



# JOURNAL OF Law and Religion

VOLUME XXVII NUMBER 1 2011-12

## ARTICLES

Crumbs from the Table: The Syrophoenician Woman and International Law

Mark A. Chinen

Religious Tribunals in Democratic States: Lessons from the Israeli Rabbinical Courts

Daphna Hacker

Church Property Disputes, Religious Freedom, and the Ordeal of African Methodists in Antebellum St. Louis:

*Farrar v. Finney* (1855)

Lucas P. Volkman

"The Two Sons of Oil" and the Limits of American Religious Dissent

Steven Wedgworth

## REVIEW ESSAY

The Siren Song of History: Originalism and the Religion Clauses

Jeffrey Shulman

**Sponsored by:** Hamline University School of Law

**Published by:** JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION  
ISSN: 0748-0814

# JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVII

2011-2012

NUMBER 1

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### *Editor in Chief*

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

### *Associate Editor*

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

### *Technical Editors*

MARY L. DUNNEWOLD, Hamline University School of Law

STEPHEN LIEBO, Hamline University School of Law

GRACE MILLS, Hamline University School of Law

### *Production/Subscription Manager*

LINDA BERGLIN, Hamline University School of Law

## EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

SARAH ERICKSON

JESSICA FARBER

NICOLE HERTEL

LINDSAY STEUSSY

## EDITORIAL BOARD

*JOSÉ ROBERTO JUÁREZ, University of Denver, Sturm College of Law, Chair*

*FRANK S. ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law*

*DEBORAH CANTRELL, University of Colorado Law School*

*PAULA COOEY, Macalester College*

*PERRY DANE, Rutgers University*

*Ex Officio*

*ANVER M. EMON, University of Toronto*

*MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law*

*Ex Officio*

*M. CHRISTIAN GREEN, University of Notre Dame*

*Ex Officio*

*EMILY ALBRINK HARTIGAN, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law*

*AFRA JALABI, Islamic Scholar, Beaconsfield, Quebec*

*HOWARD LESNICK, University of Pennsylvania Law School*

*DONALD LEWIS, Hamline University School of Law*

*Ex Officio*

*ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University*

*NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee, Secretary*

*RUSSELL PEARCE, Fordham University School of Law*

*MICHAEL PERRY, Emory University School of Law*  
*THOMAS PORTER, JUSTPEACE Center for Mediation & Conflict Transformation*  
*ASIFA QURAIISHI, University of Wisconsin Law School*  
*KATHLEEN SANDS, University of Hawaii at Manoa*  
*EARL SCHWARTZ, Hamline University*  
*STEVEN D. SMITH, University of San Diego School of Law*  
*DARRYL TRIMEW, Medgar Evers College*  
*AMELIA UELMEN, Fordham University School of Law*  
*HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law, Treasurer*

## **ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

- SAM LEVINE, Touro Law Center, Chair*
- TAHA JABER AL-ALWANI, Graduate School of Social and Islamic Sciences*
- AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond*
- ABDULLAHI AN-NA'IM, Emory University School of Law*
- ZAFAR ISHAQ ANSARI, Islamic Research Institute, International Islamic University, Pakistan*
- GERARD BRADLEY, Notre Dame University Law School*
- MICHAEL J. BROYDE, Emory University School of Law*
- LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law*  
*Southern Methodist University*
- STEPHEN L. CARTER, Yale Law School*
- ROBERT F. COCHRAN, JR., Pepperdine University School of Law*
- MOHAMED S. EL-AWA, Islamic Scholar, Egypt*
- CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law*
- EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law*
- RICHARD HIERS, University of Florida*
- M. CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School*
- PATRICK R. KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary*
- DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths*
- MICHAEL KESSLER, Georgetown University*
- URFAN KHALIQ, Cardiff Law School*
- SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law*
- DAVID LITTLE, Harvard University Divinity School*
- ELIZABETH MENSCH, SUNY Distinguished Teaching Professor Emerita*
- EBRAHIM MOOSA, Duke University*
- SEYYED HOSSEIN NASR, George Washington University*
- LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College*
- KAY PRANIS, Saint Paul, Minnesota*
- JAWDAT SAID, Muslim Scholar and Activist, Syria*
- ELISABETH SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School*
- THOMAS L. SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School*
- DONALD W. SHRIVER, Union Theological Seminary in New York*
- DANIEL SINCLAIR, Tel Aviv Law School*
- DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University*
- PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law*
- CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, South Africa*
- MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany*
- JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law*
- WILSON YATES, Emeritus Professor, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities*
- STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota*

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a interdisciplinary, interfaith academic and professional publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, which is published twice annually, are \$25.00 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$35.00 for institutions, and \$12.00 for students. Add an additional \$10.00 for foreign postage. Subscription requests, manuscripts, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104  
lberglin@hamline.edu

The JOURNAL currently follows the Blue Book citation format. Citations to Jewish/Christian Biblical sources conform to the SBL Handbook of Style and the Jewish Law Annual. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline, <http://heinonline.org>

The views and opinions expressed in the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by the H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on-line on a variety of computer database services.

This periodical is also indexed in the *ATLA Religion Database*®, published by the American Theological Library Association, 300 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 2100, Chicago, IL 60606, E-mail: [atla@atla.com](mailto:atla@atla.com), [www.http://www.atla.com](http://www.atla.com).

Internet access to information about the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 27 J.L. & RELIGION (2011-12)

## *JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION*

### *STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE*

The *JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION* was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

The *JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION* is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

- Historical*** The *JOURNAL* intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.
- Theoretical*** The *JOURNAL* intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.
- Ethical*** The *JOURNAL* intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.
- Global*** The *JOURNAL* intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.
- Professional*** The *JOURNAL* intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.
- Spiritual*** The *JOURNAL* recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The *JOURNAL* is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the *JOURNAL* intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

**HAMLIN  
UNIVERSITY  
SCHOOL OF LAW**

A subscription to the  
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND  
RELIGION**

**Cost per volume (two issues):**

\$25.00 individual (U.S.)  
\$35.00 individual (foreign)  
\$35.00 institution (U.S.)  
\$45.00 institution (foreign)  
\$12.00 student

**Print and send to:**

Circulation Manager  
JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION  
Hamline University School of Law  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
St. Paul, MN 55104  
U.S.

**Please Enclose Payment made out to:**

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

City: \_\_\_\_\_ State: \_\_\_\_\_ Zip: \_\_\_\_\_

Country: \_\_\_\_\_

Phone: \_\_\_\_\_ Fax: \_\_\_\_\_ E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_



*Check out our website!*

# Journal of Law & Religion

<http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>



[Awards](#)



[Recent Books and Articles](#)



[Resources](#)



[Subscription Information](#)



[Symposia](#)



[View Issues/Indexes](#)



# ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire  
back stock, reprint and  
microform rights to the

## **JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION**

Complete sets to date  
are now available.  
We can also furnish  
single volumes and issues.

**WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.**

1285 Main Street

Buffalo, New York 14209-1987

Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at 800.828.7571;  
via fax 716.883.8100; or found in electronic format for all your research  
needs on HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>



# Journal of Law & Religion

the 2012 JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION  
Fall Symposium  
Hamline University, Sept. 27-29, 2012

## *Emerging Voices in Islamic Jurisprudence*

Political upheaval in the Middle East and elsewhere, most notably the Arab Spring of 2011, has been accompanied by the renewal and flourishing of Islamic jurisprudence around the world, including in the West. Borrowing from the deepest roots of their tradition, emerging Muslim legal scholars in the legal and religious academies, human rights activists, and community leaders are re-thinking how an authentically Islamic jurisprudence can respond to local, national and global community issues of the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION also invites you to attend the Lifetime Achievement Award Dinner honoring William A. Graham. Professor Graham was appointed Dean of Harvard Divinity School and joined its faculty in 2001. He has served as director of the Center for Middle Eastern Studies, and chair of the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations. He is also former chair of the Council on Graduate Studies in Religion (U.S. & Canada).

Please watch for updates on our website at [www.hamline.edu/law/jlr](http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr) for more information.

EMORY UNIVERSITY STUDIES IN LAW AND RELIGION

# RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

*Volume 2:*

THE FREE EXERCISE CLAUSE  
DOUGLAS LAYCOCK

“Any person who cares about religious liberty in America (and we should all be greatly concerned about its increasingly fragile condition) needs to read Douglas Laycock.”  
— KIM COLBY

“I welcome this multivolume collection of Douglas Laycock’s always insightful and lucid writings — from scholarly law review articles to *USA Today* op-ed pieces. Even those who may disagree with Laycock’s interpretation and application of the First Amendment’s religion clauses will be hard-pressed to gainsay these sentiments.”

— J. BRENT WALKER

ISBN 978-0-8028-6522-9 · 871 pages · paperback · \$35.00

*Also by Douglas Laycock:*

## RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

*Volume 1: OVERVIEWS AND HISTORY*

EMORY UNIVERSITY STUDIES IN LAW AND RELIGION

ISBN 978-0-8028-6465-9 · 888 pages · paperback · \$35.00

At your bookstore,  
or call 800-253-7521  
[www.eerdmans.com](http://www.eerdmans.com)



**WM. B. EERDMANS  
PUBLISHING CO.**  
2140 Oak Industrial Drive NE  
Grand Rapids, MI 49505



# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVII

2011-2012

NUMBER 1

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface ..... XV

For current & upcoming article abstracts, visit our website at  
[http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/index\\_of\\_issues.html](http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/index_of_issues.html)

## ARTICLES

- Mark A. Chinen      *Crumbs from the Table: The Syrophoenician  
Woman and International Law* ..... 1
- Daphna Hacker      *Religious Tribunals in Democratic States:  
Lessons from the Israeli Rabbinical Courts*..... 59
- Lucas P. Volkman      *Church Property Disputes, Religious Freedom,  
and the Ordeal of African Methodists in  
Antebellum St. Louis: Farrar v. Finney (1855)* ... 83
- Steven Wedgworth      *"The Two Sons of Oil" and the Limits of  
American Religious Dissent*..... 141

For current and upcoming book reviews, visit our website at  
[http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/upcoming\\_reviews\\_essays.html](http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/upcoming_reviews_essays.html)

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

REVIEW ESSAY

- Jeffrey Shulman *The Siren Song of History: Originalism and the Religion Clauses* ..... 163

BOOK REVIEWS

- Elizabeth A. Clark *The Spirit of the Law: Religious Voices and the Constitution in Modern America*,  
by Sarah Barringer Gordon..... 179
- Richard L. Cupp, Jr. *Seeking Redemption for Torts Law Holding Bishops Accountable: How Lawsuits Helped the Catholic Church Confront Clergy Sexual Abuse*,  
by Timothy D. Lytton ..... 185
- Samaneh Oladi  
Ghadikolaei *Islamic Marriage Contract: Case Studies in Islamic Family Law*,  
edited by Asifa Quraishi & Frank E. Vogel..... 195
- Elizabeth H.  
Prodromou *God's Joust, God's Justice: Law and Religion in Western Tradition*,  
by John Witte, Jr. .... 201
- Linda Przybyszewski *Cross Purposes: Pierce v. Society of Sisters and the Struggle over Compulsory Public Education*,  
by Paula Abrams..... 207
- Jonathan Rothchild *Fictions of Justice: The International Criminal Court and the Challenge of Legal Pluralism in Sub-Saharan Africa*,  
by Kamari Maxine Clarke..... 213
- Kathleen Sands *Religious Faith, Torture, and Our National Soul*,  
edited by David Gushee; co-edited by Jillian  
Hickman Zimmer & J. Drew Zimmer..... 219

*JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION*

Robert K. Vischer	Beyond Boundaries: Expanding the Law and Religion Conversation <i>Religion in Legal Thought and Practice</i> , by Howard Lesnick.....	225
-------------------	---	-----