

Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Perspectives on Science and Practice

Including focal articles with commentaries:

Getting Rid of Performance Ratings: Genius or Folly?—A Debate

**Seymour Adler, Michael Campion, Alan Colquitt, Amy Grubb,
Kevin Murphy, Rob Ollander-Krane, and Elaine D. Pulakos**

How Much Do We Really Know About Employee Resilience?

**Thomas W. Britt, Winny Shen, Robert R. Sinclair,
Matthew R. Grossman, and David M. Klieger**



SOCIETY for
INDUSTRIAL and
ORGANIZATIONAL
PSYCHOLOGY

SCIENCE FOR A SMARTER WORKPLACE



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Perspectives on Science and Practice

The novel format of the journal focuses on an interactive exchanges on topics of importance to science and practice in the field of industrial and organizational psychology. The journal takes a focal article–peer commentary format.

A focal article is a position paper on an important issue for the field (or potentially a pair of papers taking opposite sides in a debate). Such a focal article might summarize evidence on an issue and take a position as to implications for science, practice, or public policy. The paper might focus on a basic science issue, an applied science issue, a practice issue, or a public policy issue; many would be a blend. The focal article is then followed by a series of peer commentaries. These could challenge or critique the original article, expand on issues not addressed in the focal article, or draw out implications not developed in the focal article. The goal is to include commentaries from various perspectives, including science, practice, and international perspectives.

EDITOR:

John Scott, APTMetrics, Inc.

PUBLICATIONS MANAGER:

Jenny Baker, Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

EDITORIAL BOARD:

Neil R. Anderson, Brunel University
Winfred Arthur, Texas A & M University
Tayla N. Bauer, Portland State University
Michael J. Burke, Tulane University
Stuart C. Carr, Massey University
Allan H. Church, PepsiCo, Inc.
José M. Cortina, George Mason University
Satoris S. Culbertson, Kansas State University
Fritz Drasgow, University of Illinois at
Urbana-Champaign
Mark Griffin, University of Western Australia
Theodore Hayes, US Office of Personnel Management
Beryl L. Hesketh, University of Western Sydney
George P. Hollenbeck, Hollenbeck Associates
Leaetta M. Hough, Dunnette Group, Ltd.
Jeff W. Johnson, Personnel Decisions Research
Institute
Tracy Kantrowitz, SHL
Jerard F. Kehoe, Selection and Assessment Counselling
Richard J. Klimoski, George Mason University

Allen I. Kraut, Baruch College, CUNY
Hennie J. Kriek, Top Talent Solutions and University
of South Africa
Morgan W. McCall, University of Southern California
Jeffrey J. McHenry, Rainier Leadership Solutions
S. Morton McPhail, Retired Consultant, USA
Kenneth Pearlman, Creative Personnel Management
Consulting
Hannah R. Rothstein, Baruch College, CUNY
Ann Marie Ryan, Michigan State University
Lise M. Saari, New York University
Eduardo Salas, University of Central Florida
John C. Scott, APT Inc.
Robert F. Silzer, Baruch College, CUNY
Stephen D. Steinhaus, HRAlignment
William J. Strickland, Human Resources
Organization
Nancy T. Tippins, CEB Valtera
Sara P. Weiner, IBM
Alan Witt, University of Houston

A journal of the Society for Industrial and Organizational Psychology

SIOP is the premier membership organization for those practicing and teaching I-O psychology. While an independent organization with its own governance, SIOP is also a division within the American Psychological Association and an organizational affiliate of the Association for Psychological Science.

SIOP membership includes online access to all issues of the journal as well as an optional print copy. Individuals can become members at <http://www.siop.org/Dues/payment.aspx>. Membership rates are \$100 for professional members (Fellows, Members, Associates, International Affiliates) and \$50 for Student Affiliates & Retired statuses.

Industrial and Organizational Psychology

Perspectives on Science and Practice

VOLUME 9, ISSUE 2, JUNE 2016

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

- From the Editor
JOHN C. SCOTT 217

FOCAL ARTICLE

- Getting Rid of Performance Ratings: Genius or Folly? A Debate
SEYMOUR ADLER, MICHAEL CAMPION, ALAN COLQUITT, AMY GRUBB,
KEVIN MURPHY, ROB OLLANDER-KRANE, AND ELAINE D. PULAKOS 219

COMMENTARIES

- Aligning Research and the Current Practice of Performance Management
GERALD E. LEDFORD JR., GEORGE BENSON, AND EDWARD E. LAWLER III 253
- Feedback Dynamics Are Critical to Improving Performance Management Systems
NITYA CHAWLA, ALLISON S. GABRIEL, JASON J. DAHLING, AND KAJAL PATEL 260
- How Will Getting Rid of Performance Ratings Affect Managers?
CHRISTOPHER J. LAKE AND ALEXANDRA LUONG 266
- Efficiency Ratings and Performance Appraisals in the United States Federal
Government
THOMAS A. STETZ AND TODD L. CHMIELEWSKI 270
- Why Performance Appraisal Does Not Lead to Performance Improvement: Excellent
Performance as a Function of Uniqueness Instead of Uniformity
MARIANNE VAN WOERKOM AND MAAIKE DE BRUIJN 275
- Genius or Folly? It Depends on Whether Performance Ratings Survive the
“Psychological Immune System”
LUKAS NEVILLE AND NICOLAS ROULIN 281
- Working With Social Comparisons in the Appraisal and Management of Performance
R. BLAKE JELLEY 288
- Rating Performance May Be Difficult, but It Is Also Necessary
STEVEN T. HUNT 296

Use the Best; Leave the Rest: The Productivity Measurement and Enhancement System (ProMES) for Performance Ratings DANIEL SCHMERLING AND ANNE SCADUTO	305
Ratee Reactions Drive Performance Appraisal Success (and Failure) LAUREN E. WALLACE, SAMANTHA A. STELMAN, AND DOREY S. CHAFFEE	310
Time To Change the Bathwater: Correcting Misconceptions About Performance Ratings C. ALLEN GORMAN, CHRISTOPHER J. L. CUNNINGHAM, SHAWN M. BERGMAN, AND JOHN P. MERIAC	314
Beyond Performance Ratings: The Long Road to Effective Performance Management ROBERT L. CARDY, AND DEEKSHA MUNJAL	322
Construct Validity Evidence for Multisource Performance Ratings: Is Interrater Reliability Enough? JISOO OCK	329
The Future of Performance Ratings: Collected Thoughts From Six Emerging Scholars ANDREW M. BLECKMAN, SARAH N. GUARINO, WESLEY RUSSELL, EILEEN C. TOOMEY, PAUL M. WERTH, VICTORIA L. WHITAKER, AND CORT W. RUDOLPH	334
Performance Management: Embracing Complexity, Evading Reductionism, and Moving to Outcome-Based Approaches SHONNA D. WATERS, WAYNE A. BAUGHMAN, AND DAVID W. DORSEY	338
Eliminating a Quantitative Measure of Performance Means Our Science Is Starting From Square One GABRIELA BURLACU	342
Other Important Questions: When, How, and Why Do Cultural Values Influence Performance Management? INCHUL CHO AND STEPHANIE C. PAYNE	343
Disappointing Interventions and Weak Criteria: Carving Out a Solution Is Still Possible AHARON TZINER AND SYLVIA G. ROCH	350
Of Babies and Bathwater: Don't Throw the Measure Out With the Application DAVID J. WOEHR AND SYLVIA G. ROCH	357
The Relationship Between the Number of Raters and the Validity of Performance Ratings MATT C. HOWARD	361
Getting Rid of Performance Ratings MELVIN SORCHER	367
Performance Appraisal in a Constantly Changing Work World EDNA RABENU AND AHARON TZINER	370

FOCAL ARTICLE

- How Much Do We Really Know About Employee Resilience?
THOMAS W. BRITT, WINNY SHEN, ROBERT R. SINCLAIR, MATTHEW R. GROSSMAN,
AND DAVID M. KLIEGER 378

COMMENTARIES

- The Untapped Potential in Employee Resilience: Specific Recommendations for
Research and Practice
DANIELLE D. KING 405
- Emotion Regulation and Resilience: Overlooked Connections
SOPHIE A. KAY 411
- The Role of Self-Regulation in Workplace Resiliency
MITCHELL G. ROTHSTEIN, MATTHEW J. W. MCLARNON, AND GILLIAN KING 416
- Resilience: Distinct Construct or Conglomerate of Existing Traits?
GERARD J. FOGARTY AND HARSHA N. PERERA 422
- (Mis)Steps for Attracting High Resilience Workers
KEVIN J. ESCHLEMAN AND CHRIS W. WRIGHT 429
- Bouncing Back to the Future: A Look at the Road Ahead for the Assessment of
Resilience
P. D. HARMS AND DUSTIN WOOD 436
- How Much Do We Really Know About Employee Resilience? More, If We Include the
Sport Psychology Resilience Research
ELIZABETH L. SHOENFELT 442
- Exploring Workplace Resilience Through a Personality Strength Lens
JENNIFER P. GREEN, DAVID M. WALLACE, AND AMBER K. HARGROVE 447
- Advancing Employee Resilience Research: Additional Thoughts
NATALIE E. WOLFSON AND CASEY MULQUEEN 452
- Resilient Employees in Resilient Organizations: Flourishing Beyond Adversity
JOANA R. C. KUNTZ, KATHARINA NÄSWALL, SANNA MALINEN 456
- Integrating Multiple Perspectives Into the Study of Resilience
SAMANTHA C. JANUARY 462
- Extending the Conversation: Employee Resilience at the Team Level
DEANNA M. KENNEDY, LAUREN BLACKWELL LANDON, AND M. TRAVIS MAYNARD 466
- Resilience Practices
PAUL R. YOST 475
- Employee Resilience: A Faceted Analytical Approach
EDNA RABENU AND AHARON TZINER 480

Opponent Process Theory Can Help Explain Some Effects of Resilience NATHAN A. BOWLING AND TERRY A. BEEHR	486
Looking Backward, Moving Forward: Exploring Theoretical Foundations for Understanding Employee Resilience KATE M. CONLEY, MALISSA A. CLARK, OLIVIA H. VANDE GRIEK, AND JAY A. MANCINI	491
Elaborating on the Conceptual Underpinnings of Resilience ARMANDO X. ESTRADA, JAMIE B. SEVERT, MILIANI JIMÉNEZ-RODRÍGUEZ	497
Profiles as a Way of Learning More About Resilience THOMAS E. BECKER AND DIANE L. FERRY	503
A Nonlinear Paradigm for Resilience, Workload, Performance, and Clinical Phenomena STEPHEN J. GUASTELLO	509
Taking Time Seriously as a Component of Employee Resilience DAVID K. PALMER	517