano Trio, vol. 1, Piano Trios op. 70. The Florestan Trio: Anthony Marwood <i>vn</i> Richard Lester <i>vc</i> Susan Tomes <i>pf</i>	125
Peter Horton	
Jerusalem on High: Victorian Voluntaries and Concert Pieces for Organ based on Hymns, Chorales and Psalm-Tunes. Graham Barber on the Organ of Tewkesbury Abbey	128
Tomi Mäkelä	
Saint-Saëns: The Complete Works for Piano and Orchestra (The Romantic Piano Concerto 27), Piano Concertos 1–5 (opp. 17, 22, 29, 44, 103); <i>Allegro appassionato</i> op. 70; <i>Rapsodie d’Auvergne</i> op. 73; <i>Valse-Caprice</i> op. 76; <i>Africa</i> op. 89. Stephen Hough <i>pf</i> City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra: Sakari Oramo	130
Richard Langham Smith	
Debussy: Songs. Christopher Maltman <i>bar</i> Malcolm Martineau <i>pf</i>	135
Clair Rowden	
Meyerbeer in Italy: Extracts from <i>Il crociato in Egitto</i> , <i>Romilda e Costanza</i> , <i>Semiramide riconosciuta</i> , <i>Emma di Resburgo</i> , <i>Margherita d’Anjou</i> , <i>L’esule di Granata</i> . Yvonne Kenny <i>sop</i> Bronwen Mills <i>sop</i> Maria Bovino <i>sop</i> Linda Kitchen <i>sop</i> Della Jones <i>mezzo</i> Diana Montague <i>mezzo</i> Patricia Spence <i>mezzo</i> Anne Mason <i>mezzo</i> Bruce Ford <i>ten</i> Chris Merritt <i>ten</i> Paul Nilon <i>ten</i> Harry Nicoll <i>ten</i> Geoffrey Dolton <i>bar</i> Alastair Miles <i>bass</i> Russell Smythe <i>bass</i> Ian Platt <i>bass</i> Ugo Benelli <i>bass</i> Philharmonia Orchestra, Royal Philharmonic Orchestra, Geoffrey Mitchell Choir: David Parry	139
Guidelines for Contributors	143