

The Metaphysics of Consciousness

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplement: 67



Edited by Pierfrancesco Basile, Julian Kiverstein & Pauline Phemister

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements

The Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements are published twice a year. Institutional subscribers to the journal *Philosophy* receive the supplements as part of their subscription. The following supplements are available to purchase as books.

Volume 37	1994	<i>Philosophy, Psychology and Psychiatry</i>	(ISBN 0521469023)
38	1995	Philosophy and Technology	(ISBN 0521558166)
39	1995	Karl Popper: Philosophy and Problems	(ISBN 0521558158)
40	1996	Philosophy and Pluralism	(ISBN 0521567505)
41	1996	<i>Verstehen and Human Understanding</i>	(ISBN 0521587425)
42	1997	Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521587417)
43	1998	Current Issues in Philosophy of Mind	(ISBN 0521639271)
44	1999	German Philosophy since Kant	(ISBN 0521667828)
45	1999	Philosophy and Public Affairs	(ISBN 0521667844)
46	2000	Logic, Cause & Action	(ISBN 0521785103)
47	2000	Philosophy, the Good, the True and the Beautiful	(ISBN 0521785111)
48	2001	Philosophy at the New Millennium	(ISBN 0521005086)
49	2001	Naturalism, Evolution and Mind	(ISBN 0521003733)
50	2002	Time, Reality & Experience	(ISBN 0521529670)
51	2002	Logic, Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521529662)
52	2003	Philosophy and the Emotions	(ISBN 0521537347)
53	2003	Minds and Persons	(ISBN 0521537339)
54	2004	Modern Moral Philosophy	(ISBN 0521603269)
55	2004	Agency and Action	(ISBN 0521603560)
56	2005	Philosophy, Biology and Life	(ISBN 0521678455)
57	2005	The Philosophy of Need	(ISBN 0521678447)
58	2006	Political Philosophy	(ISBN 0521695597)
59	2006	Preferences and Well-Being	(ISBN 0521695589)
60	2007	Narrative and Understanding Persons	(ISBN 9780521714099)
61	2007	Philosophy of Science	(ISBN 9780521718967)
62	2008	Being: Developments in Contemporary Metaphysics	(ISBN 9780521735445)
63	2008	Kant and Philosophy of Science Today	(ISBN 9780521748513)
64	2009	Epistemology	(ISBN 9780521138581)
65	2009	Conceptions of Philosophy	(ISBN 9780521138574)
66	2010	Philosophy as Therapeia	(ISBN 9780521165150)

From Volume 13 onwards the Series is published by Cambridge University Press and some earlier titles are also available.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see www.fsc.org for information.

The Metaphysics of Consciousness

ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY SUPPLEMENT: 67

EDITED BY

Pierfrancesco Basile
Julian Kiverstein
Pauline Phemister

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, CB2 1RP,
United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, United Kingdom
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013–2473, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy and the contributors 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge
Typeset by Techset Composition Ltd, Salisbury, UK

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 9780521173919
ISSN 1358-2461

Contents

Notes on Editors and Contributors	v
Preface	1
Sprigge's Ontology of Consciousness	5
LEEMON MCHENRY	
How to Become Unconscious	21
STEPHEN R. L. CLARK	
The Road to Substance Dualism	45
GEOFFREY MADELL	
Fundamental Singleness: How to Turn the 2nd Paralogism into a Valid Argument	61
GALEN STRAWSON	
It Must be True – But How Can it Be? Some Remarks on Panpsychism and Mental Composition	93
PIERFRANCESCO BASILE	
Phenomenal Holism	113
BARRY DANTON	
Is There a Metaphysics of Consciousness Without a Phenomenology of Consciousness? Some Thoughts Derived from Husserl's Philosophical Phenomenology	141
EDUARD MARBACH	
Making Sense of Phenomenal Unity: An Intentionalist Account of Temporal Experience	155
JULIAN KIVERSTEIN	
Time in Consciousness, Consciousness in Time	183
DAVID COCKBURN	
Quality, Thought and Consciousness	203
HOWARD ROBINSON	
Concessionary Dualism and Physicalism	217
WILLIAM SEAGER	
The Representational vs. the Relational View of Visual Experience	239
BRIAN P. MCLAUGHLIN	
Consciousness: Don't Give Up on the Brain	263
KENNETH AIZAWA	
Index of Names	285
	iii

Notes on Editors and Contributors

KENNETH AIZAWA

Kenneth Aizawa is the Charles T. Beard Professor of Philosophy at Centenary College of Louisiana. He is the author of *The Systematicity Arguments* (2003) and, with Fred Adams, *The Bounds of Cognition* (2008).

PIERFRANCESCO BASILE

Pierfrancesco Basile teaches Philosophy at the University of Bern, Switzerland. His publications include two books, *Experience and Relations: An Examination of F. H. Bradley's Conception of Reality* (1999) and *Leibniz, Whitehead and the Metaphysics of Causation* (2009), as well as several essays on issues in metaphysics, process thought, British idealism and early analytic philosophy.

STEPHEN R. L. CLARK

Stephen R. L. Clark was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Liverpool. His books include *The Nature of the Beast* (1982), *Animals and their Moral Standing* (1997), *Biology and Christian Ethics* (2006), *G. K. Chesterton: Thinking Backwards, Looking Forwards* (2006) and *Understanding Faith: Religious Belief and Its Place in Society* (2009).

DAVID COCKBURN

David Cockburn is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Wales, Lampeter. His publications include *Other Human Beings* (1990), *Other Times: Philosophical Perspectives on Past, Present and Future* (1997), and *An Introduction to the Philosophy of Mind* (2001). He edited the Royal Institute of Philosophy volume on *Human Beings* (1991), and has published a wide range of papers on themes in philosophy of mind, ethics, Wittgenstein, philosophy of religion, and philosophy of time.

BARRY DANTON

Barry Dainton is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Liverpool. His publications include *Stream of Consciousness* (2000, 2nd edition 2006), *Time and Space* (2001, 2nd edition 2010), and *The Phenomenal Self* (2008).

Notes on Editors and Contributors

JULIAN KIVERSTEIN

Julian Kiverstein is a Teaching Fellow in Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. The author of a number of papers on consciousness, temporality and the self, he is also editing *Heidegger and Cognitive Science* (2010, with Michael Wheeler) and *Decomposing the Will* (2010, with Tillmann Vierkant and Andy Clark).

GEOFFREY MADELL

Geoffrey Madell was Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at Edinburgh University. He is the author of *The Identity of the Self* (1981), *Mind and Materialism* (1988) and *Philosophy, Music and Emotion* (2002). He has published numerous articles on the philosophy of mind, particularly on the issues of personal identity and the mind-body problem.

EDUARD MARBACH

Eduard Marbach was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Bern, Switzerland. His publications include *Das Problem des Ich in der Phänomenologie Husserls* (1974), *Mental Representation and Consciousness: Towards a Phenomenological Theory of Representation and Reference* (1993), and *An Introduction to Husserlian Phenomenology* (1993, co-authored with Rudolf Bernet and Iso Kern). He has edited Husserl's *Phantasie, Bildbewusstsein, Erinnerung. Zur Phänomenologie der anschaulichen Vergegenwärtigungen* (1980, *Husserliana*, Vol. 23) and is the author of several papers on phenomenology and the philosophy of mind.

LEEMON MCHENRY

Leemon McHenry teaches Philosophy at California State University, Northridge. His books include *Whitehead and Bradley: A Comparative Analysis* (1992), *Consciousness, Reality and Value: Essays in Honour of T. L. S. Sprigge* (2007, co-edited with Pierfrancesco Basile), and *British Philosophers, 1800–2000* (2002, co-edited with Philip Dematteis and Peter Fosl). He is the author of numerous articles and book chapters on topics in metaphysics, philosophy of science and medical ethics.

BRIAN P. McLAUGHLIN

Brian P. McLaughlin is Professor II in the Philosophy Department at Rutgers University and a member of the Executive Council of the Rutgers University Cognitive

Notes on Editors and Contributors

Science Center. He has published numerous articles in a wide range of fields in philosophy. Recently, he was a co-editor of *Contemporary Debates in the Philosophy of Mind* (2007) and a co-editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Mind* (2009).

PAULINE PHEMISTER

Pauline Phemister is Reader in Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. Her publications include *The Rationalists: Descartes, Spinoza and Leibniz* (2006) and *Leibniz and the Natural World: Activity, Passivity and Corporeal Substances in the Philosophy of Leibniz* (2005). She has published widely on topics in early modern philosophy, especially in the areas of metaphysics, ethics, and mind-body relations.

HOWARD ROBINSON

Howard Robinson is University Professor at Central European University, Budapest. He is author of *Matter and Sense* (1982, re-issued in paperback 2009) and *Perception* (1994), editor of the World's Classics edition of Berkeley's '*Principles*' and '*Three Dialogues*', and of various recent articles and book chapters on the philosophy of perception, the mind-body problem and idealism.

WILLIAM SEAGER

William Seager is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Toronto. He has published many articles in the philosophy of mind and two books on consciousness, *Metaphysics of Consciousness* (1991) and *Theories of Consciousness* (1999).

GALEN STRAWSON

Galen Strawson teaches in the Philosophy Department at the University of Reading and is a regular visitor at the Philosophy Program at the City University of New York Graduate Center. He is the author of *Selves: An Essay in Revisionary Metaphysics* (2009), *Real Materialism and Other Essays* (2008), *Mental Reality* (1994, new edition 2009), *The Secret Connexion: Realism, Causation and David Hume* (1989), and *Freedom and Belief* (1986, new edition 2010).