

VOLUME VIII • NUMBER 1



CANADIAN JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY

PUBLISHED BY THE CANADIAN ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLISHING IN PHILOSOPHY

RELATIVE IDENTITY AND NUMBER	1
John Perry	
TIME TRAVEL AND SOME ALLEGED LOGICAL ASYMMETRIES BETWEEN PAST AND FUTURE	15
Larry Dwyer	
PLATO'S RELATIONS, NOT ESSENCES OR ACCIDENTS, AT <i>PHAEDO</i> 102b2-d2	39
Hector-Neri Castañeda	
CASTAÑEDA ON <i>PHAEDO</i> 102b-d	55
David Gallop	
CIRCULARITY AND CONSISTENCY IN DESCARTES	59
Donald F. Dreisbach	
ESCAPING FROM THE CAVE: A REPLY TO DUNN AND SUTER	79
Zeno Vendler	
BERKELEY'S ONTOLOGY AND THE EPISTEMOLOGY OF IDEALISM	89
Robert Muehlmann	
THE TROUBLE WITH IMAGES	113
R. L. Franklin	
ON 'MORAL EXPERTISE'	117
Béla Szabados	
THE CRUCIAL RELATION IN PERSONAL IDENTITY	131
Patricia Kitcher	
FOUR COMMENTS ON RUSSELL'S THEORY OF DESCRIPTIONS	147
Avrum Stroll	
THE REFUTATION OF MATERIALISM	157
Roland Puccetti	
ON BEHALF OF THE MATERIALIST	163
Glenn Pearce	
PEARCE ON BEHALF OF THE MATERIALIST	169
Roland Puccetti	
DOING WITHOUT EVENTS	173
Russell Trenholme	
VOLITIONS AND ACTIONS	187
Michael Martin	
CRITICAL NOTICE OF WOODFIELD: <i>TELETOLOGY AND WRIGHT: TELEOLOGICAL EXPLANATIONS</i>	191
Michael Ruse	
CRITICAL NOTICE OF ROY: <i>HOBBS ET FREUD</i>	205
Alan Montefiore	

MARCH, 1978

La Direction

BRIAN F. CHELLAS, University of Calgary
 JOHN KING-FARLOW, University of Alberta
 KAI NIELSEN, University of Calgary
 CALVIN G. NORMORE, Princeton University
 STEVEN C. PATTEN, University of Lethbridge
 FRANCIS JEFFRY PELLETIER, University of Alberta
 WILLIAM W. ROZEBOOM, University of Alberta
 WESLEY E. COOPER, University of Alberta, *Executive Secretary*
 ALLEN A. CARLSON, University of Alberta, *Managing Editor*

Le **Canadian Journal of Philosophy** est publié par l'Association Canadienne de Publication en Philosophie. Cette revue tend à promouvoir au Canada la publication d'articles philosophiques de qualité supérieure, rédigés en français ou en anglais. Les soumissions s'évaluent à l' 'avengle'; les manuscrits des collègues albertains se jugent ailleurs.

Les manuscrits, en double exemplaire, doivent être adressés à: Executive Secretary, **C.J.P.**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, The University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada, T6G 2E5. Ils devraient, de préférence, être dactylographiés à double interligne, y compris les citations et les notes au bas de la page. Ces notes devraient d'autre part suivre la numérotation consécutive et être groupées sur des feuilles attachées à la fin du manuscrit. On acceptera les photocopies nettes. On retournera les manuscrits à l'expéditeur si ce dernier paie l'affranchissement par chèque, mandat, coupon-réponse, ou timbre canadien.

Les frais de l'abonnement pourront être versés à l'adresse suivante: Managing Editor, **C.J.P.**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2E5. Les tarifs d'abonnement pour un volume comprenant quatre publications s'établissent comme suit:

Institutions	\$19.00 (\$21.00 étranger)
Individus	\$14.00
Etudiants	\$ 9.00

On peut en outre obtenir les numéros séparément au coût de CN \$5.00.

Toute correspondance touchant la publicité doit être envoyée au Managing Editor.

Les articles publiés dans ce **Journal** sont catalogués dans *The Philosophers' Index*, Bowling Green, Ohio, E-U., et le *Répertoire bibliographique de la philosophie*, Louvain, Belgique.

Courrier de la deuxième classe—Enregistrement no. 2690.
 © 1978 Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy

Permission de reproduire automatiquement accordée.

La permission de reproduire des articles de chacun des numéros du **Canadian Journal of Philosophy**, par mode de photocopie, xerox, offset, etc. à des fins d'études et de recherches académiques (mais non en vue d'une réimpression ou de la vente au public) est accordée automatiquement sans qu'il soit besoin d'en faire une demande préalable, compte tenu des conditions financières suivantes:

0-5 copies: aucun frais; 6-20 copies: ½ cent par page du **C.J.P.**,
 copies additionnelles: ¼ cent par page du **C.J.P.**

Les frais doivent être payés à l'adresse suivante: Managing Editor, **C.J.P.**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta T6G 2E9. On doit indiquer l'auteur et le titre de l'article reproduit, ainsi que le nombre de copies. La moitié des recettes supérieures à \$10.00 pour chaque article seront envoyées à l'auteur. Cette permission s'applique rétroactivement à partir du 1 numéro du premier volume du **C.J.P.**

VOLUME VIII • NUMBER 1

CANADIAN JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY

PUBLISHED BY THE CANADIAN ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLISHING IN PHILOSOPHY

RELATIVE IDENTITY AND NUMBER	1
John Perry	
TIME TRAVEL AND SOME ALLEGED LOGICAL ASYMMETRIES BETWEEN PAST AND FUTURE	15
Larry Dwyer	
PLATO'S RELATIONS, NOT ESSENCES OR ACCIDENTS, AT <i>PHAEDO</i> 102b2-d2	39
Hector-Neri Castañeda	
CASTAÑEDA ON <i>PHAEDO</i> 102b-d	55
David Gallop	
CIRCULARITY AND CONSISTENCY IN DESCARTES	59
Donald F. Dreisbach	
ESCAPING FROM THE CAVE: A REPLY TO DUNN AND SUTER	79
Zeno Vendler	
BERKELEY'S ONTOLOGY AND THE EPISTEMOLOGY OF IDEALISM	89
Robert Muehlmann	
THE TROUBLE WITH IMAGES	113
R. L. Franklin	
ON 'MORAL EXPERTISE'	117
Béla Szabados	
THE CRUCIAL RELATION IN PERSONAL IDENTITY	131
Patricia Kitcher	
FOUR COMMENTS ON RUSSELL'S THEORY OF DESCRIPTIONS	147
Avrum Stroll	
THE REFUTATION OF MATERIALISM	157
Roland Puccetti	
ON BEHALF OF THE MATERIALIST	163
Glenn Pearce	
PEARCE ON BEHALF OF THE MATERIALIST	169
Roland Puccetti	
DOING WITHOUT EVENTS	173
Russell Trenholme	
VOLITIONS AND ACTIONS	187
Michael Martin	
CRITICAL NOTICE OF WOODFIELD: <i>TELETOLOGY AND WRIGHT: TELEOLOGICAL EXPLANATIONS</i>	191
Michael Ruse	
CRITICAL NOTICE OF ROY: <i>HOBBS ET FREUD</i>	205
Alan Montefiore	

MARCH, 1978

CANADIAN JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY

Editors

BRIAN F. CHELLAS, University of Calgary
JOHN KING-FARLOW, University of Alberta
KAI NIELSEN, University of Calgary
CALVIN G. NORMORE, Princeton University
STEVEN C. PATTEN, University of Lethbridge
FRANCIS JEFFRY PELLETIER, University of Alberta
WILLIAM W. ROZEBOOM, University of Alberta
WESLEY E. COOPER, University of Alberta, *Executive Secretary*
ALLEN A. CARLSON, University of Alberta, *Managing Editor*

The **Canadian Journal of Philosophy** is published by the *Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy*. Its purpose is the publication in Canada of philosophical work of high quality, in English or in French, and in any field of philosophy. All submissions are given "blind" editorial review; those of department colleagues are externally referred.

Manuscripts should be sent in duplicate to: Executive Secretary, **CJP**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, The University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2E5. It is preferred that manuscripts be typed double-spaced, including quotes and footnotes. Footnotes should be numbered consecutively and assembled on separate pages at the end of the manuscript. *Clear and legible* photocopies are acceptable. Manuscripts will not be returned unless return postage is prepaid by cheque, money-order, reply coupons, or Canadian stamps.

Subscriptions should be sent to: Managing Editor, **CJP**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2E5. The subscription for a volume of four issues is as follows:

Institutions	\$19.00 (\$21.00 non-Canadian)
Individuals	\$14.00
Students	\$ 9.00
Single issues	\$ 5.00 each

Advertising correspondence should be sent to the Managing Editor.

The articles in this **Journal** are indexed in *The Philosopher's Index*, Bowling Green, Ohio, U.S.A., and the *Répertoire bibliographique de la philosophie*, Louvain, Belgium.

Second class mail registration number 2690.

© 1978 Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy.

Automatic Permission to Reproduce.

Permission to reproduce parts of individual numbers of **Canadian Journal of Philosophy** by photocopy, xerox, offset, etc., for scholarly and academic purposes (but not for republication by printing nor for sale to the public) is automatically granted without prior permission being secured at the following fixed rates:

0-5 copies, no charge; 6-20 copies, ½¢ each per page of **C.J.P.** additional copies, ¼¢ each per page of **C.J.P.**

Remuneration is to be paid to the Managing Editor, **C.J.P.**, 4-108 Humanities Centre, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta T6G 2E5, stating title and author of the article and number of copies. Proceeds above \$10.00 from any one article will be shared equally with the author. This announcement applies retroactively to volume 1, number 1.

PHILOSOPHY IN CANADA LA PHILOSOPHIE AU CANADA

une série de monographies, publiée pour
The Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy
par Dalhousie University Press

présente
des études originales de questions importantes:

- 1) Charles B. Daniels (Victoria), **The Evaluation of Ethical Theories** (1975)
-imposes on ethical theories systematic tests invoking possibility, knowledgeability, and ethical truth in ideal worlds.
- 2) George Englebretsen (Bishop's), **Speaking of Persons** (1975)
-draws on Sommers' discussion of categories to defend attributism (excluding disembodiment) as the answer to the mind-body problem.
- 3) Jean Roy (Montréal), **Hobbes et Freud** (1976)
-compare rigoureusement les idées de Hobbes et de Freud sur les motifs qui peuvent conduire les hommes à l'établissement de la société.
- 4) Ronald M. Yoshida (Lethbridge), **Reduction in the Physical Sciences** (1977)
-refutes Kuhn's and Feyerabend's interpretation of the historical examples which according to them show discontinuities in science.
- 5) Maurice Carignan (Ottawa), **Individu et Société chez Kierkegaard** (1977)
-montre comment selon Kierkegaard, pour que la société soit autre que la "foule", écrasant l'individu, les hommes doivent fonder sur la présence de Dieu leur individualité et leurs relations intersubjectives.
- 6) J.F.M. Hunter (Toronto), **Intending** (1978)
-treats expressions of intending as authorizing expectations without referring to phenomena or processes of any kind.

\$3.00 Can. chaque volume.

Commander chez votre libraire ou directement à
CAPP, c/o Department of Philosophy
Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S., Canada B3H 3J5

(Cheques for direct orders should be made payable to the
Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy)

Standing orders for the whole continuing series are invited.