

VOLUME 16
NUMBER 4
DECEMBER 1993

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

**Species and individual differences in communication based
on private states** David Lubinski & Travis Thompson

**Coevolution of neocortical size, group size and language
in humans** R. I. M. Dunbar

Multiple book review of *Origins of the Modern Mind* Merlin Donald

CAMBRIDGE

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: harnad@clarity.princeton.edu or
harnad@pucc.bitnet
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor

Nancy Simon

Chief Copy Editor

Avis Kniffin

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence
Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primatology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price for *institutions* of Volume 16 (1993) is US \$196.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada; £133.00 in the rest of the world; for *individuals* US \$80.00 net (£54.00); for *BBS Associates and for students* (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$46.00 net (£34.00); for *APA, APS, and ASA members* US \$64.00 net (£34.00) with proof of eligibility with order. Subscription price includes postage.

Single parts cost US \$50.00 net (£34.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 16:4 December 1993

Lubinski, D. & Thompson, T. Species and individual differences in communication based on private states

627

Open Peer Commentary

Baer, D. M. Perhaps Sisyphus is the relevant model for animal-language researchers	642
Bamberg, M. Communication and internal states: What is their relationship?	643
Baum, W. M. The status of private events in behavior analysis	644
Branch, M. N. The outside route to the inside story	644
Bringsjord, S. & Bringsjord, E. Animal communication of private states does not illuminate the human case	645
Capaldi, E. J. & Proctor, R. W. Plausible reconstruction? No!	646
Davis, L. H. No report; no feeling	647
Garrett, R. A human model for animal behavior	648
Harcastle, V. G. Communication versus discrimination	649
Hineline, P. N. A promissory note is paid, but has this bought into an illusion?	650
Hocutt, M. Difference without discontinuity	651
Humphreys, L. G. Behaviorism is alive and well	651
Laakso, A. Pigeons and the problem of other minds	652
LaFollette, H. & Shanks, N. Animal modeling in psychopharmacological contexts	653
Laird, J. D. We can reliably report psychological states because they are neither internal nor private	654

Leiber, J. What's <i>biological</i> about the continuity?	654
Mitchell, R. W. Pigeons as communicators and thinkers: <i>Mon oncle d'Amerique deux?</i>	655
Moore, C. The role of convention in the communication of private events	656
Moore, J. Behaviorism, introspection and the mind's I	657
Mortensen, C. Private states and animal communication	658
Pepperberg, I. M. Communicative acts and drug-induced feelings	659
Plous, S. Animal models of human communication	660
Salzinger, K. How do we know when private events control behavior?	660
Stolerman, I. P. Cross-fertilization between research on interpersonal communication and drug discrimination	661
Thompson, N. S. Are some mental states public events?	662
Zentall, T. R. The assessment of intentionality in animals	663
Zuriff, G. E. What's the stimulus?	664

Authors' Response

Lubinski, D. & Thompson, T. Animal models: Nature made us, but was the mold broken?	664
---	-----

Dunbar, R. I. M. Coevolution of neocortical size, group size and language in humans

681

Open Peer Commentary

Andrew, R. J. Behavioural constraints on social communication are not likely to prevent the evolution of large social groups in nonhuman primates	694
Barton, R. A. Independent contrasts analysis of neocortical size and socioecology in primates	694
Brace, C. L. Brain expansion: Thoughts on hunting or reckoning kinship—or both?	695
Byrne, R. W. Do larger brains mean greater intelligence?	696
Corballis, M. C. A gesture in the right direction?	697
Cords, M. Grooming and language as cohesion mechanisms: Choosing the right data	697
Deacon, T. W. Confounded correlations, again	698
Dean, D. Vocal grooming: Man the schmoozer	699
Donald, M. Do grooming and speech really serve homologous functions?	700
Dugatkin, L. A. & Wilson, D. S. Language and levels of selection	701
Falk, D. & Dudek, B. Mosaic evolution of the neocortex	701
Foley, R. A. Ecological and social variance and the evolution of increased neocortical size	702
Freeman, L. C. Group structure and group size among humans and other primates	703
Glezer, I. I. & Kinzey, W. G. Do gossip and lack of grooming make us human?	704
Graber, R. B. Anthropological criticisms of Dunbar's theory of the origin of language	705
Harcourt, A. H. Brains, grouping and language	706
Hauser, M., Gardner, L., Goldberg, T. & Treves, A. The functions of grooming and language: The present need not reflect the past	706

Holloway, R. L. Another primate brain fiction: Brain (cortex) weight and homogeneity	707
Hyland, M. E. Size of human groups during the Paleolithic and the evolutionary significance of increased group size	709
Jacobs, B. & Raleigh, M. J. Sizing up social groups	710
Janson, C. H. Primate group size, brains and communication: A New World perspective	711
Jarvenpa, R. Hunter-gatherer sociospatial organization and group size	712
Jerison, H. J. Number our days: Quantifying social evolution	712
Kincaid, H. Group size, language and evolutionary mechanisms	713
Martins, E. P. Comparative studies, phylogenies and predictions of coevolutionary relationships	714
McCune, L. A developmental look at grooming, grunting and group cohesion	716
Seyfarth, R. M. & Cheney, D. L. Grooming is not the only regulator of primate social interactions	717
Snowdon, C. T. The rest of the story: Grooming, group size and vocal exchanges in neotropical primates	718
Whiten, A. Social complexity: The roles of primates' grooming and people's talking	719
Wind, J. Did primates need more than social grooming and increased group size for acquiring language?	720

Author's Response

Dunbar, R. I. M. On the origins of language: A history of constraints and windows of opportunity	721
--	-----

Donald, M. *Précis of Origins of the modern mind: Three stages in the evolution of culture and cognition*

737

Open Peer Commentary

Arbib, M. A. From cooperative computation to man/machine symbiosis	748	Halverson, J. Mythos and logos	762
Bickerton, D. Putting cognitive carts before linguistic horses	749	Hampson, P. J. From mimetic to mythic culture: Stimulus equivalence effects and prelinguistic cognition	763
Brace, C. L. "Pop science" versus understanding the emergence of the modern mind	750	Jerison, H. J. The evolved mind	763
Bridgeman, B. & Azmitia, M. Mimetic culture and modern sports: A synthesis	751	Katz, L. D. The gradual evolution of enhanced control by plans: A view from below	764
Chase, P. G. Archaeology and the cognitive sciences in the study of human evolution	752	Laakso, A. Language equals mimesis plus speech	765
Clark, A. Symbolic invention: The missing (computational) link?	753	Lutz, R. Lessons from evolution for artificial intelligence?	766
Clarke, T. L. A natural history of the mind: A guide for cognitive science	754	Marshack, A. Correct data base: Wrong model?	767
Costall, A. The place of cognition in human evolution	755	Mitchell, R. W. & Miles, H. L. Apes have mimetic culture	768
Csányi, V. Human evolution: Emergence of the group-self	755	Plotkin, H. C. Hunting memes	768
Cynx, J. & Clark, S. J. Ethological foxes and cognitive hedgehogs	756	Small, J. P. Memory, text and the Greek Revolution	769
Deregowski, J. B. What about pictures?	757	Thompson, E. Language, thought and consciousness in the modern mind	770
Dunbar, R. I. M. The modern mind: Its missing parts?	758	Tomasello, M. It's imitation, not mimesis	771
Feldman, J. A. From mimesis to synthesis	759	Vauclair, J. & Fagot, J. Can a Saussurian ape be endowed with episodic memory only?	772
Fetzer, J. H. Evolution needs a modern theory of the mind	759	Wills, C. Stages versus continuity	773
Gabora, L. M. Cultural transitions occur when mind parasites learn new tricks	760	Wynn, T. Archaeological evidence for mimetic mind and culture	774
Gilhooly, K. J. Working memory and its extensions	761	Zhang, J. External representation: An issue for cognition	774
		Author's Response	
		Donald, M. On the evolution of representational capacities	775

BBS Associates

Please send BBS your electronic mail ('email') address

BBS is relying more and more on electronic mail to communicate with Associates (especially for circulating abstracts of recently accepted target articles so prospective commentators can nominate themselves).

If you have an email address, please inform BBS right away at:

**harnad@clarity.princeton.edu
or
harnad@pucc.bitnet**

(If you do not yet have an email address, we urge you to get one!)