

I hear that the Croatian translations will be replaced by English and that the entire selection will soon be published abroad. If this should happen, I have certain small suggestions. The bibliographies on the individual writers, particularly those better known in the West, should not be limited to research done in Croatian. When sources are mentioned, it should also be noted where the manuscripts are to be found and which libraries have copies of important rare books. Brlek's valuable guide (*Rukopisi knjižnice Male braće u Dubrovniku*, Zagreb, 1952) is sometimes mentioned, but Jurić's excellent handbook (*Opera scriptorum Latinorum natione Croatarum*, Zagreb, 1968) is not quoted in either the bibliographies or the "sources." These suggestions are only details in an otherwise flawless achievement.

ANTE KADIĆ  
Indiana University

TRANSLATION IN MEDIEVAL BULGARIA. By *Ashit Chakraborty*. Calcutta: Indranath Mojumder, 1969. xiv, 80 pp. \$3.00.

This monograph is the only volume published so far of an ambitious series to be entitled Theory and Practice of Translation Throughout the Ages. The author's sole credentials for writing it would appear to be a "number of years" spent in Bulgaria and other East European countries.

One would have to be a great scholar to condense the essence of this large and controversial topic into less than eighty pages. Mr. Chakraborty, making no claim to scholarship, exudes the enthusiasm of the ill-informed. He would have done Indian scholarship and English-language literature more of a service by translating selections from some of his more germane sources than he has done by regurgitating them all, half-digested. Some of these sources, at least, are competent popularizations of philology by specialists in the field. It is difficult, however, to understand the pertinence of D. Blagoev's book *Contribution to the History of Socialism in Bulgaria* (an eyewitness account of events and political developments in late nineteenth-century Bulgaria) to the subject of medieval translations. Yet there are hundreds of basic books and articles that even a beginner should know about. That he lives and works in India is no excuse for Chakraborty's unawareness of bibliography. As a one-time student of the Bulgarian language in Bulgaria, he should have had access to B. Penev's four-volume history of Bulgarian literature, or in any case to the university textbook of Old Bulgarian literature by P. Dinekov and volumes 1 and 2 of the four-volume history of Bulgarian literature published by the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences in 1963 and 1966, respectively.

Chakraborty writes well in English and appears to have good intentions. His future work might be more praiseworthy if he were to limit himself to translation. As for *Translation in Medieval Bulgaria*, it is one of those books that should never have been written.

ILYA V. TALEV  
University of California, Los Angeles

PAMETNA BITKA NA NARODITE. By *Bistra Tsvetkova*. Varna: Dürzhavno izdatelstvo, 1969. 292 pp. 2.10 lv.

One of the most complicated periods in Ottoman and Balkan history is the century between the Ottoman landing at Gallipoli (1354) and the conquest of Constantino-