

THIRD SERIES • VOLUME 33 • PART 4
OCTOBER 2023

Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

ISSN: 1356-1863

Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland

14 Stephenson Way, London NW1 2HD
www.royalasiaticsociety.org

EDITOR

Daud Ali, *University of Pennsylvania*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Ismail Alatas, *New York University*

Aparna Kapadia, *Williams College*

Weipin Tsai, *Royal Holloway, University of London*

Wang Shih-pe, *National University of Taiwan*

Bradley Davis - Book Review Editor, *Eastern Connecticut State University*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Andrea Acri (*École Pratique des Hautes Études, Paris*), Ismail Alatas (*New York University*), Blain Auer (*University of Lausanne*), Evrim Bimbis (*University of Bonn*), François de Blois (*University College London*), Arthur Dudley (FAMES, *University of Cambridge*), Michael Feener (*Kyoto University*), Finbar Barry Flood (*New York University*), Peter Frankopan (*University of Oxford*), Aparna Kapadia (*Williams College*), Timothy May (*University of North Georgia*), Francis Robinson (*Royal Holloway, University of London*), Taylor Sherman (*London School of Economics and Political Science*), Nancy Um (*SUNY Binghamton*), Weipin Tsai (*Royal Holloway, University of London*), Wang Shih-pe (*National University of Taiwan*). The President and Director of the Royal Asiatic Society *ex officio*.

INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Muzaffar Alam, *University of Chicago*

Seema Alavi, *Jamia Millia Islamia, New Delhi*

Tim Barrett, *SOAS University of London*

Jere Bacharach, *University of Washington*

Edhem Eldem, *Bogazici University, Istanbul*

Carl Ernst, *University of North Carolina*

Richard Gombrich, *University of Oxford*

Andrew Gordon, *Harvard University*

Edmund Herzig, *University of Oxford*

Sepp Linhart, *University of Vienna*

Rana Mitter, *University of Oxford*

Tariq Rahman, *Quaid-i Azam University, Islamabad*

Anthony Reid, *University of California, Los Angeles*

Richard G. Salomon, *University of Washington*

Oktor Skjaervo, *Harvard University*

Nancy Steinhardt, *University of Pennsylvania*

Roel Sterckx, *University of Cambridge*

Wang Gungwu, *National University Singapore*

Muhammad Q. Zaman, *Princeton University*

Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society (ISSN 1356-1863) is published for the Royal Asiatic Society in January, April, July and October by Cambridge University Press. The Editor of the *Journal* invites the submission of original scholarly articles on the anthropology, archaeology, architecture, art, history, languages, literatures, philosophies and religions of all parts of Asia, together with north Africa and Ethiopia. Books sent for review in the *Journal* cannot be returned. © The Royal Asiatic Society 2023

Subscriptions: *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* (ISSN 1356-1863) Volume 33, Series 1 subscription prices (excluding VAT), valid until 31 December 2023 are per volume, £329 UK and elsewhere (US \$560) for institutions, £69 (US \$110) for individuals ordering direct from the publisher and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. The electronic-only price available to institutional subscribers is £237 (US \$401 in USA, Canada and Mexico). US dollar prices apply to USA, Canada, and Mexico. Prices include delivery by air where appropriate. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller, subscription agent, or to the publishers: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Japanese prices for institutions are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan. Fellows of the The Royal Asiatic Society automatically receive the journal.

Advertising: Apply to Cambridge University Press, UK or North American Branch.

Copying: This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (www.copyright.com). Organizations in the USA who are also registered with CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US copyright law) subject to payment to CCC. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *ISI Tear Sheet Service*, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use permission must be sought from Cambridge or the North American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society and all other Cambridge journals can be found at: journals.cambridge.org.

Journal of the

Royal Asiatic Society

THIRD SERIES · VOLUME 33 · PART 4 · OCTOBER 2023

CONTENTS

OBITUARY

- Derek Davis (3 May 1945–8 July 2023) 801

INTRODUCTION

- Introduction. By Sudipto Mitra, Megan Robb, Eve Tignol and Claudia Liebeskind 803
Tabula Gratulatoria 813
For Francis Robinson. By Masuma Hasan 815
Francis Robinson: personal recollections. By Peter Brown 819
The scholar and administrator: personal reflections on Francis Robinson.
By Norman Gowar 825

ARTICLES

- ‘Cheek by jowl’: education as a bridge between Muslims and the British in colonial
India. By Sumaira Noreen 829
Somnath Mandir in a play of mirrors: heritage, history, and the search for identity
of the new nation (1842–1951). By Tommaso Bobbio 849
Sorry for what? Asking the right questions about the Bangladeshi liberation war
and Pakistan’s military operation in 1971. By Ali Usman Qasmi 871

ERRATUM

- Sorry for what? Asking the right questions about the Bangladeshi liberation war
and Pakistan’s genocidal military operation in 1971 – ERRATUM.
By Ali Usman Qasmi 899

ARTICLES

- Maulana Azad and his memory of the Islamic past: a study of his early writings.
By Muzaffar Alam 901
Region, religion, and locality: revisiting Punjab politics and the Unionist Party,
1923–1947. By Ian Talbot 917
Remembrances of Rashīd: life-histories as lessons in the Dēōband movement.
By Justin Jones 933
A way with words: Nawab Siddiq Hasan Khan (1832–1890) and the unexpected power
of print. By Barbara Metcalf 949

Matteo Ricci as an Islamicate informant. Two moments of connection in the Persian afterlives of a Latin account of China. By Nile Green	971
A munshi discussion on religion, and the <i>Simla Akhbār</i> , circa 1850. By Carl Ernst	991

ERRATUM

A munshi discussion on religion, and the <i>Simla Akhbār</i> , circa 1850 – ERRATUM. By Carl Ernst	1003
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------

ARTICLES

Letter writing as the mingling of souls: remote knowledge exchange among eighteenth-century Naqshbandis. By Daniel Jacobius Morgan	1005
Marshall Hodgson's ideas on cores and modernity in Islam: a critique. By Richard Maxwell Eaton	1029
Religion and the rise of magic in Urdu print culture: the case of <i>Chīn aur Bangāl kā Jādū</i> . By Markus Daechsel	1041
Casteist demons and working-class prophets: subaltern Islam in Bengal, circa 1872–1928. By Layli Uddin	1051
Rationalising ritual: worship in South Asian Islam between the eighteenth and twentieth centuries. By Muhammad Qasim Zaman	1077
A heresy inquisition in the National Assembly and the Islamisation of Pakistan. By A. Azfar Moin	1093
Akbar's religious world: the two reconstructions in Mobad's <i>Dabistān</i> . By Irfan Habib	1107
East Indian misfortunes: the Fraser brothers and the early Raj. By Gail Minault	1113
Education among Indian Muslims. Jamia Millia Islamia's journal <i>Payām-e ta'lim</i> . By Margrit Pernau	1127
Zeb-un-Nissa's 'Between ourselves: a weekly feature for women': learning to feel in early post-independence Pakistan. By Sarah Ansari	1145
Wilful daughters, domestic goddesses, pious Muslims, and rebels: Islam, fashion, commodities, and emotions among upper class women in Pakistan, 1947–1962. By Elisabetta Iob	1155
Spread of bounties: culinary manuals and knowledge in Mughal South Asia. By Neha Vermani	1175