

The accompanying foreword, introduction, essays, interview, glossary, and bibliography present the reader with many ways into this interdisciplinary material. The catalogue covers a vast number of sources and issues, offering an overview of topics including decolonizing the archive, the preservation of disappearing languages, religious representation, dispossession, Black figures at the Met Museum, Ottoman Turkish calligraphy, Islamophobia, race and theatrical productions, complexion and concepts of beauty, and others. The essays and additional materials bring out topics that are understandably too large to be covered extensively within the remit of the book, serving instead as small but effective case studies (for example, exploring how galleries might move beyond “Black art in a white space,” 132). More work remains to be done on how objects were created, interpreted, and used—where materials were sourced, the trajectories of individuals and communities who made these resources available, the hands of those who contributed to their making and use—but the book successfully offers frameworks and provocations that will help make this kind of work possible. The closing interview between Kim F. Hall, Scott Manning Stevens, and L. Lehua Yim confronts the challenges of representation in the academy and discusses the value and importance of community in forging new ways of thinking. How might “other types of histories or response to histories or futures or even the past” extend beyond white settler colonialism, and what implications does this have for premodern scholarship (227)?

As outlined in the preface, one of the key purposes of *Seeing Race before Race* is to illuminate how race “can be seen, literally, in vast visual archives spanning centuries, and it *must* be seen too, if we want to understand the long-lasting effects of that social construct across time and space” (xvi). Many challenges remain, from the language proficiency required to interpret many of these multilingual sources, to how transoceanic collaborations with various knowledge-holders might be achieved in ethical, reparative ways, especially at a time when the humanities continue to face drastic funding cuts and the loss of entire departments and research centers. In this context, this book is not only a catalogue and survey of the field but a robust call to action, and stands as evidence of the value of those institutions and communities that *do* spotlight approaches that make the field of premodern studies more capacious and multilayered.

Lauren Working 
University of York
lauren.working@york.ac.uk

CHRISTOPHER PAOLELLA. *Human Trafficking in Medieval Europe: Slavery, Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution*. Social Worlds of Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2020. Pp. 278. €113.00 (cloth).
doi: 10.1017/jbr.2023.217

Enslaved and trafficked people are often overlooked in the medieval historiography for any number of reasons. Looking directly at the very real and very human experience of those who were violently removed from their families and moved across the continent is uncomfortable. This is especially true given that the women and children trafficked were often destined for a life of sexual exploitation. These uncomfortable truths are often swept aside in order to concentrate on the trade networks that moved them, or the economies they served. Christopher Paoella works to unveil the circumstances of human trafficking across the medieval period and argues persuasively that the phenomenon changes constantly to circumvent opposition. Further, he contends that a concentrated effort to eradicate the practice from a

centralized authority is the best means of response to the phenomenon, rather than simply awaiting economic changes that make it untenable.

Paoella begins his study in the late antique period. Here we encounter the entrenched practices of enslavement that kept the late Roman Empire supplied with agrarian workers. The discussion then moves to discuss how early medieval trafficking gradually shifted from large scale ventures across the Mediterranean to a more localized one as the chapter draws to a close in the eighth century. This is born out particularly well due to a focus on the experiences of the enslaved north of the Alps. The second chapter then moves readers through the ninth to the eleventh centuries, looking at varying regional differences in the human trade, and how assorted rulers either relied on or sought to curtail the practice. The third chapter is thematic in nature, focusing on the gendered implications of trafficking and the high number of women or younger children trafficked as the period wore on. Here Paoella argues that sexual violence was an assumed part of the experience of trafficking and enslavement. This is asserted through a discussion focused on the women trafficked from late antiquity to the thirteenth century, and the varying networks that allowed the trade. The fourth chapter returns to the high medieval period to discuss the change from agriculturally focused slavery to explicitly sexual labor. At the same time Paoella shows a shift in preference of who was trafficked. Rather than seeing any foreign woman as a potential target, the consolidation of Christendom meant a shift toward finding women from outside of the Latin sphere of influence. At the same time Paoella underlines that, especially in Northern Europe, such shifts were accommodated by the shift to a monetary economy. The fifth and final body chapter looks specifically at the late medieval sex trade, addressing how women were treated in municipal brothels and how the practice fell out of favor as the medieval period came to a close. The conclusion reasserts the overall argument of the book: “Even as the roles of slaves mutated to conform to the patterns of exchange in the moment, traffickers themselves also adapted to suit their immediate circumstances” (247).

This work is ambitious. Attempting to track the history of trafficking over the medieval period is a daunting task but is handled with a noteworthy deftness and clarity of focus by Paoella. In his hands it does become clear that “slavery as a means of compelling agricultural production had declined across much of Western Europe by the end of the twelfth century, [and that] commercial sex grew into an industry that grew in tandem with the urbanization of medieval Europe” (13). As a result of this focus, *Human Trafficking* works particularly well in tandem with earlier works on enslavement, such as Alice Rio’s *Slavery After Rome 500–1100* (2017). For those working on gendered notions of society, it is Paoella’s choice to dedicate a chapter specifically to the gendered aspects of enslavement which makes this work of particular use. This chapter is written carefully enough that it could serve as a stand-alone introduction to the intricacies of the topic.

Human Trafficking is overall important, and its deficiencies few. Ideally it would have been useful to see Paoella’s regional discussions include more from the central European Slavic perspective. Given the emphasis on the Reformation’s influence on the institutional brother (242–45), it would have been interesting to see what Paoella makes of the work of Hussite reformers regarding sex work, especially given a growing bibliography on the subject in English. However, such a complaint simply underlines the fact that the argument is persuasive enough that it could apply in instances that the author had not managed to address.

Perhaps the most important aspect of this work is that Paoella interweaves his historical discussion with interviews from present day trafficking survivors. The lives of these women underline the continuity of trafficking operations. These stories help to underline the fact that, although institutional early modern trafficking has been abolished, the practice continues in small-scale, usually private modes. In doing so he shows that even now in the modern world societies that wish to intercede and stop slavery often ignore it in order to uphold patriarchal narratives about worthy versus expendable women. Unfreedom isn’t, and never has been, necessarily tied to international large-scale operations. All that is necessary for it to continue is a

societal disinterest in the lives of disempowered, dispensable women. This work is thus both a useful historical intervention, and a vital social one. It is welcome.

Eleanor Janega

London School of Economics

e.janega@lse.ac.uk

DAVID POTTER. *The Letters of Paul de Foix, French Ambassador at the Court of Elizabeth I, 1562–66*. Royal Historical Society, Camden Fifth Series 58. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2020. Pp. 300. \$80.00 (cloth).
doi: 10.1017/jbr.2023.209

This edition of the diplomatic correspondence of Paul de Foix, by David Potter, the doyen of the history of sixteenth-century Franco-British relations, is an admirable companion to his volume of the correspondence of de Foix's immediate predecessor, Michel de Suere, published by the Society in 2014.

De Foix himself is introduced as a rather atypical ambassador from an ambiguous social background, whose early humanist education was completed with studies in law begun during the last year of the reign of François Ier. The young lawyer secured the favor of Catherine de' Medici who brought him to court as a secretary and legal advisor. Irenic in outlook, de Foix was for a time suspected of heresy but secured formal acquittal in 1561. He resumed his work for Catherine who was decisive in his appointment in January 1562 as Charles IX's ambassador to England. As Potter notes, the appointment coincided with the high point of Catherine's policy of toleration towards the Huguenots and hopes of reconciliation of the faiths. Sir Nicholas Throckmorton, the English ambassador in France at the time, opined that "his good disposition" towards England and his understanding of those "of the religion," i.e., evangelicals or protestants, made de Foix a useful envoy for maintaining the peace to which both sides were apparently then committed.

This edition presents 167 items of correspondence, as well as supporting documents, and supersedes Teulet's 1862 edition of de Foix's letters. Much of de Foix's correspondence deals with comparatively routine matters such as shipping and cargo disputes, allegations of privateering, legal cases in courts at Westminster or Paris, requests for safe-conducts, passports, and the like. The bulk of the ambassador's letters were addressed to Catherine de' Medici, often enclosed with a short, polite, but fairly perfunctory letter to Charles IX who was only 16 years of age by the end of de Foix's mission. The ambassador wrote at times to other prominent figures in France including Antoine de Bourbon, King of Navarre, to various royal councilors and secretaries, not least Claude de LAubespine from whose archives much of this collection originally comes, as well as to fellow ambassadors like Jean Ebrard de Saint-Sulpice, his contemporary in Spain. The collection also includes copies of memoranda, formal responses and addresses to the English privy council, and detailed reports of audiences with the queen of England.

Potter elucidates the main diplomatic themes covered in the correspondence over the four years of de Foix's embassy. The most important of these was the outbreak of the French civil wars during his first year. The rivalry of Condé and Guise was central to that conflict, and de Foix was called upon to finesse awareness of it in England, especially at the outbreak of war with the massacre at Vassy in March 1562. There were a number of what might be called collateral disputes that year, including the seizure of French ships, the continuing detention of Antoine Duprat, seigneur de Nantouillet, and the presence in England of Huguenot agents involved in negotiating the Treaty of Hampton Court in the summer of 1562. English