

VOLUME 20

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2011

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,
<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantton/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to TKushner@aol.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 20 (2011) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$333/£195; online only: \$278/£166; print only: \$319/£185. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$88/£51. Students and retirees: \$82/£41. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$70/£35. Student and retiree: \$82/£41. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com. ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 20, Number 1, January 2011

CONTENTS

Contributors	1
<i>Special Section: Open Forum</i>	
From the Editors: Readers Talk Back	5
Taking the "Human" Out of Human Rights JOHN HARRIS	9
Considerable Life Extension and Three Views on the Meaning of Life MATTI HÄYRY	21
Ethical and Legal Issues in Enhancement Research on Human Subjects MAXWELL J. MEHLMAN, JESSICA W. BERG, ERIC T. JUENST, AND ERIC KODISH	30
Confrontations in "Genethics": Rationalities, Challenges, and Methodological Responses JOHN COGGON	46
The Double Effect Effect CHARLES FOSTER, JONATHAN HERRING, KAREN MELHAM, AND TONY HOPE	56
Ideology and Politicization in Public Bioethics SUMMER MCGEE	73
Does Informed Consent Have An Expiry Date? A Critical Reappraisal of Informed Consent as a Process GERT HELGESSON AND STEFAN ERIKSSON	85
Justice and the Fetus: Rawls, Children, and Abortion DAVID M. SHAW	93
The Moral Basis for Healthcare Reform in the United States GRIFFIN TROTTER	102
The Rapid Ethical Decisionmaking Model: Critical Medical Interventions in Resource-Poor Environments KENNETH V. ISERSON	108
MRI Research Proposals Involving Child Subjects: Concerns Hindering Research Ethics Boards from Approving Them and a Checklist to Help Evaluate Them J. DEBORAH SHILOFF, BRYAN MAGWOOD, AND KRISZTINA L. MALISZA	115

Contents continued

Contents continued

Conscientious Refusals by Hospitals and Emergency
Contraception
MARK R. WICCLAIR 130

Departments and Columns

Bioethics Education
A Favorites Reading List from the Cambridge Consortium for
Bioethics Education 139

Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work
The Case of the Criminal Liver
RUCHIKA MISHRA 143

Commentary: Rights, Professional Obligations, and Moral
Disapproval
MARK R. WICCLAIR 144

Commentary: Problems of Patient and Professional
Responsibilities
SHEELAGH MCGUINNESS 147

What Actually Happened 149

Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature
BARRY MORENZ 150

Announcement
An Invitation from CQ to Join UNESCO in Expanding
Bioethics 154