



Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 25 • NUMBER 3 • FALL 2011

ROUNDTABLE

Libya, RtoP, and Humanitarian Intervention

*Alex J. Bellamy, Simon Chesterman, James Pattison,
Thomas G. Weiss, and Jennifer Welsh*

FEATURES

**Is Humanitarian
Intervention Legal?
The Rule of Law in an
Incoherent World**
Ian Hurd

Smart Sanctions Revisited
Joy Gordon

**The Implications of Drones
on the Just War Tradition**
*Daniel Brunstetter and
Megan Braun*

RESPONSE
Ending War
David Rodin

REVIEW ESSAY

**What Is Special About
Human Rights?**
*Christian Barry and
Nicholas Southwood*

REVIEWS

Why Nations Fight
Richard Ned Lebow
REVIEW BY CHRISTOPHER COKER

**Equality and Tradition:
Questions of Value in Moral
and Political Theory**
Samuel Scheffler
REVIEW BY THOMAS PORTER

**Globalizing Justice:
The Ethics of Poverty
and Power**
Richard W. Miller
REVIEW BY HELENA DE BRES

CARNEGIE COUNCIL
*The Voice for Ethics
in International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 25 · NUMBER 3 · FALL 2011

CARNEGIE COUNCIL
*The Voice for Ethics
in International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

THE JOURNAL OF THE CARNEGIE COUNCIL

EDITOR IN CHIEF	<i>Joel H. Rosenthal</i>	EDITORIAL	<i>Alex J. Bellamy</i>
EDITOR	<i>John Tessitore</i>	ADVISORY BOARD	<i>Allen Buchanan</i>
MANAGING EDITOR	<i>Zornitsa Stoyanova-Yerburgh</i>		<i>Robyn Eckersley</i>
ASSISTANT EDITOR	<i>Zach Dorfman</i>		<i>Joy Gordon</i>
EDITORIAL INTERNS	<i>Kyle Shybunko</i>		<i>Anthony F. Lang, Jr.</i>
	<i>Lynette Sieger</i>		<i>Anthony Langlois</i>
COPY EDITOR	<i>Bill Harris</i>		<i>David Luban</i>
BUSINESS MANAGER	<i>Eva Becker</i>		<i>David R. Mapel</i>
			<i>Darrel Moellendorf</i>
			<i>Terry Nardin</i>
			<i>David Rodin</i>
			<i>S. Prakash Sethi</i>
			<i>Henry Shue</i>
			<i>Leif Wenar</i>

Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs

The Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs is an independent, nonpartisan, nonsectarian, tax-exempt organization founded in 1914 by Andrew Carnegie. Since its beginnings, the Carnegie Council has asserted its strong belief that ethics, as informed

by the world's principal moral and religious traditions, is an inevitable and integral component of all policy decisions, whether in the realm of economics, politics, or national security. The interrelationship of ethics and foreign policy is thus the

unifying theme of all Carnegie Council programs. By promoting a greater understanding of the values and conditions that ensure peaceful relations among nations, the Carnegie Council hopes to contribute to a better life for people everywhere.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

<i>Ian Bremmer</i>	<i>Jonathan Gage,</i>	<i>Alexander H. Platt</i>
<i>Kathleen Cheek-Milby</i>	<i>Vice Chairman</i>	<i>Joel Rosenthal, President</i>
<i>Jonathan E. Colby, Chairman</i>	<i>Stephen D. Hibbard,</i>	<i>James H. Rowe</i>
<i>Phyllis D. Collins</i>	<i>Treasurer</i>	<i>Robert G. Shaw</i>
<i>Barbara Crossette</i>	<i>David P. Hunt</i>	<i>Elisabeth Sifton</i>
<i>Thomas Donaldson</i>	<i>Zachary Karabell</i>	<i>Michael J. Smith</i>
<i>Richard A. Edlin</i>	<i>Charles W. Kegley, Jr.</i>	<i>Harrison I. Steans</i>
<i>Anthony L. Faillace</i>	<i>Zarinés Negrón</i>	

HONORARY TRUSTEES	<i>Charles M. Judd</i>	<i>Robert J. Myers</i>	<i>Maurice S. Spanbock, Esq.</i>
INTERNATIONAL HONORARY TRUSTEE	<i>Eiji Uehiro</i>		
SECRETARY OF THE CORPORATION	<i>Robert G. Shaw</i>		

Contents

Contributors 247

**ROUNDTABLE:
LIBYA, RtoP, AND
HUMANITARIAN
INTERVENTION**

Introduction

James Pattison 251

Civilian Protection in Libya: Putting Coercion and Controversy Back into RtoP

Jennifer Welsh 255

Libya and the Responsibility to Protect: The Exception and the Norm

Alex J. Bellamy 263

The Ethics of Humanitarian Intervention in Libya

James Pattison 271

“Leading from Behind”: The Responsibility to Protect, the Obama Doctrine, and Humanitarian Intervention after Libya

Simon Chesterman 279

RtoP Alive and Well after Libya

Thomas G. Weiss 287

FEATURES

Is Humanitarian Intervention Legal? The Rule of Law in an Incoherent World

Ian Hurd 293

Smart Sanctions Revisited

Joy Gordon 315

The Implications of Drones on the Just War Tradition

Daniel Brunstetter and Megan Braun 337

RESPONSE

Ending War

David Rodin 359

REVIEW ESSAY

What Is Special About Human Rights?

Christian Barry and Nicholas Southwood 369

REVIEWS

Why Nations Fight

Richard Ned Lebow

REVIEW BY CHRISTOPHER COKER 385

Equality and Tradition: Questions of Value in Moral and Political Theory

Samuel Scheffler

REVIEW BY THOMAS PORTER 387

Globalizing Justice: The Ethics of Poverty and Power

Richard W. Miller

REVIEW BY HELENA DE BRES 389

SUBMISSIONS **Guidelines for Submission** 393

RESOURCES For additional Carnegie Council resources on the topics addressed in these pages, please visit www.ethicsandinternationalaffairs.org.

ETHICS & INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS (ISSN 0892-6794 print; ISSN 1747-7093 online).

Publisher

Ethics & International Affairs is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013.

Information for subscribers

Ethics & International Affairs is published in four issues per year. Institutional subscription prices for 2011 are: Print & Online: US \$392 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £240 + VAT elsewhere. Institutions electronic only: US\$357 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£217 + VAT elsewhere. Institutions print only: US\$375 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£230 + VAT elsewhere. Individuals print only: US\$37 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£26 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1st 1997, where available.

Delivery Terms and Legal Title

Prices include delivery of print journals to the recipient's address. Delivery terms are Delivered Duty Unpaid (DDU); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Legal title passes to the customer on despatch by our distributors.

Production Editor: Megha Jain (email: mjain@cambridge.org).

Electronic Access Access to this journal is available free online within institutions in the developing world through the AGORA initiative with the FAO, the HINARI initiative with the WHO and the OARE initiative with UNEP. For information, visit www.aginternetwork.org, www.healthinternetwork.org, www.oarescience.org.

Abstracting and Indexing Services The Journal is indexed by Academic Search (EBSCO), Academic Search Premier (EBSCO), CSA Environmental Sciences & Pollution Management Database (CSA/CIG), CSA Sustainability Science Abstracts (CSA/CIG), Current Abstracts (EBSCO), Expanded Academic ASAP (Thomson Gale), IBSS: International Bibliography of the Social Sciences (LSE), InfoTrac, International Political Science Abstracts (IPSA), OMNIFILE Full Text Mega Edition (OMNIFILE), PAIS: Public Affairs Information Service (CSA/CIG), Proquest 5000 (ProQuest), Proquest Discovery (ProQuest), Proquest Platinum (ProQuest), Proquest Research Library (ProQuest), Proquest Social Science Journals (ProQuest), Social Sciences Index/Abstracts (HW Wilson), Student Resource Center College (w/ Academic ASAP), Wilson OMNIFILE Full Text Select (HW Wilson) and Worldwide Political Sciences Abstracts (CSA/CIG).

Disclaimer The Publisher, Carnegie Council, and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, Council and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, Council and Editors of the products advertised.

Copyright and Photocopying Copyright © 2011 Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm> Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Printed in USA by The Sheridan Press

View this journal online at journals.cambridge.org/EIA.

ISSN 0892-6794 (Print)

ISSN 1747-7093 (Online)

Ethics &
International
Affairs